



**SATHYABAMA**

INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY  
(DEEMED TO BE UNIVERSITY)

Accredited "A" Grade by NAAC | 12B Status by UGC | Approved by AICTE

[www.sathyabama.ac.in](http://www.sathyabama.ac.in)

**SCHOOL OF SCIENCE AND HUMANITIES**

**DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH**

**UNIT – I INDIAN LITERATURE IN TRANSLATION  
(SHS5010)**

## 1.1 TRANSLATION

Translation is the comprehension of the meaning of a text and the subsequent production of an equivalent text, that communicates the same message in another language. The text that is translated is called the *source text*, and the language that it is translated into is called the *target language*. The product is sometimes called *the target text*. Translation, when practiced by relatively bilingual individuals but especially when by persons with limited proficiency in one or both languages, involves a risk of spilling-over of idioms and usages from the source language into the target language. On the other hand, inter-linguistic spillages have also served the useful purpose of importing calques and loan words from a source language into a target language that had previously lacked a concept or a convenient expression for the concept. Translators and interpreters have thus played an important role in the evolution of languages and cultures.

### 1.1.1 ETYMOLOGY

Etymologically, translation is a "carrying across" or "bringing across". The Latin translation derives from the perfect passive participle, *translatum*, of *transfere* ("I transfer"—from *Trans*, "across" + *fero*, "I carry" or "I bring"). The modern Romance, Germanic and Slavic European languages have generally formed their own equivalent terms for this concept after the Latin model—after *transfere* or after the kindred *traduco* ("I bring across" or "I lead across").

**Additionally, the Ancient Greek term for "translation", μέθεξις ( *metaphrasis*, "a speaking across"), has supplied English with *metaphrase* (a "literal translation", or "word-for-word" translation)—as contrasted with *paraphrase* ("a saying in other words", from the Greek παράθεξις, *paraphrasis*).**

*Metaphrase* corresponds, in one of the more recent terminologies, to "formal equivalence"; and *paraphrase*, to "dynamic equivalence." A widely recognized icon for the practice and historic role of translation is the Rosetta Stone, which in the United States is incorporated into the coat of arms of the Defense Language Institute.

## **1.2 TYPES OF TRANSLATION**

### **Administrative translation**

The translation of administrative texts. Although administrative has a very broad meaning, in terms of translation it refers to common texts used within businesses and organizations that are used in day to day management. It can also be stretched to cover texts with similar functions in government.

### **Commercial translation**

Commercial translation or business translation covers any sort of document used in the business world such as correspondence, company accounts, tender documents, reports, etc. Commercial translations require specialist translators with knowledge of terminology used in the business world.

### **Computer translation**

Not to be confused with CAT, computer assisted translations, which refer to translations carried out by software. Computer translation is the translation of anything to do with computers such as software, manuals, help files, etc.

### **Economic translation**

Similar to commercial or business translation, economic translation is simply a more specific term used for the translation of documents relating to the field of economics. Such texts are usually a lot more academic in nature.

### **Financial translation**

Financial translation is the translation of texts of a financial nature. Anything from banking to asset management to stocks and bonds could be covered.

### **General translation**

A general translation is the simplest of translations. A general text means that the language used is not high level and to a certain extent could be in layman's terms. There is no specific or technical terminology used. Most translations carried out fall under this category.

### **Legal translation**

Legal translations are one of the trickiest translations known. At its simplest level it means the translation of legal documents such as statutes, contracts and treaties. A legal translation will always need specialist attention. This is because law is culture-dependent and requires a translator with an excellent understanding of both the source and target cultures. Most translation

agencies would only ever use professional legal to undertake such work. This is because there is no real margin for error; the mistranslation of a passage in a contract could, for example, have disastrous consequences.

When translating a text within the field of law, the translator should keep the following in mind. The legal system of the source text is structured in a way that suits that culture and this is reflected in the legal language; similarly, the target text is to be read by someone who is familiar with another legal system and its language.

### **Literary translation**

A literary translation is the translation of literature such as novels, poems, plays and poems. The translation of literary works is considered by many one of the highest forms of translation as it involves so much more than simply translating text. A literary translator must be capable of also translating feelings, cultural nuances, humour and other subtle elements of a piece of work.

Some go as far as to say that literary translations are not really possible. In 1959 the Russian-born linguist Roman Jakobson went as far as to declare that "poetry by definition [was] untranslatable". In 1974 the American poet James Merrill wrote a poem, "Lost in Translation," which in part explores this subject.

### **Medical translation**

A medical translation will cover anything from the medical field from the packaging of medicine to manuals for medical equipments to medical books. Like legal translation, medical translation is specialization where a mistranslation can have grave consequences.

### **Technical translation**

A technical translation has a broad meaning. It usually refers to certain fields such as IT or manufacturing and deals with texts such as manuals and instructions. Technical translations are usually more expensive than general translations as they contain a high amount of terminology that only a specialist translator could deal with.

### **Literal translation**

Literal translation, also known as direct translation in everyday usage has the meaning of the rendering of text from one language to another "word-for-word" (Latin: "verbum pro verbo") rather than conveying the sense of the original. However in translation studies literal translation has the meaning of technical translation of scientific, technical, technological or legal texts.

Other term for literal translation in translation theory is metaphrase and the phrasal("sense" translation) is paraphrase. ( A literal English translation of the German word " Kindergarten" would be "children garden," but in English the expression refers to the school year between pre-school and first grade. Literal translations in which individual components within words or compounds are translated to create new lexical items in the target language (a process also known as “loan translation”) are called calques ,e.g., “beer garden” from German “Biergarten.” Literal translation of the Italian sentence, "So che questo non va bene" ("I know that this is not good"), produces "Know(I) that this not go(it)well," which has English words and Italian grammar)

### **Homophonic translation**

Homophonic translation renders a text in one language into a near-homophonic text in another language, usually with no attempt to preserve the original meaning of the text. In one homophonic translation, for example, English "sat on a wall"[sætənəwəl] **is rendered as** French"s'étonne aux Halles" [setonoal] 'is surprised at the Market'. More generally, homophonic transformation renders a text into a near-homophonic text in the same or another language: e.g. "what a big nose!" becomes "water bag noise".(Frayer Jerker is a homophonic translation of the French Frère Jacques(1956).

Other examples of homophonic translation include some works by Oulipo (1960–), Luisvan Rooten's English-French Mots D'Heures: Gousses, Rames (1967), Louis Zukofsky's Latin-English Catullus Fragmenta (1969), Ormonde de Kay's English-French N'Heures Souris Rames (1980), and David Melnick's Ancient Greek-English Men in Aida(1983). Examples of homophonic transformation include Howard L. Chace's Ladle Rat Rotten Hut, published in book form in 1956. Other names proposed for this genre include "allographic translation" "transphonation", or (in French)"traducson", but none of these is widely used.

### 1.3 PRINCIPLES OF TRANSLATION

It is now pretty generally agreed, that translating the writings of the ancients is, if not the sole, at least the plainest, the shortest, and the surest means of becoming well acquainted with them and their language. It is also agreed, that a translation ought exactly to express the original; that it should neither be too free nor too servile; that it should neither deviate into long circumlocutions, which weaken the ideas, nor adhere too strictly to the letter, which debases the sentiment. Good theory is based on information gained from practice. Good practice is based on carefully worked-out theory. The two are interdependent. (Larson 1991, p. 1) The ideal translation will be accurate as to meaning and natural as to the receptor language forms used. An intended audience who is unfamiliar with the source text will readily understand it. The success of a translation is measured by how closely it measures up to these ideals. The ideal translation should be

- Accurate: reproducing as exactly as possible the meaning of the source text.
- Natural: using natural forms of the receptor language in a way that is appropriate to the kind of text being translated.
- Communicative: expressing all aspects of the meaning in a way that is readily understandable to the intended audience. Translation is a process based on the theory that it is possible to abstract the meaning of a text from its forms and reproduce that meaning with the very different forms of a second language. Translation, then, consists of studying the lexicon, grammatical structure, communication situation, and cultural context of the source language text, analyzing it in order to determine its meaning, and then reconstructing this same meaning using the lexicon and grammatical structure which are appropriate in the receptor language and its cultural context. (Larson 1998, p. 3) In practice, there is considerable variation in the types of translations produced by translators. Some translators work only in two languages and are competent in both. Others work from their first language to their second language, and still others from their second language to their first language. Depending on these matters of language proficiency, the procedures used will vary from project to project. In most projects in which SIL is involved, a translation team carries on the project. Team roles are worked out according to the individual skills of team members. There is also some variation depending on the purpose of a given translation and the type of translation that will be accepted by the intended audiences.

## 1.4 HISTORY OF TRANSLATION THEORY AND THEORISTS

### 1.4.1 BRIEF HISTORY OF TRANSLATION:

The art of translation is as old as written literature. Developments since the Industrial Revolution have influenced the practice of translation, nurturing schools, professional associations, and standards. Later, the Internet has helped expand the market for translation and has facilitated product localization. Currently, some 75% of professional translators work with technical texts. Since the 1940s, attempts have been made to computerize the translation of natural-language texts (machine translation) or to use computers as an aid to translation (computer-assisted translation).

Translation:[Lat.,=carrying across], the rendering of a text into another language. Applied to literature, the term connotes the art of recomposing a work in another language without losing its original flavor, or of finding an analogous substitute, for example, Scott Moncrieff's "Remembrance of Things Past for".

Proust's "*À la recherche du temps perdu*", which, translated literally, means "Looking for Lost Time." Translations of the most ancient texts extant into modern languages are called decipherments. Two well-known examples are the decoding of the Egyptian hieroglyphs on the Rosetta Stone by Jean François Champollion and the decoding of the Persian cuneiform inscriptions on the rock of Behistun by Henry Rawlinson. Translating sacred texts has always been the chief means by which a culture transmits its values to posterity. Important translations of the Bible began with the Vulgate (Hebrew and Greek into Latin) of St. Jerome in the 4th century A.D. English translations of the Bible include that of John Wyclif in the 14th cent. (from Latin), William Tyndale's in the 16th cent. (from Hebrew and Greek), and the great Authorized Version of 1611, the King James Version, which has been called the most influential work of translation in any language. The Renaissance was a golden age of translations, especially into English. Renewed interest in the Latin classics created a demand for renderings of Ovid's *Metamorphoses* (tr. by Arthur Golding, 1565-67), Vergil's *Aeneid* (tr. by Gavin Douglas, c.1515; Henry Howard, earl of Surrey, c.1540; and Richard Stanyhurst, 1582), and Plutarch's *Lives* (tr. by Sir Thomas North, 1579). The flavor of these renderings is indicated in the opening lines of Stanyhurst's *Aeneid*: "Now manhood and garbroyles [battles] I chaunt, and martial horror." In addition there were translations of important contemporary works into English: Castiglione's *Courtier* (tr. by Sir Thomas Hoby, 1561), Montaigne's *Essais* (tr. by John Florio, 1603), and

Cervantes's *Don Quixote* (tr. by John Shelton, 1612). Notable translations of the 19th and 20th cent. include Baudelaire's translations of the works of Edgar Allan Poe, Scott Moncrieff's translation of Proust, and Eustache Morel's translation of James Joyce. American authors whose works have been translated into several European languages include Mark Twain, Jack London, Ernest Hemingway, John Dos Passos, Pearl Buck, Margaret Mitchell (*Gone with the Wind*), and Upton Sinclair, who set a record with translations into 47 languages.

### **History of Western theory**

Discussions of the theory and practice of translation reach back into antiquity and show remarkable continuities. The distinction that had been drawn by the ancient Greeks between *metaphrase* ("literal" translation) and *paraphrase* was adopted by the English poet and translator John Dryden (1631–1700), who represented translation as the judicious blending of these two modes of phrasing when selecting, in the target language, "counterparts", or equivalents, for the expressions used in the source language: When [words] appear... literally graceful, it were an injury to the author that they should be changed. But since... what is beautiful in one[language] is often barbarous, nay sometimes nonsense, in another, it would be unreasonable to limit a translator to the narrow compass of his author's words: 'tis enough if he choose out some expression which does not vitiate the sense.

Dryden cautioned, however, against the license of "imitation", i.e. of adapted translation: "When a painter copies from the life... he has no privilege to alter features and lineaments..." This general formulation of the central concept of translation —equivalence— is probably as adequate as any that has been proposed ever since Cicero and Horace, in first-century-BCE Rome, famously and literally cautioned against translating "word for word" (*verbum pro verbo*).

Despite occasional theoretical diversities, the actual practice of translators has hardly changed since antiquity. Except for some extreme metaphrasers in the early Christian period and the Middle Ages, and adapters in various periods (especially pre-Classical Rome, and the 18th century), translators have generally shown prudent flexibility in seeking equivalents— "literal" where possible, paraphrastic where necessary— for the original meaning and other crucial "values" (e.g., style, verse form, concordance with musical accompaniment or, in films, with speech articulatory movements) as determined from context.



In general, translators have sought to preserve the context itself by reproducing the original order of sememes, and hence word order—when necessary, reinterpreting the actual grammatical structure. The grammatical differences between "fixed-word-order" languages (e.g., English, French, German) and "free-word-order" languages (e.g., Greek, Latin, Polish, Russian) have been no impediment in this regard.

When a target language has lacked terms that are found in a source language, translators have borrowed them, thereby enriching the target language. Thanks in great measure to the exchange of calques and loanwords between languages, and to their importation from other languages, there are few concepts that are "untranslatable" among the modern European languages. Generally, the greater the contact and exchange that has existed between two languages, or between both and a third one, the greater is the ratio of metaphrase to paraphrase that may be used in translating between them. However, due to shifts in "ecological niches" of words, a common etymology is sometimes misleading as a guide to current meaning in one or the other language. The English *actual*, for example, should not be confused with the cognate French *actuel* (meaning "present", "current"), the Polish *aktualny* ("present", "current") or the Russian

**а а н ("urgent, topical"). The translator's role as a bridge for "carrying across" values**

between cultures has been discussed at least since Terence, Roman adapter of Greek comedies, in the second century BCE. The translator's role is, however, by no means a passive and mechanical one, and so has also been compared to that of an artist. The main ground seems to be the concept of parallel creation found in critics as early as Cicero. Dryden observed that "Translation is a type of drawing after life..." Comparison of the translator with a musician or actor goes back at least to Samuel Johnson's remark about Alexander Pope playing Homer on a flageolet, while Homer himself used a bassoon.

If translation be an art, it is no easy one. In the 13th century, Roger Bacon wrote that if a translation is to be true, the translator must know both languages, as well as the science that he is to translate; and finding that few translators did, he wanted to do away with translation and translators altogether.

The first European to assume that one translates satisfactorily only toward his own language may have been Martin Luther, translator of the Bible into German. According to L.G. Kelly, since Johann Gottfried Herder in the 18th century, "it has been axiomatic" that one works only toward his own language.

Compounding these demands upon the translator is the fact that not even the most complete dictionary or thesaurus can ever be a fully adequate guide in translation. Alexander Tytler, in his *Essay on the Principles of Translation* (1790), emphasized that assiduous reading is a more comprehensive guide to a language than are dictionaries. The same point, but also including listening to the spoken language, had earlier been made in 1783 by Onufry Andrzej **Kopczyński**, member of Poland's Society for Elementary Books, who was called "the last Latin poet".

The special role of the translator in society is aptly described in an essay that was published posthumously in 1803 and that had been written by Ignacy Krasicki— "Poland's La Fontaine", Primate of Poland, poet, encyclopedist, author of the first Polish novel, and translator from **French and Greek:** "[T]ranslation... is in fact an art both estimable and very difficult, and therefore is not the labor and portion of common minds; [it] should be [practiced] by those who are themselves capable of being actors, when they see greater use in translating the works of others than in their own works, and hold higher than their own glory the service that they render to their country.

### **Religious texts**

Translation of religious works has played an important role in history. Buddhist monks who translated the Indian sutras into Chinese often skewed their translations to better reflect China's very different culture, emphasizing notions such as filial piety. A famous mistranslation of the Bible is the rendering of the Hebrew word קֶרֶן (keren), which has several meanings, as "horn" in a context where it actually means "beam of light". As a result, artists have for centuries depicted Moses the Law giver with horns growing out of his forehead. An example is Michelangelo's famous sculpture. Some Christians with anti-Semitic feelings used such depictions to spread hatred of the Jews, claiming that they were devils with horns. One of the first recorded instances of translation in the West was the rendering of the Old Testament into Greek in the third century B.C.E. The resulting translation is known as the Septuagint, a name that alludes to the seventy translators (seventy-two in some versions) who were commissioned to translate the Bible in Alexandria. Each translator worked in solitary confinement in a separate cell, and legend has it that all seventy versions were identical. The Septuagint became the source text for later translations into many languages, including Latin, Coptic, Armenian and Georgian. Saint Jerome, the patron saint of translation, is still considered one of the greatest translators in history for rendering the Bible into Latin. The Roman Catholic

Church used his translation (known as the Vulgate) for centuries, but even this translation at first stirred much controversy. The period preceding and contemporary with the Protestant Reformation saw the translation of the Bible into local European languages, a development that greatly affected Western Christianity's split into Roman Catholicism and Protestantism, due to disparities between Catholic and Protestant versions of crucial words and passages. The Luther Bible in German, Jakub Wujek's Bible translation in Polish, and the King James Bible in English had lasting effects on the religions, cultures and languages of those countries.

### **History of Asian theory**

There is a separate tradition of translation in South Asia and East Asia (primarily modern India and China), especially connected with the rendering of religious texts — particularly Buddhist texts — and with the governance of the Chinese empire. Classical Indian translation is characterized by loose adaptation, rather than the closer translation more commonly found in Europe, and Chinese translation theory identifies various criteria and limitations in translation. In the East Asia Sinosphere (sphere of Chinese cultural influence), more important than translation per se has been the use and reading of Chinese texts, which also had substantial influence on the Japanese, Korean and Vietnamese languages, with substantial borrowings of vocabulary and writing system. Notable is Japanese Kanbun, which is a system of glossing Chinese texts for Japanese speakers.

**(Chinese translation theory)** was born out of contact with vassal states during the Zhou Dynasty. It developed through translations of Buddhist scripture into Chinese. It is a response to the universals of the experience of translation and to the specifics of the experience of translating from specific source languages into Chinese. It also developed in the context of Chinese literary and intellectual tradition. The modern Standard Mandarin word fanyi 翻譯 "translate; translation" compounds fan "turnover; cross over; translate" and yi "translate; interpret". Some related synonyms are tongyi 通譯 "interpret; translate", chuanyi 傳譯 "interpret; translate", and zhuan yi 轉譯 "translate; retranslate". The Chinese classics contain various words meaning "interpreter; translator", for instance, sheren 舌人 (lit. "tongue person") and fanshe 反舌 (lit. "return tongue"). The Classic of Rites records four regional words: ji 寄 "send; entrust; rely on" for Dongyi 東夷 "Eastern Yi-barbarians", xiang 象 "be like; resemble; image" for Nanman 南蠻 "Southern Man-barbarians", didi 狄鞮 "Di-barbarian boots" for Xirong 西戎 "Western Rong-

barbarians", and yi 譯 "translate; interpret" for Beidi 北狄 "Northern Di-barbarians". In those five regions, the languages of the people were not mutually intelligible, and their likings and desires were different. To make what was in their minds apprehended, and to communicate their likings and desires, (there were officers), — in the east, called transmitters; in the south, representationists; in the west, Tî-tîs; and in the north, interpreters.(王制 "The Royal Regulations", tr.James Legge 1885 vol. 27, pp. 229-230) A Western Han work attributes a dialogue about translation to Confucius. Confucius advises a ruler who wishes to learn foreign languages not to bother. Confucius tells the ruler to focus on governance and let the translators handle translation. The earliest bit of translation theory may be the phrase "names should follow their bearers, while things should follow China." In other words, names should be transliterated, while things should be translated by meaning. In the late Qing Dynasty and the Republican Period, reformers such as Liang Qichao, Hu Shi and Zhou Zuoren began looking at translation practice and theory of the great translators in Chinese history.

### **Fidelity vs. fluency**

Fidelity(or "faithfulness") and fluency are two qualities that, for millennia, have been regarded as ideals to be striven for in translation, particularly literary translation. Sometimes, especially in inexperienced hands, the two ideals are at odds. Thus a 17th-century French critic quipped about "les belles infidèles " to suggest that translations, like women, could be either beautiful or faithful, but not both at the same time.

"Fidelity" pertains to the extent to which a translation accurately renders the meaning of the source text, without adding to or subtracting from it, without emphasizing or de-emphasizing any part of the meaning, and otherwise without distorting it."Fluency" pertains to the extent to which a translation appears to a native speaker of the target language to have originally been written in that language, and conforms to the language's grammatical, syntactic and idiomatic conventions. A translation that meets the first criterion is said to be a "faithful translation"; a translation that meets the second criterion, an "idiomatic translation". In the hands of an expert translator, the two qualities need not be mutually exclusive. The criteria used to judge the faithfulness of a translation vary according to the subject, the precision of the original contents, the type, function and use of the text, its literary qualities, its social or historical context, and so forth. The criteria for judging the fluency of a translation appear more straightforward: an unidiomatic translation "sounds wrong", and in the extreme case of word-for-word translations generated by many

machine-translation systems, often results in patent nonsense with only a humorous value (see Round-trip translation). Nevertheless, in certain contexts a translator may consciously strive to produce a literal translation. Literary translators and translators of religious or historic texts often adhere as closely as possible to the source text. In doing so, they often deliberately stretch the boundaries of the target language to produce an unidiomatic text. Similarly, a literary translator may wish to adopt words or expressions from the source language in order to provide "local color" in the translation. In recent decades, prominent advocates of such "non-fluent" translation have included the French scholar Antoine Berman, who identified twelve deforming tendencies inherent in most prose translations, and the American theorist Lawrence Venuti, who has called upon translators to apply "foreignizing" translation strategies instead of domesticating ones. Many non-fluent-translation theories draw on concepts from German Romanticism, the most obvious influence on latter-day theories of "foreignization" being the German theologian and philosopher Friedrich Schleiermacher. In his seminal lecture "On the Different Methods of Translation" (1813) he distinguished between translation methods that move "the writer toward [the reader]", i.e., fluency, and those that move the "reader toward [the author]", i.e., an extreme fidelity to the foreignness of the source text. Schleiermacher clearly favored the latter approach. His preference was motivated, however, not so much by a desire to embrace the foreign, as by a nationalist desire to oppose France's cultural domination and to promote German literature. For the most part, current Western practices in translation are dominated by the concepts of "fidelity" and "fluency". This has not always been the case. There have been periods, especially in pre-Classical Rome and in the 18th century, when many translators stepped beyond the bounds of translation proper into the realm of "adaptation".

Adapted translation retains currency in some non-Western traditions. Thus the Indian epic, the Ramayana, appears in many versions in the various Indian languages, and the stories are different in each. Anyone considering the words used for translating into the Indian languages, whether those be Aryan or Dravidian languages, will be struck by the freedom that is granted to the translators.

[dubious—discuss] This may relate to a devotion to prophetic passages that strike a deep religious chord, or to a vocation to instruct unbelievers. Similar examples are to be found in medieval Christian literature, which adjusted the text to the customs and values of the audience.

### **Equivalence**

The question of fidelity vs. transparency has also been formulated in terms of, respectively, "formal equivalence" and "dynamic equivalence". The latter two expressions are associated with the translator Eugene Nida and were originally coined to describe ways of translating the Bible, but the two approaches are applicable to any translation. "Formal equivalence" corresponds to "metaphrase", and "dynamic equivalence" to "paraphrase". "Dynamic equivalence" (or "functional equivalence") conveys the essential thought expressed in a source text —if necessary, at the expense of literality, original sense and word order, the source text's active vs. passive voice, etc. By contrast, "formal equivalence" (sought via "literal" translation) attempts to render the text literally, or "word for word" (the latter expression being itself a word-for-word rendering of the classical Latin *verbum pro verbo*) — if necessary, at the expense of features natural to the target language. There is, however, no sharp boundary between dynamic and formal equivalence. On the contrary, they represent a spectrum of translation approaches. Each is used at various times and in various contexts by the same translator, and at various points within the same text — sometimes simultaneously. Competent translation entails the judicious blending of dynamic and formal equivalents.

Common pitfalls in translation, especially when practiced by inexperienced translators, involve false equivalents such as "false friends" and false cognates.

### **Back-translation**

A "back-translation" is a translation of a translated text back into the language of the original text, made without reference to the original text. In the context of machine translation, a back-translation is also called a "round-trip translation." Comparison of a back-translation to the original text is sometimes used as a quality check on the original translation. But while useful as an approximate check, it is far from infallible.

Humorously telling evidence for this was provided by Mark Twain when he issued his own back-translation of a French version of his famous short story, "The Celebrated Jumping Frog of Calaveras County"; he published his back-translation in a single 1903 volume together with his English-language original, the French translation, and a "Private History of the 'Jumping Frog' Story," the latter including a synopsized adaptation that Twain tells us had appeared, without attribution to him, in a Professor Sidgwick's Greek Prose Composition (p. 116) under the title, "The Athenian and the Frog," and which for a time, Twain tells us, had been taken for an independent ancient Greek precursor of Twain's "Jumping Frog" story.

In cases when a historic document survives only in translation, the original having been lost, researchers sometimes undertake back-translation in an effort to reconstruct the original text. An example involves the novel "The Saragossa Manuscript" by the Polish aristocrat Jan Potocki(1761–1815). The polymath polyglot composed the book entirely in French and published fragments anonymously in 1804 and 1813–14. Portions of the original French-language manuscripts were subsequently lost; the missing fragments survived, however, in a Polish translation that was made by Edmund Chojecki in 1847 from a complete French copy, now lost. French-language versions of the complete Saragossa Manuscript have since been produced, based on extant French-language fragments and on French-language versions that have been back-translated from Chojecki's Polish version.

Similarly, when historians suspect that a document is actually a translation from another language, back-translation into that hypothetical original language can provide supporting evidence by showing that such characteristics as idioms, puns, peculiar grammatical structures, etc., are in fact derived from the original language. For example, the known text of the Till Eulenspiegel folk tales is in High German but contains many puns that work only if back-translated in to Low German. This seems clear evidence that these tales (or at least large portions of them) were originally composed in Low German and rendered into High German by an over-metaphrastic translator. Similarly, supporters of Aramaic primacy—i.e., of the view that the Christian New Testament or its sources were originally written in the Aramaic language—seek to prove their case by showing that difficult passages in the existing Greek text of the New Testament make much better sense if back-translated into Aramaic—that, for example, some incomprehensible references are in fact Aramaic puns that do not work in Greek.

## 1.5 UNTRANSLATABILITY

Untranslatability is a property of a text, or of any utterance in one language, for which no equivalent text or utterance can be found in another language. J.C. Catford, a celebrated translation scholar of the linguistics school, raised the issue of untranslatability in 1965. He argues that the linguistic untranslatability is due to the differences in the source language and the target language, whereas culture untranslatability is due to the absence in the target language of relevant situational features. Nida presents a rich source of information about the problem of loss in translation, in particular about the difficulties encountered by the translator when facing with terms or concepts in the source language that do not exist in the target language. Peter Newmark once has briefly talked about the deviation **in translation.** **In China today, many translation** experts and scholars have also discussed the problem in their papers. The problem of untranslatability is always a disputed issue. Nowadays, it is well accepted that translation is a possible and feasible task. However, there are still some language points that are difficult to translate, which is called the phenomenon of untranslatability. Linguistic and cultural differences, the two categories of untranslatability phenomenon are caused by different factors. Those resulting from the linguistic differences will hardly change while those resulting from cultural differences may become translatable in the future by using the methods of compensation and the skill of translators.

### Linguistic untranslatability

**Professor Liu Biqing wrote in his Modern Translation Theories that “The structure of language** commonly shows the characteristics of the language, these characteristics only can be found in relative language, the similar transfer is difficult to find in non-relative language, for it need to **change the code completely.” View from the etymology, English belongs to the Indo-European language, while Chinese belongs to the Sino-Tibetan language, so there exist the linguistic untranslatability, which includes the following aspects: phonology, character, figure of speech, and so on.**

#### A. Untranslatability in Phonology

Any language has its own special phonemic system, which cannot be replaced by other language. There are large differences between Chinese and English, and most of the pronunciations in one language do not have equivalent in the other language. Therefore, they cannot be translated into the target language. For example:



(1)“石诗士施氏，嗜狮，誓食十狮……”

The author wrote the whole passage in homophone words. This is a typical example of untranslatability caused by phonemic system. B. Untranslatability in Character Structure

Chinese words consist of characters carrying their meaning, but English words consist of alphabets that are meaningless. They are completely different in writing. Chinese has a writing skill of describing characters, for example:

(3)“人曾为僧，人弗可以成 ， 卑为婢， 又何妨成 ”， “鸿是 边鸟， 蚕是天 虫”， “ 瑟 八大王， 王王在 ， 魑魅魍魉四小鬼， 鬼鬼靠边”。 They all use the special feature of Chinese characters to describe the character structure in poetry with their meaning. But English has no such structures in alphabetical system, so they are absolutely untranslatable. Some riddles that are relative to the structure of characters or English words are also

**untranslatable, for example: (4)“田头长草” 苗 , “What makes a road broad?”(The letter B). If the latter riddle is translated into:“什么使道路变宽？” 字母 B Everybody will feel ridiculous, and no one can understand that.**

### C. Untranslatability in Figures of Speech

Most of the languages have their own figures of speech. Just because of the existence of figure of speech, the languages become vivid and interesting. In translation practice, if the target language cannot show the figure of speech in source language correctly, it is not faithful to the content, thought and style of the source language. Although their meaning are similar, it will lessen the language influence of the source text. The people who speak Chinese and the people who speak English have large differences in the way of thinking and aesthetics, so when they express the same concept, they often use different figures of speech. These caused the untranslatability in Chinese- English translation. The following are the main aspects:

#### 1. Puns

Pun means humorous use of a word that has two meanings or of different words that sound the same. Puns pack several meanings into one word, and it is extremely unlikely that any other language will pack into the same set of meanings, so it is difficult to translate into the target

**language. Example one: 5)“杨柳青青 水平， 闻郎 唱歌声， 东边日出西边雨， 道是无晴却有晴”。 Here“晴”is a pun, and it also means “情”， it is translated into “The willows are**

green, green, the river is serene. Thence is his song rafted to me. In the east the sun is rising, in the west the rain is falling. Can you see if it's fair or foul?" In this translation, the translator did very well, especially in "green, serene, fair or foul", but he can not translate the pun completely.

**Example two: (6) "She is too low for a high praise, too brown to a fair praise, and too little for a great praise." The "low" and "fair" are all puns in this sentence. "Low" means short in height and low social status. "Fair" means pale skin, light in color and justice. There is no word or phrase in Chinese having the two meanings together, so the translator can not translate the two correctly into Chinese, only adopt one meaning, and lose the other meaning.**

## 2. Alliteration

Alliteration is using the same letter or sound at the beginning of the two or more words in succession. It is a common figure of speech in English, especially in proverb, advertisement, novel and so on., and most of the alliteration are untranslatable. For example:

(7) To many parents, the three Gs, gays, guys, and gangs have replaced the three Rs as benchmark of school life. 对

于许多 母来说，同性恋，枪支，帮派 个词已经代替了读，写，算 为学校的基本尺度。

In this translation, the three Gs, gays, guys, gangs are alliteration, which emphasize the serious problems of the gays, guys and gangs, but after translating them into Chinese, we can not see this effect.

## 3. Malapropism:

**"Malapropism comes from Richard Sheridan's comedy The Rivals, a honored lady name Malaprop, who often speaks wrong words or pronunciation. Malapropism is a figure of speech using wrong words with similar pronunciation tension or intension to reach the humors effect."**

**Malapropism brings difficulties in translation. For example: (8) "推开澳门，看到地 铺的是巴基斯坦，桌 摆的是刚果....."** This is a sentence from cross talk, Chinese people know the

**humors naturally, but if it is translated it into: "Pushing open the „Macau", I saw „Pakistan" paved on the floor and „Congo" on the table. English readers cannot accept that, for „Macau" is not a door, „Pakistan" is not a blanket, and „Congo" is not fruit either. Most of the younger generation in China have heard this humorous sentence: "手持郑伊健，脚踏温兆轮，翻过赵本山，穿过关芝林，跨过潘长，来到周星 ...." It is untranslatable too.**

## Cultural untranslatability

“According to J.C. Catford, instance of untranslatability can arise from two sources: one is linguistic, and the other is culture.” Nida also mentions that words have meaning only in terms of the total cultural setting. And what is culture.

Edward Taylor gave the definition the earliest in his *The Primitive Culture*: “Culture or civilization taken in its wide anthropographic sense is that complete whole which include knowledge, beliefs, art, morals, law, custom and other capabilities and habits acquired by a man as a member of society.” Peter Newmark wrote in his *A Textbook of Translation*: “I define the culture as the way of life and his manifestation that are peculiar to a community that uses a peculiar language as its means of expression.” Translation is a very important medium for cultural exchange between people using different languages. It is one of the most important tasks from translators and translation researchers viewing problems of translation from the angle of cultural exchange in order to increase the degree of cultural exchange achieved by translation as much as possible.

It is known to all that language is an important aspect of culture. Culture includes and affects language, it is this ground from which language grows and develops. All languages are the product of the culture as well as of the nation. They all have long historical background and various cultural connotations. The history, social system, natural environment, religion and customs are all shown vividly in their culturally-loaded words, proverbs, idioms, and so on.. In traditional practice, there are often no such words in target language, and the translators have to find the similar codes or make some new codes to replace, so when these culturally loaded words are translated into another language, the cultural connotations are lost. Nida once pointed out that: “For the success translation, being familiar with two cultures is even more important than mastering two languages, because the language has its meaning only in the cultural background.” Chinese culture belongs to eastern culture, while English culture belongs to the western culture. There are essential differences between eastern culture and western culture, so the untranslatability is understandable.

### A. Untranslatability Resulted from Culture Gap

#### 1. Material culture

Different nations live in different places, and will have different images for the same thing. We often hear some Chinese say: “走，喝酒去！” The word “酒” is difficult to translate. It includes

**liquor, spirit, alcohol, drink, beer, wine, and so on. These words are all “酒”,** but the liquor and spirit means low quality, and the drinks include hard drinks and soft drinks, while the wine is often referred to the grape or fruit wine.

In English, the daffodil is the symbol of spring and happiness, but in Chinese, it is only a kind of **flower called “黄水仙”**. **In Chinese people’s mind, the plum, orchid, chrysanthemum and bamboo** are all the symbol of high spirit. But English people do not think so.

## 2. Traditional culture

People live together in one country or region, and will form their own traditions, these traditions will pass from generation to generation. And other countries or regions people may not have these traditions, even they have, but in different meaning, thus making these traditions untranslatable. For example: (9) According to English tradition, the family will throw old shoes to the unmarried couples when they go out of the house, which means wish them luck, but if this **tradition is translated into “扔旧鞋”**, the Chinese people will misunderstand it. For in China, throwing old shoes to a woman means abuse her. For the traditional reason, a lot of appellations are untranslatable. The meaning of English uncle include such Chinese words as 叔父(**father’s younger brother**), 伯父(**father’s elder brother**), 舅舅(**mother’s brother**), 姑父(**father’s sister’s husband**), 姨父(**mother’s sister’s husband**), 叔叔(**father’s younger brother or a friend or acquaintance about the same age as a young person’s parent**). It would be considered a terrible **mistake in Chinese culture to refer to the father’s brother as 舅舅**, so if the relation is not clear in English, it can not be translated into Chinese.

## 3. Religious Culture

In religion, translation becomes the mission. Chinese have translated in this field for a long time, but Chinese people do not have Christianity background. Thus many of the culture will make **Chinese people misunderstand. For example: “End of the world” will make Chinese people** think of the coming of great disaster, in which all the human being will die, and they will feel fear. But to the English people, it has nothing to do with disaster. It is the coming of the justice moment.

## 4 . Historical culture

The history of a nation is the record of the social development. Idioms and legends provide ready **support in this respect. “The main problems that idioms and fixed expression pose in translation** relate to the two main areas: the ability to recognize and interpret an idiom correctly; and the difficulties involved in rendering the various aspects of meaning that an idiom or a fixed **expression conveys into the target language.” [10] An idiom or fixed expression may have no** equivalent in the target language. One language may express a given meaning by a single word, another may express it by a fixed expression, and a third may express it by an idiom, and so on. So it is unrealistic to expect to find equivalent idioms and expression in the target language in all cases. The idioms and expressions may be culture-specific which makes it difficult to translate or is untranslatable. The expression such as Kangaroo Court, related to specific cultural background provides a good example. And the historical stories or legends also have their culture element, for example:“八仙过海，各显神通”，“个臭皮匠，顶个诸葛亮”，“情人眼里出西施”。

#### B. Untranslatability Resulted from Culture Conflict

In translation, some words in one language are traditionally considered equivalent to other words in another language, but their connotations and even their referents are in effect quite different, they are **so-called false friends. For example: (10) Chinese people view “龙”as a symbol of power or good fortune. Such as “望子 龙”，** but the English people see the dragon as fierce and associate it with evil, cruelty and violence. **so “望子 龙” can not be translated into “to expect one”s son to be a dragon” for this cultural reason. Since the forms of the related items are the same, they are** often misleading. For example, the brand name of a well-known Chinese battery“白象”**is literally translated into “White Elephant”. “白象”means fortune and good luck in**

Chinese. However, the translation elicit unfavorable reaction from English consumers, who use white elephant as an idiom to mean something costly but useless. Some words of color have **conflict meaning as well. Take red for example,(11) it has the meaning of happy and festival as “红”in Chinese, such as “red-letter days”. But the Chinese “红茶”is “black tea” in English, and the Chinese “红糖”is “brown sugar” in English. The English “in the red” is “亏损赤字”.Culture** is one of the great obstacles in the process of translation, along with the linguistic barrier that is responsible for untranslatability in translation.

#### The method of compensation

Compensation is a special method that is used to reach the equivalence when there is no equivalent concept and suitable expression in the target language. It is widely accepted that the language phenomenon of untranslatability is not absolutely untranslatable, especially in the cultural aspect. In translation practice, when dealing with this kind of phenomenon, the translator always makes great effort to get a relatively satisfactory version, following are the methods often used by translators to compensate.

#### A. Adaptation

**An “adaptation”, also known as “free translation”, is a translation procedure whereby the translator replaces a social, or cultural reality in the source language with a corresponding reality in the target language, this new reality would be more usual to the audience in the target language. This method aims at maintaining the elegance and intelligibility in the target language at the sacrifice of the form of the source language, but without changing the main cultural message of the original. For example: (12)“很好，不用瞎担心了，有委员的福分呢！”“么事的桂圆？”“是委员！从前行的是大人老，现在行委员！你不明白？”**

**“He give me very good news, we need not look for trouble. I have the possibility of being a member of committee!” “What’s a common tea?” Asked the wife who vaguely caught the sound. “A committee! Lords and esquires are out of date, and the prevailing nomination is to a committee. Don’t you still understand?” Here, the Chinese word “委员”(member of a committee) sounds quite like “桂圆”(longan, a kind of tropical fruit). In the conversation, the wife does not quite catch the word and mistake the “桂圆”for “委员”. If the two words are translated literally, the reader will find the wife’s mistake incomprehensible since there is no**

phonological similarity in English between the two items. The translator use the method of adaptation, turning longan (桂圆) into common tea. Now the form is changed, but the function or effect is preserved. Common tea is phonologically related to committee. By using adaptation, this homophone untranslatability is turned into translatability.

#### B. Borrowing

Borrowing is a translation procedure that the translator uses a word or expression from the source language in the target language holus-bolus. Differences between cultures may mean that one language has expression and concepts that may not exist in another. For example, we have no ready-made equivalent for the English “model”, “Coca-cola”, “coffee”, “logic”, “sofa”, “motor”,

**“Brandy”, “chocolate”, “Benz”, and so on. Face with such words and expressions, the translators** are hard-pressed to convey the original meaning and are often left with no choice but to borrow **the original lexical items. So these words come into Chinese** :“模特儿”, “可口可乐”, “咖啡”, “逻辑”, “沙发”, “摩托”, “白兰地”, “巧克力”, “奔驰”, and so on. And likewise, there are no English equivalent for some Chinese words, such as kang(heated brick bed), Guandi Miao(temple enshrining Guan Yu, a well worshipped ancient Chinese hero), Zongzi( a pyramid-shape dumpling made of glutinous rice wrapped in reed leaves that is eaten during the Dragon Boat festival), Qigong(a system of deep breathing exercise popular in China), Taiji Quan (a kind of traditional Chinese boxing), and so on. Some of these had been accepted by English people, and some will be accepted, and these words will come to English.

### C. **Translator’s note**

**A translator’s note is a note** (usually a footnote or an endnote) added by the translator to the target language to provide additional information pertaining to the limit of translation, the cultural background and any other explanation.

**“ida also points out that the footnote can explain** contradictory customs, identify unknown geographical or physical objects, give equivalent of weights and measures, provides information on plays on words, include supplementary data on proper names and add information which may be generally useful in understanding the historical and cultural background of the document in question.” **In a word, using this method can turn some untranslatability into a certain degree of** translatability.

For example: (13)道可道，非常道 —— 《道德经》 Laozi The Tao①that can be expressed in words①is not the constant Tao.

Note: The Tao is absolute, in which all other things are relative, it is almighty and omnipresent. Its vastness or minuteness can not be compared with things of our understanding.

**The universe is embracing it.“Here the Chinese character “道” is a word with very profound** meaning, which finds itself no equivalent in the English language. It is almost untranslatable. Through the footnote, some of the culture messages have been transferred into the target **language text.”**

### D. Calque

Calque is a translation procedure that a translator translates an expression (or occasionally a word) literally into the target language, translating the element of the expression word for word.

Peter Newmark refers to it as semantic translation. It is a method of translation that aims at preserving the most cultural message of the source text at the sacrifice of the formal element of the target language, and sometimes even the intelligibility of the target text. Such as translate

**“armed to teeth” into “武装到牙齿”, translate “knowledge is strengths” into “知识就是力量”, translate “hot dog” into “热狗”, and translate “纸老虎” into “paper tiger”. Maybe they seem ridiculer at the beginning, but they will be accepted by the target language speaking people and become a common word in their daily life.**

#### E. Paraphrase

**“Paraphrase is as extended synonym and inevitably an expansion and a diffusion of the original text. It is only justified when an item of terminology technical institutional cultural, ecological, scientific cannot be explained in any other way. E.g. by TL equivalent, transcription, neologism by reproducing the encyclopedic tenor for the linguistic vehicle.” Sometimes, some words in their source language do not have equivalent in the target language, so it is difficult to use calques or other method to compensate. And what we can use is paraphrase, for example:**

**The Chinese idiom “一龙一猪”, means one is very clever and capable, but the other is stupid and hopeless. If it is translated into “one is a dragon, another is a pig”, English readers can not understand the meaning. And there are no similar idioms to substitute, so we only can use the method of paraphrase, and translate it into: “one is very capable, while the other is extremely incompetent.”**

#### Conclusion

For the differences in linguistic and culture, we should accept that there does exist untranslatability between English and Chinese. But we never neglect the fact that there are numerous language universality and cultural similarities. Such as integration, cultural diversity, network technology revolutionary, the world is getting smaller and smaller. We are sure to believe that the language and cultural communication will be more and more, and the barrier between languages will be less and less.

### 1.5.1 PROBLEMS IN TRANSLATING LITERARY AND SCIENTIFIC MATTERS

Scientific translation has become a prerequisite not only for the acquisition of technology, but to its introduction, installation, and operation as well.

#### Requirements of Scientific translator



According to London Institute of Linguistics, to be a scientific translator one should have:

1. broad knowledge of the subject-matter of the text to be translated;
2. a well-developed imagination that enables the translator to visualize the equipment or process being described;
3. intelligence, to be able to fill in the missing links in the original text;
4. a sense of discrimination, to be able to choose the most suitable equivalent term from the literature of the field or from dictionaries;
- 5. the ability to use one's own language with clarity, conciseness and precision;** and
6. practical experience in translating from related fields. In short, to be technical translator one must be a scientist, or engineer, a linguist and a writer (cf. Gasagrade, 1954: 335-40; Giles, 1995; Latfipour, 1996).

Out of the six requirements listed above, the first deserves special consideration because it bears on the early attempts to found a theory of translation advocating that the text whether literary or scientific should be dealt with according to the way language is used in them (Adams, 1967: 87). This means that it is a theory which goes back to the old epistemological controversy over the objective and the subjective sides of reality, and which may imply, when extended to language varieties, a dichotomy between science and literature. According to Adams (*ibid.*) “**it took more than a century to reorganize these two terms**” properly as illustrated in the following columns:

<u>Science</u>	<u>Literature</u>
- Denotative adequacy.	- Unbridled connotation.
- Logical expository and/or argumentative progression.	- Lack of argumentative progression.
- Precision.	- Vagueness.
- Intellect.	- Imagination or intuition.
- Reason.	- Emotion.
- Truth to particular truth.	- Truth to the ideal and universal.

The points of contrast mentioned above side with Ilyas (1989: 109) who describes the nature of scientific texts as follows:

In scientific works, subject-matter takes priority over the style of the linguistic medium which aims at expressing facts, experiments, hypothesis, etc. The reader of such scientific works does

not read it for any sensuous pleasure which a reader of literary work usually seeks, but he is after the information it contains. All that is required in fact is that of verbal accuracy and lucidity of **expression. This is applicable to the translator's language as well. Scientific words differ from** ordinary and literary words since they do not accumulate emotional associations and implications. This explains why the translation of a scientific work is supposed to be more direct, freer from alternatives, and much less artistic than the other kinds of prose. The language of scientific and technical language is characterized by impersonal style, simpler syntax, use of acronyms, and clarity.

This distinction has one significant implication for the translator of scientific texts: he has to possess some knowledge of the subject-matter of the text he is working on, over the rest of the pre-requisites which he shares with translators of other text types.

Furthermore, this distinction is useful in so far as it is conjoined to possible leading factors for a theory of scientific translation because most of the literature on translation has given extensive consideration to literary texts ending with specific rules and theories and establishing relevant terminology of literary translation. The word **deviation** for instance, expresses one of the frequent concepts in the description of literary texts where deviation rarely occurs in scientific ones. By this we mean the deviation from the linguistic norms flourishing in poetry and prose, the quality which scientific texts often lack. However, certain rules which are applicable to theories of literary translation can be safely applied to scientific translation in general and to English-Arabic scientific translation in particular.

In this respect, we have to mention that Arabic, despite its adherence to prescriptive and conventional rules, can - in certain cases- provide for English word-for-word equivalence by different ways such as coinage, borrowing and transliteration by forcing into its paradigmatic **moulds English words such as the substantive; so words like 'faylasuf' for philosopher; 'jiyulujiya' for geology; 'istatiki' for static.....etc found their way** uninterrupted into Arabic. Beeston (1970: 115) says to this effect:

The need for a large new vocabulary dealing with technological and scientific matters is, however, the least interesting feature of the new lexical development; more fascinating, though more elusive, is the evolution of new words for intellectual concepts.

However, apart from the cultural gap, the problem of scientific translation from English into Arabic remains mostly a matter of understanding and representing the techniques, the processes,

and the details which science and technology involve. In this regard, Farghal and Shunnaq (1999:210) state that **“the major problem facing translators at present is terminology standardization and dissemination in the sphere of science and technology”**. **“When it comes to Arabic”, they continue, “scientific discourse is a translation activity, as Arabic is usually a target language, and creation and reasoning are done in another language”**.

The above-mentioned requirements for competence in scientific translation can be further expanded and detailed by the following model of the processes involved in this type of translation:

### **A Suggested Model for Scientific Translation**

As far as English-Arabic scientific translation is concerned, the procedures mentioned in the suggested model (the model itself can be obtained from the Author – note by TranslationDirectory.com) can be used to analyze the code of English scientific texts. They mainly depend on the successful handling of the linguistic elements of both English and Arabic including grammar, lexicon, and field-related registers. They also harbor translating competence, which includes **structurization**, **contextualization**, mastery over programs of expression in both English and Arabic, and knowledge of the alternative standards of equivalence. Moreover, the model necessitates the ability to transfer linguistic and translating competencies to areas reserved for comparison and imagination. Subsequently, corresponding structural and lexical elements are identified and assigned functions in the sorting process within compensatory strategies resulting in an almost perfect mental representation which, when textualized and normalized, ends up in an accurately-translated Arabic product. We also have to emphasize **that in scientific texts there will be no motive on the translator’s side to create** additional impressionistic or aesthetic effects beyond that of simple information transmission.

The above description necessitates the identification of the characteristics of the scientific register on which this model operates. These characteristics are briefly discussed in the following section.

### **Scientific Register**

Generally speaking, the technical use of language manifests itself in several ways. The most obvious one is non-deviation from ordinary grammar, logically and argumentative

progression. This may entail the adherence to items that are conventionally used. There is no **insertion**, **substitution**, or **permutation** (cf. van Dijk, 1976; Bell, 1991; Ghassib, 1996). There is no blocking or stopping to the automatic processing. In contrast to their literary counterparts, scientific texts underline the information content without bothering about features that are characteristic of poetic texts, such as rhyme, and connotative or symbolic meaning. Let alone **other aesthetically features, which Schmidt (1971: 59) has defined as “polyfunctionality.”**

We also notice that most of the elements in scientific texts are not unexpected. One might even define the meaning of these texts according to the actual use of items to refer to things in **the real world or to the “extension” as contrasted to the potential meaning of things as they are** perceived, conceived, or represented in terms other than their actual appearance and/or function **by the perceiving man, or to the ‘intention’ of their producers (Weinrich, 1976: 14).**

For the purpose of more vivid characterization of these texts, we shall mention some major ones of these features by referring to Bakr-Serex (1997: 54-7):

First, this register is characterized by the logical order of utterances with clear indication of their interrelations and interdependence.

Second, it flourishes the use of terms specific to each given branch of science; in modern science; however, there is a tendency to exchange terms between various branches of science.

Third, another characteristic feature of this register is the frequent use of specific sentence-patterns, usually the **Postulatory**, the **Argumentative** and the **Formulative** patterns. The impersonality of this type of writing can be revealed in the frequent use of passive voice constructions with which scientific experiments are generally described.

Fourth, one more observable feature of the scientific register is the use quotations, references, and foot-notes in accord with the main requirement of this register, i.e. the **logical** coherence of the ideas expressed.

Finally, science does not have its own syntax only, but also its own terminology. And we have already hinted at the importance of the familiarity with this terminology resting on a solid foundation of previously acquired knowledge on behalf of the translator. Therefore, it is not the language itself which is special, but certain words or their symbols.

Having these characteristic features of the scientific register in mind, we feel that we are in a good position to identify the areas of contrast between scientific texts and other types of texts.

### Scientific versus Literary Contexts

By setting off scientific against the literary translation, their characteristics and the problems that are likely to be encountered in each, become more salient as illustrated below.

In scientific texts we have an end in view and the means necessarily remains within the general conceptual framework within which the end is defined. That is, the scientific context has a content which is concerned with the horizontal structure of the world while the literary context has a content which is concerned with the vertical structure of the world.

Thus, on the one hand, we shall have a vertical relation between height and depth while, on the other hand, we shall have a horizontal relation between width and breadth. The first relation testifies to the relative merits of artists and poets, whereas the second one signifies the merits of scientists and technologists. The product of poets is essentially a product of height and depth which has either been brought down or lifted up so as to fit into the width and breadth of life itself, that is acquiring a horizontal dimension; while the product of scientists lacks the intuitive complexity and wealth of experience characteristic of poets. This product is therefore, essentially conceived as a horizontal line corresponding to a photographic representation of the world (Blankenburg, 1982: 35-47).

Scientists speak within the familiar and concrete realities of everyday life. If they are to move, their movement is almost always towards the accomplishment of a new horizon or new perspectives that always remain within the horizontal structure of the concrete, tangible and objective reality.

Another point intrudes itself here: it is important to stress that these dimensions, whether vertical or horizontal, are intrinsically dependent on the perceiving man, that is both self-relationship and world-relationship are unified through the symbolic system of identification generally known as language. However, this is not the same as saying that these dimensions can **be spanned during a given culture's or individual's life-time**. The relation of these dimensions seems as one of opponents while their unity seems as a harmony of opposites. To span them, therefore, seems impossibility that even a highly-sophisticated computer technology cannot bring off.

These demarcation lines between vertical and horizontal dimensions suggest another area of investigation and comparisons. We can now expand the previous columns (p.3) of differences between science and literature so as to include more important language details:

<u>Scientific Texts</u>	<u>Literary Texts</u>
- Logicality.	- Lack of argumentative progression.
- Precision.	- Vagueness.
- Reason.	- Emotion.
- Truth to particular reality.	- Truth to the ideal.
- Generalization.	- Concretion.
- Referential meaning.	- Emotive meaning.
- Denotation.	- Connotation.
- Lexical affixation.	- Grammatical affixation.
- Idiomatic expressions are rare.	- Idiomatic expressions are frequent.
- Use of abbreviation, acronym, and registers.	- Very few abbreviations, acronyms, and registers.
- Standard expressions.	- Almost all varieties.
- Use of scientific terminology, specialized items, and formulae.	- No use of scientific terminology, or formulae.
- No use of elements of figurative language.	- Expensive use of figurative language.

Close examination of the items included in the literary texts column will suggest that these items are clearly descriptive by Arabic, while the items contained in the opposite column testify to the characteristics that are relevant to English usage.

Setting off these differences against more linguistic differences that exist between English and Arabic will confirm the latter's tendency to allegory and provide guide lines for translating English scientific texts into Arabic. See below:

<u>English</u>	<u>Arabic</u>
- Words are composite.	- Words are paradigmatic.
- Only few grammatical items are compound.	The majority of grammatical items are compound.
- Rigid word order.	- Flexible word order.
- Very few inflections	- Highly inflectional.

- Uses abbreviations, acronyms, formulae, and registers.	- Rarely uses abbreviations, acronyms, formulae, and cliches.
- Narrow range of gender distinction.	- Wide range of gender distinction.
- There is clear-cut tense-aspect distinction.	- There is no clear-cut tense aspect distinction.
- There is no dative or dual.	- Contains dative and dual.
- Scientific and technical terminology covers all relevant fields.	- Shortage of scientific and technical terminology that may cover all fields.
- Archaic expressions are almost obsolete.	- Archaic expressions are still in use.
- Uses so many compound lexical structures.	- Uses few compound lexical structures.
- Metaphor and other forms of figurative language are reserved for poetic use of language and certain related fields.	- Metaphor and other forms of figurative language are very much frequent even in Modern Standard Arabic.
- Adverbs are mostly formed by the affixation of (ly) to adjectives.	- Adverbs are formed by prepositional premodification of nouns and adjectives; English prepositions such as before, after, above, over, below, under, behind, and between are adverbs in Arabic.
- Capitalization is sometimes used for semantic implication e.g. <b>Mosaic, σativity.... etc.</b>	- Does not use any form of capitalization.
- Does not use vocalization.	- Vocalization has a semantic function.
- Punctuation has a bearing on the	- Punctuation has little bearing, if

interpretation of texts.	any, on the interpretation of texts.
- A part from such suffixes as (-ling and -ette) there is no paradigmatic diminutive in English.	- Paradigmatic diminutive exists.
- It has no diglossia.	- Diglossia exists.
- There are about twenty configurations of vowel sounds.	- Few vowel sounds used mainly in vocalization.
- There are no pharyngeal or glottal sounds except in the aspirated (H) and the colloquial glottal stop.	- Pharyngeal and glottal sounds are among the standard phonemes in Arabic.

Since scientific texts rarely contain idiomatic or culture-bound expressions, the type of equivalence most common in their translation is the **formal equivalence** which focuses attention on the message content itself rather than its form. Nida (1964: 223) highlights this aspect of scientific translation as follows:

This level of language, experientially is lifeless, is linguistically very manipulatable. For to the extent that language can be separated from the unique qualities of experience and can be made a kind of linguistic mathematics, its units can easily be arranged and re-arranged with little interference from the cultural context.

It emerges from the above-mentioned comparison between English and Arabic, which drastically lack scientific and technical terminology, suffers an irreversible process of disintegration through diglossia, and harbors scanty abbreviations, acronyms, formulae and registers. But since science and technology create situational features which involve new concepts, techniques, and processes that can be imitated and imagined, it is binding for Arab translators to coin equivalent terminology and develop corresponding programs of expression which Arabic morphology and flexible word order can provide. However, theoretical possibilities may in many cases fall short of practical application and this is very much the case with English technical translating into Modern Standard Arabic today.

### **Conclusion:**

It becomes obvious from the discussion we presented so far that the act of scientific translation is sometimes guided by certain strategies. One of these strategies accounts for the systematic differences between the two languages concerned. Another depends on the type of language used



in any individual text. Both these strategies are applicable in translating English scientific texts into Arabic.

Another point is that Arabic, in its current situation, does gravely lack a frame-of-reference in the scientific and literature, and what is available of translated literature to this effect in Arabic is rather scanty and harbours gaps that are likely to multiply since initiative has not been taken by the Arabs to adopt and sustain a large-scale translating process in this particular.

- In English, which expresses a highly sophisticated technological culture, both horizontal and vertical dimensions of human experience are dynamic and expanding. Whereas in Arabic, which is the expression of poetic culture, only the vertical dimension of human experience is unevenly expanding. Thus, translating English scientific texts into Arabic will inescapably involve a process of transferring dynamic and multidimensional human experience into a static and mono-dimensional one whose verbal system can hardly provide for such a transfer.

- As the Arab culture is being profoundly modified and modern technology is being increasingly introduced, new technical terms are being adopted as well. But these terms are **predominantly a mixture of transliterations and borrowing e.g. “banzinkhana” “petrol satation” is compounded from the English word “benzine” and the Turco-Persian word “khana” “station”.**

However, these terms, regardless of their readiness to catch up with Arabic paradigmatic moulds, can by no means encompass the whole body of English technical and scientific literature.

- Finally, in this situation which is rather difficult if not entirely hopeless, it seems imperative for the Arabs to start a serious and large scale process of Arabization. Yet, this process cannot be affected overnight. It necessitates an exceptionally high energy, good-will and **objective thinking on the Arabs’, part to span and assimilate what the west has spanned and assimilated since the Renaissance.**

## 1.6 GUIDELINES FOR EFFECTIVE TRANSLATION

Due to the highly developing global economy and the modern communication technologies, a mass of translation companies emerges in the translation industry,. How can a company take a steady position in this arena? It is the translation quality that makes success. Because translation is a complicated cross-cultural communicative activity, a translation which is faithful, expressive and close to the original text is essential. Here are some suggestions for you to gain better comprehension and apply in your real work.

First, use target-oriented phrases on the lexical level. Just make clear what the author really wants to express, then re-express it with the **appropriate phrase. Don't try to make translation** word for word.

- Ensure each of the terms in original language gets translated consistently into the appropriate term in the target language. The translation manager should create a terminology bank for the translators all assigned for a certain translation project.
- Use a very commonly used word to make the fundamental meaning which agrees with the original word perfectly.
- If you use acronyms, be sure to also spell them out.
- **According to the context and writing style, permit a certain term's** changes whether it is complicated or not in form.

Second, use proper devices on the stylistic level

- Use rhetoric devices designated to impress target readers to respond, including hyperbole, simile, metaphor, personification, pun, alliteration analogy and so on.
- Use active voice, which is easier to understand. If the material is being translated into a language which frequently uses passive voice, such as German, the translator will make the accommodation for that language.
- Be of conciseness and consideration... Grasp the soul of text thoroughly and firmly.<sup>4</sup> Be of unity and variety. **Unity refers to a kind of decoration of wisdom's custom and language**, whereas variety refers to a kind of deviation to unity and break away from custom. Unity is a general rule to be obeyed for all text in one article, It is on the base of unity that the target word can vary. For example, we try to avoid writing essentially the same thing in different places. If you need to repeat information, it is better to repeat it verbatim

Third, be faithful to the original text.

- Avoid ambiguity. A translator needs to understand precisely what the author wants to express in order to translate them correctly. If it is ambiguous, the translator will need to have it clarified.
- Make sure there are no defects in the source materials, Any error in the source material is compounded when translated into multiple languages. Fundamentally, being faithful to the original and using expressive phrases make the target text easy to understand. Except the most important three elements mentioned above you should apply to. Taking into consideration of the content and structure of the source text as well as acceptability **of the target text, is another technique translators can't miss. .It is well known that** translation is an art job, It can reproduce fine ideas bywords. Therefore, the art of translation is a combination of knowledge of contents and linguistic principles in both target and source languages. And, through this article, we put forward faithfulness, expressiveness and closeness as basic principles which a quality translation service need to obey.

#### REFERENCES:

- The Oxford Companion to the English Language, Namit Bhatia, ed., 1992, pp. 1,051–54
- Cui Jingjing, Untranslatability and the Method of Compensation. ISSN 1799-2591 Theory and Practice in Language Studies, Vol. 2, No. 4, pp. 826-830, April 2012
- Darwish and Ali, Elements of Translation: A Practical Guide for Translators. Writescop Pty Ltd, Australia. 2010.

**UNIT – II INDIAN LITERATURE IN TRANSLATION  
(SHS5010)**

## UNIT II

### POETRY IN TRANSLATION

#### 2.1 Valluvar's Tirukural

##### 2.1.1 Universal Importance of the Tirukkural

The Tirukkural is a book of universal importance and it is believed to have been written about 2000 years ago in classical Tamil by the sage Valluvar, though there is not adequate evidence to prove it, except for the occurrence of his name as Tiruvalluvar in the song of praise called **Thiruvalluvamalai, 'Garland of Thiruvalluvar.'** But the poet's name and the name of his "great work are both without a name. The author himself is commonly known as Tiru-valluva-nāyanār (the sacred devotee, priest, or soothsayer of the paraya caste)"

Scholars and sages, cutting across continents, believe that the Tirukkural is a teaching for the whole universe. **"The Kural is believed to be the most translated of all literary works in the world, barring religious works like the Bible and the Koran. There are no less than 80 translations"** .

A review of literature on the precious work of Tiruvalluvar, its place in the Tamil caṅkam, **"the academy formed by the pāṇṭiyā rulers who were one among the three rulers of ancient Tamil country", its importance in the world; and a review of its translations, which are available for** reference in English, and books and articles related to the Tirukkural in English are the important aspects to be analysed.

Tamil, the language of Tamil Nadu / ancient Tamil country is known for its ancient **heritage and unique nature. The pāṇṭiya rulers** patronized Tamil language and founded three sangams to develop and preserve it. The poems of the sangam literature were composed by Dravidian Tamil people, both men and women, from various professions and classes of society who excelled as poets. These poems were later collected into various anthologies, edited, and with colophons added by anthologists and annotators around 1000 AD. Then, they were

categorized, for the convenience of the readers and learners, into akattiyam, tolkāppiyam, patinenṇmēlkaṇakku, and patinenṇkīlkaṇakku books. The Tirukkuraḷ is one among the 18 books of the patinenṇkīlkaṇakku books; and it has the unique distinction of being celebrated through all the ages and countries as a holy book or scripture.

Though there are many stories and legends on the birth, life, work and even the names of Tiruvaḷḷuvar and the Tirukkuraḷ, it is widely accepted that the author of the book Tirukkuraḷ is Tiruvaḷḷuvar. Also the name of the author is not a proper noun. tiru is the word used before the name of a person as a mark of respect and reverence; and the word vaḷḷuva is the name of a community who earns their livelihood by weaving. Details regarding the name of the text, is found in the “Introduction” of Pope’s translation of the Tirukkuraḷ entitled the Sacred Kurral of Tiruvalluva Nayanar, that it is meant as kuraḷ by the brevity of the couplets, which means “anything short . . . and is properly the name of the couplet as being the shortest species of

stanza in the Tamil language” (iii). Tiruvaḷḷuvar “with the two lines of his diminutive venṇā – footed kuraḷ verse” measured the universe (iii). “The laws of the venṇā metre in which the kurral is composed, are very curious, and, in fact, unique in prosody” (vi). Narayanasamy opines in the Preface to his book Thirukkural with English Version that “it (the Tirukkuraḷ) is a literary masterpiece of verses with poetic excellence, brevity and crispness, rhythm and syntax, easy to grasp and remember”.

### 2.1.2 Three Books of the Tirukkuraḷ

The Tirukkuraḷ is the compilation of three divisions or books namely, arattuppāl ‘Virtue,’ poruṭpāl ‘Wealth’ and kāmattuppāl ‘Love.’ It is known for its brevity, simplicity and clarity; and worshipped as the maxims of truth. The first book arattuppāl, translated as Virtue into English, has 38 chapters, the second book poruṭpāl translated as Wealth, has 70 chapters; and the third book kāmattuppāl, translated as Love, has 25 chapters with ten couplets under each chapter. It has 1330 couplets as a whole, each of which has seven metrical feet, “divided into lines of 4 and 3 feet, or 3 and 4 feet” based on the rhythm (etukai) of the lines. “Rhyme in Tamil is in the beginning of the line, and is strictly the identity of the second letter, the first being of the same metrical quality” and Pope considers the division of the two lines based on its rhyme (Introduction xxvi). The Tirukkuraḷ is known for its greatness of thought and fulfillment of

‘metre.’ To him, “a kural is a couplet containing a complete and striking idea expressed in

a refined and intricate metre. No translation can convey an idea of its charming effect” (vi).

The first book arattuppāl ‘Virtue’ opens with “the praise of God” and deals with domestic and ascetic virtues needed for domestic and social life. The second book poruṭpāl ‘Wealth’ **is on** politics and governance, the concepts of good administration and the importance of education stanza in the Tamil language” (iii). Tiruvaḷḷuvar “with the two lines of his diminutive venpā – footed kuraḷ verse” measured the universe (iii). “The laws of the venpā metre in which the kuraḷ is composed, are very curious, and, in fact, unique in prosody” (vi). Narayanasamy opines in the Preface to his book Thirukkuraḷ with English Version that “it (the Tirukkuraḷ) is a literary masterpiece of verses with poetic excellence, brevity and crispness, rhythm and syntax, easy to grasp and remember”.

### 2.1.2 Three Books of the Tirukkuraḷ

The Tirukkuraḷ is the compilation of three divisions or books namely, arattuppāl ‘Virtue,’ poruṭpāl ‘Wealth’ and kāmattuppāl ‘Love.’ It is known for its brevity, simplicity and clarity; and worshipped as the maxims of truth. The first book arattuppāl, translated as Virtue into English, has 38 chapters, the second book poruṭpāl translated as Wealth, has 70 chapters; and the third book kāmattuppāl, translated as Love, has 25 chapters with ten couplets under each chapter. It has 1330 couplets as a whole, each of which has seven metrical feet, “divided into lines of 4 and 3 feet, or 3 and 4 feet” based on the rhythm (etukai) of the lines. “Rhyme in Tamil is in the beginning of the line, and is strictly the identity of the second letter, the first being of the same metrical quality” and Pope considers the division of the two lines based on its rhyme (Introduction xxvi). The Tirukkuraḷ is known for its greatness of thought and fulfillment of

‘metre.’ To him, “a kural is a couplet containing a complete and striking idea expressed in a refined and intricate metre. No translation can convey an idea of its charming effect” (vi).

The first book arattuppāl ‘Virtue’ opens with “the praise of God” and deals with domestic and ascetic virtues needed for domestic and social life. The second book poruṭpāl ‘Wealth’ **is on** politics and governance, the concepts of good administration and the importance of education

and values such as intelligence, will power, friendship, devotion and dignity. And the third book kāmattuppāl ‘Love’ speaks of the two categories of love such as furtive love and wedded love which is “a very deep and subtle portion of the Tirukkuraḷ. None has dared to descend into the realms of sex-love in a Book of Morals as St. Vaḷḷuvar has done”.

The couplets on love and life throw much light on life, custom, moral, discipline, amusement and relationship which are the universal phenomena of all the times, races and places. Mahatma Gandhi, the man of the millennium, too affirms the greatness of the Tirukkuraḷ: “It (Tirukkuraḷ) is a text-book of indispensable authority on moral life” and “there is none who has given such a treasure of wisdom like him (Tiruvaḷḷuvar)”(www.kural.in n.pag.).

### 2.1.3 The Immortal Tirukkuraḷ

Francis Whyte Ellis who spent his life in Tamil Nadu from 1796 till his death in 1819, was the first to make an attempt in translating the Tirukkuraḷ into English; but fate could not allow him complete his task. Rev. Drew translated the Tirukkuraḷ in 1853 which inspired Pope and paved

the path to the Europeans to become aware of the greatest masterpiece of Tamil language. “Once the world became aware of these compact distiches of quintessential wisdom, the Kuraḷ has been translated into over 60 languages across the world, including 13 other Indian languages” since A.D.1730 (www.damowords.co.uk n.pag.). But, translating a literary work of art like the Tirukkuraḷ is not merely transferring it from one language into another because it is the index of the life of the Tamils of its period.

K.C. Kulandaisamy remarks on the translation of the Tirukkuraḷ in his article “Tirukkural: Deficiency in Translation into Other Languages:”

Translation of a book like Tirukkural is not merely translating a book from one language to another, but it is translating a treatise from one culture to another. As technical terms in Science and Technology, there are cultural terms in Social Sciences. Science and Technology are essentially universal and one may find equivalent terms; but culture is not universal. A cultural term in one language may not have an equivalent one in another culture. (n.pag.)

Many are enthused to read and enjoy the couplets for their encompassed wisdom. Scholars are surprised to find such couplets enriched with full-fledged knowledge within them. M.



Winternitz, a German Professor and Sanskrit Scholar, opines: Thiruvalluvar's Kural is one of the gems of the world literature. He stands above all races, castes, and sects, and what he teaches is a general human morality and wisdom. No wonder, the Kural has been read, studied and highly praised in the land of its origin for centuries, but also found many admirers in the West, ever since it has become known. (www.kural.in n.pag.)

Many native scholars who became masters of English language too have tried their hands at translating the Tirukkural into English. Rajagopalachari, a translator of the Thirukkural into English, remarks in his "Preface" to his translation Kural: the Great Book of Tiru-Valluvar that the "Kural is not a mere book of aphorisms. It is a work linked with the life of the people in all its aspects"(xiii).

K.M. Munshi, in his Foreword to Rajaji's translation, comments on the greatness of the Tirukkural: In its essence, Tirukkural is a treatise par excellence on the art of living. Tiru-Valluvar, the author, diagnoses the intricacies of human nature with such penetrating insight, perfect mastery and consummate skill absorbing the most subtle concepts of modern psychology, that one is left wondering at his sweep and depth. His prescriptions, leavened by godliness, ethics, morality and humaneness are sagacious and practical to the core. They cut across castes, creeds, climes and ages and have a freshness which makes one feel as if they are meant for the present times. (ix) J. Narayanasamy, a translator of the Tirukkural into English, admires that "the Thirukkural is neither a Testament, nor a Scripture, nor a Heavenly Dispensation; it is a Treatise on Social Life. It is the embodiment of enlightened wisdom; the hallmark of an ancient civilization, with a rich heritage, tradition and culture reflected in a distinctive language and diction (Preface ix). While stating about the hidden treasures like simplicity, brevity, clarity of content, precious teaching of moral values, extreme practicality and metric beauty of each couplet, Auvai, a famous Tamil classical poetess, praised it as: "The Kural contains much in a little compass. Such is the ingenuity of its author that he has compressed within its narrow limits all the branches of knowledge, as if he had hollowed an atom, and enclosed all the waters of the seven seas in it" (www.kural.in n.pag.).

Religious books like the Bible, the Bhagavat Gita, the Quran and many literary works of different languages have been preserved in English as translated versions. The famous Tamil literary works like the Tirukkural, cilappatikāram, pattuppāṭṭu, kuṇṭokai and nālaṭiār have been

translated into English by various competent translators, since Tamil is known for its ancient heritage and “melodious and homogenous” nature which is “rich in synonyms leaving much space for suggestions” (Fornanek148).Translations of the Tamil literary works were initially done by the foreign missionaries who came to India and learned Tamil and other Indian languages in order to do their missionary work. Translation of the

Tirukkuraḷ into European languages, too, started with the advent of the foreign missionaries like Father Constantius Beschi (1730 Latin), A. F. Cammera (1803 German), F.W. Ellis (1812 English), M.Ariel (1848 French), W. H. Drew (1840 English), Karl Graul (1856 German and Latin)and G. U. Pope (1886 English). It was Pope’s efforts which “opened the door to the world’s appreciation of Thirukkural” (www.damowords.co.uk n.pag.).

#### 2.1.4 Tirukkuraḷ in English: A Review

G. U. Pope (1886), S.M. Michael (1928), K. M. Balasubramaniam (1962),Yogi Suddhanantha Bharathi (1968), Kasturi Sreenivasan (1969), K. R. Srinivasa Iyengar (1988), P.S. Sundaram (1989-90), Rasipuram S. Ramabadran (1994), T.R. Kallapiran (1995), Varadaraja V. Raman (2000) and K. C. Agamudai Nambi (2004) have translated the Tirukkuraḷ into English in verse form. Pope and Balasubramaniam follow the method of verse to verse metrical translation while others give importance to the couplet form. V.V.S. Aiyar (1915), H.A. Popley (1931), A. Renganada Mudaliar (1933), C. Rajagopalachari (1937), M. S. Pooranalingam Pillai (1942), V.R. Ramachandra Dhikshitar (1949), G. Vanmikanathan (1984), S. N. Sreerama Desigan (1991), P. Varadarajan (2004) and J. Narayanasamy (2008) have rendered the Tirukkuraḷ into English following poetry into prose method of translating. But Popley and Rajagopalachari have not given the whole text in English. There is a common opinion that most of the translators follow the commentary of Parimelalagar, as pointed out by M.S. Purnalingam Pillai (1999): “all the editors, European and Indian, have closely followed Parimelalagar’s commentary with all its defects” (Foreword 5). It was the Italian Jesuit Missionary Joseph Constantius Beschi who started translating the Tirukkuraḷ into a European language, Latin. He translated only the first two books “Virtue” and “Wealth” because he might have thought **that** translating the book on Love would be of doing injustice to spirituality; and did not translate the third book Love. He spent forty - two years of his life in Tamil Nadu; and rechristened himself as Veeramamunivar out of his sheer love for Tamil. **Pope calls him the “Greatest of Tamil Scholars”**

#### (Introduction

iv).Pope printed his (Bechi's) translated version of the Tirukkural in the appendix of his own translation of the Tirukkural.

Karl Graul (1856), another translator of the Tirukkural into German, came to India as a missionary in 1844, learned Indian languages, as the missionaries were expected to have sufficient knowledge of the local languages. He (Graul) expresses his great admiration for the Tirukkural in his introduction to the Kural in German as, "No translation can convey any idea of its charming effect. It is truly an apple of gold in the network of silver" (www.kural.in n.pag.). But Aiyar is of the opinion that he might have used Beschi's manuscripts for his translations of the Tirukkural (Preface x).

F. W. Ellis (1812), another scholar of extraordinary ability, came to Madras for the service of East India Company in 1796. He served in various capacities like Secretary to the Board of Revenue, Zillah Judge and Collector of Madras till his death. His love for Tamil was deep and strong and his knowledge of Tamil was adequate for composing Tamil verse. His translated version of the Tirukkural was published in 1812; but he translated only 120 couplets of the 1330 couplets, 69 in verse form and the rest 51 in prosaic style. He gave a commentary with "wide ranging quotations" from ancient and modern Tamil poetry (Sundaram 142).

Drew (1840), a missionary of the London Missionary Society came to Madras in the first half of the eighteenth century. He translated only 63 chapters of the Tirukkural. In his article "The Kural and its Translators," Sundaram draws attention to Drew's comments on the difficulties of translating the third book (Love) as:"it could not be translated into any European language without exposing the translator to infamy" (143). Aiyar (1961) remarks that "Drew has given but a feeble translation" (Preface xvi).

J. Lazarus (1856) was also a Missionary and a Tamil Scholar who wrote books in Tamil dealing with themes drawn from Christianity. He translated the Nannool; compiled Dictionary of Tamil Proverbs; and revised the renderings of the Kural by Drew. Raman admires the translations of Drew and Lazarus, as he feels that their translation "adheres reasonably well to the content of the original, but it is not very inspiring or enjoyable in style" (Introduction 13).

Pope (1886), during his long voyage from England to India as a missionary in 1839, learned Tamil; and started his missionary work in Chennai. Besides mastering Tamil under the guidance

and teaching of the famous Tamil scholars Aariyankaavuppillai and Ramanuja Kavirayar, he learned Telugu and other Dravidian languages; and transferred his spiritual service into educational service.

In an article entitled “Reverend G.U. Pope: Student of Tamil,” a list of 16 works is given as Pope’s chief works. He was the one who made Tamil Grammar easier to the Tamilians; and the first and only foreigner who translated all the 1330 couplets of the Tirukkural into English. Being inspired by the work of Drew, Pope translated the Tirukkural into English as the Sacred Kural; and published it in the Indian Antiquary. Then, he published it with an introduction and highly commendable commentary in 1886.

Aiyar feels that if the style of the English Bible had been adopted for the translation of the Tirukkural, “and it would have been easy for Drew as well as Pope, who were members of the Christian Church, to have adopted such a style for the translation of Tiruvalluvar” (xii). But Pope obviously did not have the notion of adopting the style of the Bible for the reason that he wished to give it a metrical translation. Though Pope attempts to give a metrical translation of couplet into couplet form, he could not retain the meaning and brevity of the SL text. He even admits

that, “a kural is a couplet containing a complete and striking idea expressed in a refined and intricate metre. No translation can convey an idea of its charming effect” (Introduction vi). Yet he tries to maintain a regular rhythm and rhyme scheme in each couplet. But Aiyar (1961) feels that “Pope’s verses do not at all do justice to the merits of the original but on the contrary deform its grand thoughts by giving them stilted and unnatural expression” (Preface xvi). While discussing the features of poetry, Andre Lefevre opines:

Translators who translate with rhyme and meter as their first priority often find themselves neglecting other features of the original: syntax tends to suffer most as it is stretched on the procrustean bed of sound similarity and metrical beat, and the information content is almost

inevitably supplemented or altered in none too subtle ways by “padding”: words not in the original added to balance a line on the metrical level or to supply the all-important rhyme word.

Sundaram and Raman affirm Lefevre's statement, because, though most of his couplets are with twelve - syllabled lines, a few need to be stretched and fetch an assessment that "its sixteen -

syllabled lines stretching like pythons across the page" (Sundaram.143). Raman (2000) observes that "the translation of G.U. Pope is rhyming, but often verbose, sometimes confusing" (13).

But

Popley considers

Pope's translation as "the best known" and affirms that his translation involves

"some slight addition to or alteration of the meaning of the original" as Pope has

"put them into rhymed verses" (Preface ix).

Aiyar (1915) is the first native who laid his hands on an independent translation of the Tirukkural into English. His translation, Maxims of Thiruvalluvar, is in the **prose form, yet his**

"translation is popular among the other Indian languages for many reasons" like "its availability," "he being a

native Tamilian scholar of a very high order with excellent mastery over English, his work is bound to be the closest to the original" and "it is complete whereas Rajaji has translated only the first division" (Mahapatra 57). Bharati states, "Sri. V.V.S. Aiyar translates the Kural in the Biblical style" (Introduction 7). Kulandai swamy too, affirms it in his Foreword to the English translation of the Tirukkural by S.M. Diaz, saying, "V.V.S. Aiyar's translation published 50 years ago is yet another purposeful work, intentionally couched in Biblical style" (41). Raman is of the view that "V.V.S. Aiyar's translation conveys the meanings of the original in reasonably good English, even if, on occasions, it deviates from traditional interpretations" (Introduction 13). Popley opines, "V.V.S. Aiyar has certainly succeeded in giving us a very fine translation"

(Preface x).

Michael (1928) initially translated some select couplets of the Tirukkural; and then the first book the Tirukkural, Virtue; and finally succeeded in translating all the couplets of the Tirukkural in verse form. Popley (1931) translated the selected couplets of the Tirukkural into

English under the title the Sacred Kural or the Tamil Veda of Tiruvalluvar. He considered the Tirukkural as the

“ethical Bible of the Tamils” (Introduction 33). He regarded his translating of the Tirukkural “as

a great and noble purpose to help to make more widely known the inimitable couplets of this humble Tamil sage (Tiruvalluvar)”

(Preface ix). He felt that it is necessary . . . for the non-Tamilian to gain a good idea of the teaching of this book” (x). He tried “to give a metrical form to the couplets, but he has not made

a great and noble purpose to help to make more widely known the inimitable couplets of this humble Tamil sage (Tiruvalluvar)”

(Preface ix). He felt that it is necessary . . . for the non-Tamilian to gain a good idea of the teaching of this book” (x). He tried “to give a metrical form to the couplets, but he has not made

a great and noble purpose to help to make more widely known the inimitable couplets of this humble Tamil sage (Tiruvalluvar)”

(Preface ix). He felt that it is necessary . . . for the non-Tamilian to gain a good idea of the teaching of this book” (x). He tried “to give a metrical form to the couplets, but he has not made

a great and noble purpose to help to make more widely known the inimitable couplets of this humble Tamil sage (Tiruvalluvar)”

(Preface ix). He felt that it is necessary . . . for the non-Tamilian to gain a good idea of the teaching of this book” (x). He tried “to give a metrical form to the couplets, but he has not made

(Preface ix). He felt that it is necessary . . . for the non-Tamilian to gain a good idea of the teaching of this book” (x). He tried “to give a metrical form to the couplets, but he has not made

use of rhyme, as it seems to him to detract from the dignity of the translation.” At the same time, “he has used both vowel and consonant alliteration, which is the Tamil substitute for rhyme.” He had the feeling that “it is almost impossible in any translation to do justice to the beauty and force of the original; only a master of English and of Tamil, such as Thiruvalluvar was in Tamil could do it” (x).

Mudaliar (1933) translated the Tirukkural into English following poetry into prose method of translating. Rajagopalachari (1937) translated select couplets of the first and the second books of the Tirukkural into English following poetry into prose method of translation. Sundaram is of the view that, among the renderings of the Kural into English by Ellis, Pope, Drew, Lazarus, Popley, Ramachandra Dikshitar, Rajagopalachari (Rajaji), Sreenivasan and Kamaliah, he (Sundaram) has

been benefited most of all by Rajaji’s renderings. In his “Preface” to his book, Thiruvalluvar: the Thirukkural, Sundaram states that “Rajaji, ablest and wisest of India’s statesmen, brings to his translation his incisive clarity, but his prose is concerned less with Valluvar the poet than with Valluvar the thinker and teacher. Other translations are mostly pedestrian, when they are not

sheer doggerel” (xx). On the other hand, Sundaram regrets saying that, “Rajaji rendered the Kural in prose, which makes the meaning crystal clear but, without the shimmer and suggestiveness of poetry” (145).

Purnalingam Pillai (1942) translated the Tirukkural into English under the title The Kural or The Maxims of Tiruvalluvar, adapting the method of poetry into prose translation. He followed the original text closely and tried “his best to convey to the reader the spirit of the author” (Foreword 12). Because, he was not very much pleased with the other translations of the Tirukkural, and expressed his displeasure in his “Foreword” to his Critical Studies in Kural (1924) as, “there is no doubt that each edition (translation) is good in its own way. But all the translators, European and Indian, have closely followed Parimelalagar’s commentary with all its defects” (v). S.N. Kandaswamy, in his article “Tirukkural in English,” comments that “the **translation of** Purnalingam Pillai, being unique in its own way . . . with his sound knowledge in the source and target languages, has attempted to present the substance of the couplets in well-**chosen**

words” (The Hindu, 13 Mar 2001. Web. 20 Feb 2011).

In the history of Thirukkural translation, Pope is the first one who translated all the couplets of the Tirukkural into English. Aiyar is the first native scholar who translated all the couplets of the Tirukkural into English.

Though many translators have translated the Tirukkural into English, no translator or reader seems to be satisfied with any of the translations. While discussing the translations of the

Tirukkural, V.V. Raman says, “None of these conveys the pithy potency of the original. Indeed, no translation can”(Introduction 13). So, there is every possibility of the upcoming of more and more translations of the Tirukkural into English.

## **2.2 One Hundred Poems of Kabir (Trans. by Rabindranath Tagore)**

The poet Kabîr, is one of the most interesting personalities in the history of Indian mysticism. Born in or near Benares, of Mohammedan parents, and probably about the year 1440, he became in early life a disciple of the celebrated Hindu ascetic Râmânanda.

Though little is known of the life of the 15th-century Indian poet and mystic Kabir, it is believed he was born in or near Benares. He grew up in a family of Muslim weavers before becoming a disciple of the Hindu ascetic Ramananda. Kabir is considered both a Sufi and Brahmin saint.

### **2.2.1 Major Works**

Although his poems and sayings are considered foundational to the development of religious thought throughout India, Kabir is believed to have been illiterate and thus unable to record in writing his own thoughts and ideas. The vocabulary of his poetry is rough and unpolished; the metrical forms reflect the popular dialects of the uneducated masses who came to revere him. His disdain for sacred Brahmanic language is seen in the lack of literary ornamentation of his works. The authorship of the large number of works attributed to Kabir cannot be verified with any degree of certainty, but it is believed that they were probably recorded by disciples during and following Kabir's lifetime. These works are found in four compilations. The first to attract the notice of Western scholars was the Bijak (“Account”), which was compiled after his death by members of the Kabirpanth. It was considered the most important of his religious teachings.



second volume, known as the Granth (“Book”), was assembled at the outset of the seventeenth century and became the sacred writings of the Sikh religion. The Pamcvānīs is a collection of sayings of five important teachers of the day, including Kabir. Finally, the Sarbangī, a compilation attributed to Rajjab, a later Indian poet, also includes a collection of Kabir's verse; it remains unpublished, however. Kabir's works have been translated and edited numerous times since the nineteenth and the early twentieth centuries. They are characterized by popular literary forms such as padas—short, rhymed poems adapted from religious use from folksongs—and dohas—popular dialect lyrical writings sung or recited by the common people.

### **2.2.2 Critical Reception**

As influential as they have been in his native India, Kabir's works are not particularly well known to Western readers. In large part this is due to a lack of English translations of his verse and teachings. For much of the twentieth century, the primary translation available was the 1914

edition by Indian poet Rabindranath Tagore. American critic Paul Carroll notes that in this edition Kabir's words sound Victorian, “sober and didactic.” By contrast, Carroll praises the appearance in the late 1970s of an edition of Kabir's works translated by American poet Robert Bly, in which the Indian poet's voice is that of “an ecstatic, generous saint.” Carroll further comments that in the Bly rendition, the poems are “clear and direct and mean exactly what they say.” Charlotte Vaudeville contends that it is inaccurate to portray Kabir “as an apostle of religious tolerance and of Hindu-Muslim reconciliation,” noting that what the tolerance critics read into Kabir's teachings is “a kind of rationalism which rejects absolutely every revelation based on an authority extrinsic to the human soul.” She acknowledges that “the greatest hurdle to be confronted by Kabirian scholars is the lingering uncertainty about the relative value and degree of authenticity to be accorded to any given verse.” Commentator David C. Scott writes that Kabir's “immense popularity throughout the Indian subcontinent is due as much to his mystical perceptions as to his maverick nature.”

### **2.2.3 Songs of Kabir:**

Songs of Kabir is a 1915 book consisting of 100 poems of Kabir, translated to English by Rabindranath Tagore. In this work Kabir has combined the philosophies of Sufism and Hinduism. The book had an introduction by Evelyn Underhill who assisted Tagore in writing the translation work and was published by Macmillan, New York. This book has been translated to Persian and Kurdish languages as well.

Kabir's poetry draws on both Hinduism and Islam, though he was critical of certain aspects of both faiths. Some of his verses are included in the compilation of Sikh scriptures known as the Adi Granth. His mystical poems are grounded in the details and earthly particulars of everyday

life. Poet Mary Karr, featuring one of Kabir's poems in the "Poet's Choice" column in the Washington Post, noted that "Kabir lists 'birds and animals and the ant' in a way that draws the eye from the soaring sky to the earth's crawly, exoskeletal creatures. In doing so he connects a vague, blank heaven and the tiny, miraculous particulars."

#### 2.2.4 Tagore and Kabir

Of all translations from Indian texts, Rabindranath Tagore's volume, *One Hundred Poems of Kabir*, which appeared in 1915, has been the most influential on the image of Indian culture and literature, both inside and outside the subcontinent. Tagore's translations of poems by Kabir are

strictly speaking, not based on a Hindi original. Tagore suggested to Kshiti Mohan Sen to collect and publish poems attributed to Kabir and Dadu from the traditions of wandering sadhus. From 1910–11 Sen published several such volumes, collected from both textual and oral sources, and **translated them into Bengali. 1 Tagore's translation into English of a sample of 100 verses from**

this edition was the first rendition of bhakti poetry into English that was well-known outside India. Earlier translations of poems from the Bijak – the collection in use by the Kabirpanthi sect – such as by Rev. Ahmad Shah of 1917, remained for the most part only known to an Indian audience. 2 By 1916, when Tagore published his Kabir translations, he had acquired great fame with Western audiences because of the transcreations of his own Bengali poetry in the Geetanjali, which led to his Nobel Prize in 1913. This established his fame with a worldwide audience and lent him the aura of a poet who expressed a modern, romantic form of religiosity that his readers came to associate with Indian spirituality. In contrast, his Bengali poetry had a much more **modernist and secular ring for his home audience. Tagore's presentation of the Kabir poems is**

not directly connected with his English or Bengali poetry, although there is an evident compatibility in the philosophical and religious outlook it represents. The Hindi originals used by Sen are published by H.P. Dwivedi in an appendix to his major monograph on Kabir. 3 A comparison of the Hindi text with **Tagore's translations reveals that the poet did not intend to** make free interpretations but follows the original closely. Tagore clearly recognized his own voice in the Hindi poems and uses the persona of Kabir to convey religious themes that resonate **with those in his own work. For a Western reader of Tagore's translation, the tone of universal** spirituality in the selection of Kabir songs and in the introduction by Evelyn Underhill will have struck a familiar chord. With his Kabir translations Tagore created a text that reached out to audiences in the West and in India and invited different readings of this material. The great popularity of the translation made that it began to play an important role in shaping the image of Hindi literature for the various audiences inside and outside India. For a Western audience, the introductory essay by Evelyn Underhill will have provided an important framework for a reading of the Kabir verses. It frames Kabir in a context of Oriental and Western mystical preachers and poets who profess some form of universal mysticism that transcends the boundaries of cultures **or religious traditions. Underhill emphasizes Kabir's humble origins** – the simple craftsman who **addressed the people in the "popular Hindi"** – and his syncretic message that fused the mystical traditions of Hinduism and Islam. She mentions some familiar legends concerning the life and

the religious inspiration of Kabir and compares his unorthodox message and ecstatic rapture with that of Persian poets such as Rumi, **Hafiz and “Attar and the poetry of European mystics.”** **4**

**The** essay echoes the fascination of early twentieth-century scholars of comparative religion with the universal nature of the mystical experience, which was believed to connect Western traditions, Sufi mysticism and Vedanta. Although not referred to specifically by Underhill, the image of a humble Oriental prophet of universal spirituality was not unfamiliar to a Western audience that had already embraced the translations of the Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam by Edward Scott Fitzgerald since its first edition in 1859. The mystical poems attributed to this tentmaker will certainly have prepared the ground for the reception of the poems of the weaver, Kabir. The **reception of Tagore’s translation by a Western** audience must have affected an English reading audience in the South Asian subcontinent as well. Kabir was already an established name in South Asia, where he was revered by a range of religious communities, such as the Kabirpanthis, Dadupanthis and the Sikhs. Essential to the reception of his work in various regions was its polyphony: each group had its own Kabir to remember and its own set of verses associated with his name and authorship. The idealist message of religious unity will have had a different ring in this context, as a result of the struggle for independence and the polarization between Hindus and Muslims. The intertextuality of the many vernacular collections of poems attributed to the weaver-poet will also have interacted with a reading of the translations. Later on, these signals

**fused in the notion of Kabir as a hero of secularism. The different readings of Tagore’s** translations persisted long after the initial reception. In Western languages, the translated Kabir verses remained associated with **“Oriental wisdom” from the mouths of poets such as Rumi and Hafiz** and kept on inspiring reworkings or new translations from the Hindi originals. It may

**suffice here to mention Robert Bly’s The Kabir Book , 5 a selection from the 100 verses** translated by Tagore, redone in a more free poetic style, which Bly also applied to the translation of **Hafiz and Rumi. Another recent witness to the enduring popularity of Tagore’s rendition of**

Kabir in the West is the German translation by Shubhra Parashar, with the title: Kabir fand sich im Gesang . **6** It is surprising to see that, despite the availability of scholarly publications and translations of his work by Vaudeville **7** and others, which conveyed a much more reliable

image of the poet, the presence of Tagore's version endured, prompted by a lasting fascination with the presumed syncretic and ecstatic nature of Kabir's poetry. The fact that Tagore's

translation remains the point of departure for many new versions also shows that this side of the

reception of Kabir remained largely unaffected by the discourse within South Asia. There, the figure of Kabir, as presented by Kshiti Mohan Sen and Tagore, was soon picked up in a rapidly growing body of scholarly works, leading to the appropriation of the medieval figure by various political and communal movements. Various collections of Kabir poems were published, such as the Bjak (Seed) , which presented the Kabir poems that were known in the Kabirpanthi sect, the verses attributed to Kabir in the di granth of the Sikh community, and the collections from the milieu of the Dadupanthi sect in Rajasthan. The most important efforts towards compiling a critical edition of the latter, "Western recension" were the Kabir granthval by Shyam Sundar Das

of 1928, published by the Hindi Pracarini Sabha, 8 and the edition by P.N. Tivari of 1961. 9

Western scholars, such as Charlotte Vaudeville, based their study of the complex textual transmission and the contents of this remarkable body of vernacular poetry on these sources.

Winand Callewaert 10 and Gurinder Singh Mann 11 took the attempts to compile a critical edition of the earliest extant sources further by collecting numerous older manuscripts and comparing the reading of the Kabir verses in them. This research demonstrated that it is very difficult, if not impossible, to reconstruct an "authentic" corpus of Kabir poetry. The early

manuscripts already show a large variety of readings and many poems that seem to have been added under the name of Kabir. Most of the poems selected by Tagore cannot be found in early sources and entered the corpus of Kabir poetry in a late stage of the transmission of his works. Simultaneously, studies on the life of the poet revealed that it is difficult to find evidence of the historical Kabir among the many hagiographical legends. During the 1920s and 30s, Hindi was increasingly made into the cultural medium of the Hindu nationalist movement, which also led to a construction of the historiography of the modern language and literature. In this process,

Tagore's translation remained an important source of inspiration. Early Hindi scholars were

inspired by the spirit of secular syncretism that many readers found in the verses of Kabir. While the first historiography of Hindi literature by Ramchandra Shukla (1882-1942) <sup>12</sup> was mildly appreciative of the contribution of Kabir and sant poetry to medieval Indian culture and religion, later scholars adopted him with more enthusiasm. The imposing presence of Tagore was also felt in that context. The author and scholar Hazari Prasad Dwivedi (1907–79) was deeply inspired by his meetings with Tagore, an experience he compared to the legendary initiation of Kabir by Ramanand. Monika Horstmann describes how this defining moment inspired Dwivedi to write a **lengthy study on Kabir and to use the motif of this initiation in various novels.** <sup>13</sup>

translations mark an important moment in the creation of an image of Indian culture through translation. They sparked a strong interest in the poetry of Kabir, in both a Western and Indian audience and brought to the fore two phenomena that have become two structural elements of the field of Hindi literature which the present paper sets out to analyze further: the mediating role of writers-cum-translators, and the tension between the image of India projected in translations or essay writing and primary literary texts. When a poet/writer is also a translator and reaches out to two different audiences, mediating images of Indian literature and culture between the two, there

**is always a nexus between the author's own creative work and his role as translator and mediator.** Rather than dismissing this connection as a coincidence of two talents, the present paper argues for a more structural link between the two forms of literary agency. The social and political context in which Hindi writing came into being created that nexus and, in so doing, compelled the author to mediate between different languages and audiences. This mediation gave rise to tension between, on the one hand, writing in an Indian language and finding an authentic voice for modern Hindi literature and, on the other hand, translating or commenting in a foreign

– often English – tongue in the face of the oppressive presence of forms and genres of modern Western literature. These two forms of literary activity come together in the practice of writing essays and critical reviews in English that deal with the position of Hindi writing in modern Indian culture, some instances of which will be discussed below. The case of the translation of Kabir verses by Tagore demonstrates how translating Indian poetry into English had the effect of inciting alternative readings with an ideological emphasis that was not felt in the original context. This prompted reflection on the place of the Hindi originals in an imagined vernacular literary landscape, as has been done by a large number of Hindi scholars. For a Western audience, this dimension was not relevant as they stood too far from the vernacular versions of **Kabir's poetry**. Without proposing that it all started with the Kabir translations, it will be argued

**here that Tagore's agency as both a poet and a translator provided an influential model for a**

literary habitus characterized by reaching out to two sides at once through translations or essaywriting in English and by mediating between various areas of reception. As will be shown below, this agency has become a common element in the practice of creative writing in Hindi.

### **2.2.5 Shift, dialogue and tension**

Translations and essays in English by Indian authors address, to a large extent, an audience within India or the Indian community in diaspora, and are only indirectly directed at a Western audience. Yet, the very act of reaching out seems to create a tension that makes the translators

**want to convey not just the literary content of the original, but also a sense of its “Indianness”. It**

emphasizes aspects of the Hindi originals that are not so much part of their internal semantic program but of the discourse on the validation of Indian literature. It almost seems as if the esthetic parameters that define the literary text in its own vernacular realm stand at some distance from those that define the value of text in the external, English discourse. The act of translating or mediating a text forces the definition of an Indianness that shifts towards monologic views of Indian culture, rather than to celebrating its dialogism and polyphony. The emphasis on the notion of Indianness as a parameter for quality and purity has a long history in the discourse of Hindi writing. Following the nationalist agenda to promote sanskritized Hindi as the main medium for a free Indian nation, the hybridity of premodern vernacular literature and the strong influence of Urdu prose on early modern writing in Hindi became more and more de-emphasized. In the historiography of medieval poetry this ideological perspective led to

**emphasizing the Hindu religiosity of bhakti and the projection of a benevolent “Indian”**

syncretism on the hybrid poetry of Sufi and sant poets. The Kabir translations of Tagore were never part of the nationalist project of constructing a literary past for Hindi. The literary Bengali milieu around Tagore did not need justification by connecting with a presumed golden past.

**Bengali’s status as a modern vernacular medium was firmly established, and it had no aspirations to play a role at a national level. In Tagore’s translations of Kabir, the syncretic element is**

perhaps not inspired by a nationalist ideal of Indianness but rather by his own philosophical spirit. In the practice of translating and presenting a specimen of Indian poetry to a Western audience, Tagore seems not immune to the tendency to diminish the inherently ambivalent religious outlook of the original verse for a syncretic interpretation of Kabir that takes away much of the dialogical acuity of the Hindi poem. 14 An example from his Kabir translations will illustrate this.

I. 63. Avadh, my taj na j

Tell me, Brother, how can I renounce Maya?

When I gave up the tying of ribbons, still I tied my garment about me:



When I gave up tying my garment, still I covered my body in its folds.  
 So, when I give up passion, I see that anger remains;  
 And when I renounce anger, greed is with me still;  
 And when greed is vanquished, pride and vainglory remain;  
 When the mind is detached and casts Maya away, still it clings to the letter.  
**Kabîr says, “Listen to me, dear Sadhu! the true path is rarely found.” 15**

The overall reading by Tagore is correct, but it fails to render some of the subtleties that make this verse a telling example of the semantic possibilities inherent to the genre of Kabir poetry. One thing that immediately strikes the reader is that Tagore uses a much more internalized voice

**than the somewhat impersonal and formulaic tone of the original. Tagore’s Kabir is, in that respect, much more a persona for the translator’s own voice.**

The different voicing has also other effects. In the ek , the line that gives the poem its motto, **Tagore inserts the “brother” from the last line. In the Hindi verse, the poet does not ask the bh**

sdhu – a fellow sadhu – for advice, but makes him see that he is still misled by the outward observance of austerity that keeps him in the stranglehold of my . A crucial line in the poem is the fourth verse, which indicates that only he who is a baigr of the mind ( man ) and becomes **engrossed in the inward recitation of the divine “word,” can get rid of my . This is the gam** only a few will ever understand, certainly not the avadh , the conventional sadhu addressed in both the fifth line and in the ek . The correct etymology of gam in the last line is most likely Sanskrit

**gamyā , “entrance,” “opening,” “insight”. It may have a double meaning of “path” here, though (see Hind abd sgar , s.v. gam ). In Tagore’s translation, the “solution” gets somewhat lost: he**

takes the fourth line as a continuation of the description of the impossibility to get rid of my and misses the meaning **of the second half verse. The poem in Tagore’s translation ends in a** somewhat diffuse reflection, instead of the strong punching end of the Hindi text. The most noticeable difference between the translation and the original is that the former makes the poem speak in a monologic voice. Unfortunately, the Hindi poem is much more complex, as it wraps its message in a mix of different voices and idiolects. First, there is the voice of the pious Kabir,

who lectures his fellow sadhu using the rhetorical convention of a doctrinal lesson in the context of a community of sadhus, not unlike a sutra. The lesson is much more radical than appears at first hand, though. Kabir warns his fellow sadhu that he will achieve nothing by following the

outward practices of sadhu-hood without heeding the divine word inside. The lesson calls for a radical departure from the discourse of asceticism. The man bairg , who is able to become free **from my, has reached a state where there is no “correct” approach to yoga, but where the** whole concept loses its meaning. In this reading, the address to the avadh and the sadhu are much more cynical and almost mocking, because the poet who addresses his fellow sadhu has himself already given up on such practices. One can even distinguish a third voice that uses a sort of shadow language, where all the terms used that seem to refer to the Hindu practices of yoga and moka can also be understood, in a nirgu context, as descriptive of stages in the trajectory of the mystic. There is even the suggestion that the verse refers to Sufi terminology. The term man bairg reads like a neologism in bhakti poetry and could just as well also refer to the Sufi concept of becoming absorbed in zikr, the recitation of the name of God, certainly when connected with the notion expressed in abd me surat sam. Similarly, the word gam has many layers: it is the

**insight into the nature of God, but the alternative etymology of “path” is also there, as a similarity in sound to the gham of Persian poetry: the lovers’ suffering for the beloved.**

Similarly **polyphonic is the term abd : Tagore’s solution** – the letter – is the weakest. It is more evocative **to connect it with the divine word ( kun ) that initiated God’s creation and that has become**

interiorized in man but needs to be rediscovered by true insight. These possibilities inspire concurrent readings of the poem without an indication of an inherent hierarchy. Such is the semantic ambivalence and richness associated with the rhetorical persona of Kabir. The secret of the poem is that there is no hierarchy of voices and that the transition from the conventional **pious address to the sadhu to the “nihilist,” or the Sufi reading is a very subtle twist that relies on**

a slight change of perspective. The alternation between the different voices is the rhetorical tool of the sant poet, using the inherent hybridity of the cultural context in which its aesthetics developed. Its hybridity also reinforces its doctrinal message: it is the sign of the true man bairg that he can decipher the call to listen to the god within, no matter how it is phrased.

### 2.2.6 Lost voices

It would be very hard for a translation in English to convey the semantic polyphony of the Hindi text, and one cannot blame Tagore for having missed out on some of it. What is more telling here is that the English poem fits a more monologic Kabir – the prophet of religious unity – or the icon of secularism that he became in post-Independence India. In this transformation, the

polyphony and heteroglossia of the premodern vernacular literature that shaped the poetical persona of sant poets such as Kabir, was irretrievably lost. Central in the transformation described here is the agency of authors and poets as translators or mediators to an English speaking audience. This agency is equally present in modern literature in Hindi. It is not possible here to discuss the entire history of Hindi literature to demonstrate this, but it may suffice here to **jump ahead from the 1920's to postIndependence Hindi writing and compare** the habitus involved in reaching out to two audiences that is evident in some of this literature.

## 2.3 Sangam Poems

Only certain kinds of poetry that rely too much on wordplay and the sound of words will resist successful translation, but poems primarily depending upon profound imagery as well as aphoristic utterances will come through without much difficulty. Characterised as they are by concision, striking imagery, and rolling rhythms, Sangam poems do pose a challenge to the translator. Yet, where translators have failed, the reasons will have to be sought in their own shortcomings such as poor acquaintance with the original and wrong choice of the idiom.

Though numerous native scholars and western aficionados have attempted to render in English select poems from Sangam anthologies, G.U. Pope, A.K. Ramanujan and George L. Hart represent three types of translation, each with its own idiosyncratic features that accounted for their merits as well as limitations. On his part, Pope contents himself very often with paraphrases. It is his fondness for rhymes that lets him down and, at times, even forces him to introduce a descriptive phrase or a metaphor not found in the original. As for Ramanujan, he scrupulously avoids Victorian English and chooses today's English, which remains his forte. It is largely through his efforts that Sangam poetry acquired a global reputation. His characteristic style is to break the poem in accordance with the ideas conveyed and the objects described and, then, to indent one part or two parts, depending upon their relative importance. But if his readers are not acquainted with the original, they may be misled into believing that some of the typical techniques of modern poetry employed by him are of the Sangam pieces.

Hart and Heifetz consciously defined themselves against Ramanujan as they valiantly attempt to recapture the rhythmic grandeur of the original Tamil pieces. Being a poet, Heifetz (with whose collaboration Hart has done the work) knows that, "Tamil language runs like a river — long words, rapid speech, accumulating syllables." And their translation, therefore, attempts "to communicate the feel of these rolling rhythms," although "sometimes straining against the bounds of English syntax."

### **Purananuru:**

There are some 'arruppatai' or guide-songs in the two anthologies, Purananuru and Patirrupattu. In these, the bard, either a musician or dancer or actor (panan, virali or kuttan) who has received gifts from a generous patron guides another bard suffering from poverty and directs him to the

same patron for help. Descriptions of the way to the city of the patron and praises of his endearing qualities abound in such guidesongs. In Purananuru, there are seven poems as guide-songs of the musicians, four of the women dancers, and three of the literary artists. Patirruppattu contains one guide-song of the musician and five of the women dancers. All of them are in accordance with the exposition of Tolkappiyanar regarding the form of such songs."

The elegies in Purananuru are frankly personal and are high tributes to the dead patrons and friends. A few of them extended to be poems of some philosophical significance. They are the outpourings of the emotions of the poets who were so much attached to the patrons. In these elegies we do not find such similitude of a shepherd mourning for a companion as we have in the pastoral elegies in western literature. These elegies in Tamil are genuine and spontaneous. There is no artificiality in them. They express intimate and personal grief. They cannot be charged of artificiality as in Milton's *Lycidas*. Like Tennyson's *In Memoriam* the ancient Tamil elegy speaks in its own character and calls things by real instead of allegorical names. We need not penetrate a disguise to feel the poet's personal grief. The ancient Tamil elegies are entirely free from any conventional bucolic machinery.

There is one peculiarity to be noted in these anthologies. Whenever the poets wanted to express their gratitude to their royal patrons, or their admiration of the generosity and valour of some chieftains, they did so through their compositions on 'Puram' theme, the theme intended for these. Besides this, they also made use of their poems on Akam to introduce the glory of their patrons by way of comparison or by mentioning their mountains or forests as background for the drama of love depicted in such poems.

The scandal about the association of the hero with a harlot is said to be more widespread than the joyous uproar of the army of the Pandiya king when it defeated and chased the armies of the two enemy kings in the battle at Kutral.<sup>20</sup> In an apostrophe to the north wind, the lady companion says that the wind which now during the separation of the lover causes so much distress to the heroine will disappear when the lover returns home. Therein she mentions that the north wind will then run away like the nine chieftains who were defeated in a single day by the great Cola king, Karikalan and who ran away leaving all their nine umbrellas in the battlefield at Vakai. In another stanza the lady companion consoles the distressed heroine that there is no room for any

suffering and assures her that the hero will never desert her to seek wealth even if it amounts to possession of the Elil hills of Konkana Nannan.

Some of these poems have long and elaborate descriptions of the achievements of partons and give the impression that though they are on Akam theme, the aim of the poet was only to praise the achievements of their patrons and that the theme of love served as a formula or means to serve this purpose. But it is not always so. As Dr. K. K. Pillai observes, 23 "it had become almost a convention with the poets of that age to portray the feelings or reactions of lovers by instituting comparisons with prominent political occurrences. The wide popularity which they had attained provided the temptation for the poets to import them into their comparisons so as to make the descriptions impressive and realistic."

The commentators of Tolkappiyam interpret `nurpa' No. 155 in "Porulatikaram" so as to admit and explain such introduction of the glory and attainments of the partons in poems on the theme of love. The ancient poets were well known for their self-respect and dignity and they felt it very delicate to approach a chieftain and directly ask him for a gift. But they found it agreeable to please them by singing the glory of his ancestors or his own achievements or praising the beauty or fertility of his mountains and forests, and thus indirectly indicate to him their request for his gift. They found this a useful device to serve their purpose as direct asking did not suit their sense of honour. This is evident from the poem of Mocikiranar in Purananuru, wherein he stated "It is difficult for me to ask you for a gift. But I find it easier to praise the Konperunkanam hills of yours."

Even Kapilar, who was more a close friend than a court poet of the great patron Pari, has written more lines in praise of his Parampu hills than those on the patron himself.

### **2.3.1 Ponmutiyar : “Purananuru 312” (Trans. by A.K.Ramanujan)**

To bring forth and rear a son is my duty.

To make him noble is the father's.

To make spears for him is the blacksmith's.

To show him good ways is the king's.

And to bear

a bright sword and do battle,

to butcher enemy elephants,

and come back:

**that is the young man's duty.**

#### **2.3.1.1 A.K. Ramanujan, the Tamil scholar – (1929-1993)**

Dr. Ramanujan was born in 1929 to Tamil parents in Mysore. He got his early education in Mysore. He got his Ph.d. in linguistics from Indiana University in 1962. He taught at the University of Chicago from 1962, and lived in Chicago until he died in 1993. He also taught at other U.S. universities including Harvard, University of Wisconsin, University of Michigan, University of California at Berkeley, and Carlton College. In 1976, the government of India awarded him the 'Padmashri' title. He was a scholar in Tamil, Kannada, Telugu and Sanskrit.

He wrote incredibly beautiful English poems. His translations of Sangam Tamil poems have no equal. They help us unlock Sangam poems. His passion for Sangam poems was special, as we can see from his writings. He has taught Sangam Tamil to scholars George Hart, Kamil Zvelebil and many others.

His wife Dr. Molly Daniels Ramanujan has authored many books. Ramanujan credits her for his translations, in his books, 'The Interior Landscape', and 'Poems of Love and War'. This book has helped many of us get started in our Sangam poetry learning process. His translations are gems.

#### **2.3.1.2 Ramanujan's views on Sangam poems:**

“Tamil, one of the two classical languages of India, is the only language of contemporary India which is recognizably continuous with a classical past”.

**“These poem are ‘classical,’ i.e., early, ancient; they are also ‘classics,’ i.e., works that have stood the test of time, the founding works of a whole tradition. Not to know them is not to know a unique and major poetic achievement of Indian civilization”.**

**“In their antiquity and in their contemporaneity, there is not much else in any Indian literature equal to these quiet and dramatic Tamil poems. In their values and stances, they represent a mature classical poetry: passion is balanced by courtesy, transparency by ironies and nuances of design, impersonality by vivid detail, leanness of line by richness of implication. These poems are not just the earliest evidence of Tamil genius. The Tamils, in their 2,000 years of literary effort, wrote nothing better”.**

Over a period of about forty years A. K. Ramanujan pursued three distinct but simultaneous careers, each of which was sufficiently productive, successful, and unique to seem like a full-time occupation. His primary vocation was that of a bilingual poet and intermittent fiction writer in English and Kannada, the languages in which he published six books of poetry and one of prose in his lifetime. Of these, *The Striders* (1966), *Relations* (1971), *Selected Poems* (1976), and *Second Sight* (1985) established him as perhaps the most consistent and memorable poet in the history of Indian English literature, whereas *Hokkulalli Huvilla* (Haikai; 1969) and *Mattu Itara Padyagalu* (And Other Poems; 1977), both collections of poems, together with *Mattobbana Atmakate* (Mattobbana's Autobiography; 1978), a novella, distinguished him as an innovative writer in contemporary Kannada. At the time of his sudden death in mid-1993 Ramanujan was working on two new volumes of poetry, one each in English and Kannada, and had begun tentatively planning his collected poems in English.

Ramanujan's second career was his professional occupation as a teacher and scholar in several disciplines, first in India through most of the 1950s, in colleges in Baroda, Belgaum, Madurai, Pune, and Quilon, and then in the United States after 1960, where, apart from his doctoral studies at Indiana University and brief periods at institutions like Carleton College and the University of Michigan, he worked at the University of Chicago. In the classroom and in his scholarly articles, formal lectures, and conference papers, he ranged with effortless expertise over linguistics, anthropology, the history of religions, folklore, and literary studies, usually covering several South Asian, British, American, and European discursive traditions. His interdisciplinary critical and interpretive engagements resulted in a number of influential articles in the last ten years



alone, including "The Indian Oedipus" (1983), "Telling Tales" (1989), "Where Mirrors Are Windows" (1989), "Toward a Counter-System: Women's Tales" (1991), and "Three Hundred Ramayanas" (1991).

Bridging Ramanujan's literary and scholarly careers was his third vocation over four decades, as a translator who brought together an unparalleled variety of languages, texts, genres, literatures, historical periods, and past and present cultures. He translated literary works mainly from Kannada and Tamil into English, but also, less extensively, from English into Kannada and, with the help of collaborators, from Malayalam, Telugu, Marathi, and Sanskrit into English. He focused his attention on verse as well as prose, rendering epic and classical poetry from the ancient period (chiefly works composed between about 500 B.C. and 500 A.D.), early and late poetic texts from the middle period (from the eighth to the eighteenth centuries), and poems, short stories, novelistic fiction, and numerous folktales from the modern period (the nineteenth and twentieth centuries). His translations appeared in books, edited anthologies, and periodicals, usually delighting and transforming his readers with the material and the quality of the renderings and displacing existing bodies of writing in English in unexpected ways and sometimes to a radical extent.

During his lifetime Ramanujan's reputation as one of the world's great modern translators, especially of poetry, grew around seven finely crafted books. *The Interior Landscape* (1967) and *Poems of Love and War* (1986) contained selections of his English versions of classical Tamil sangam poetry; both included scholarly commentary on the language and culture of the original texts, but the latter offered a larger and more representative body of work and a more comprehensive critical account of the tradition. *Speaking of Siva* (1973) brought together Ramanujan's translations of more than 200 vacanas or "sayings" by four major bhaktas or saint-poets in the "countercultural" Virasaiva religious tradition in Kannada, from the early centuries of this millennium. *Hymns for the Drowning: Poems for Visnu by Nammalvar* (1981) consisted of Ramanujan's renderings of nearly ninety poems by a tenth-century Tamil saint-poet in the very different Srivaisnava bhakti tradition, complementing in language, religious orientation, and poetic quality his versions of the Kannada vacanas in *Speaking of Siva*.

In historical and textual contrast, in *Song of the Earth and Other Poems* (1975) Ramanujan and his collaborator M. G. Krishnamurthy brought together their versions of selected poems by

Gopalakrishna Adiga, the Kannada "modernist" poet whom his admirers regarded as "India's greatest living poet" in the early post-Independence decades. In *Samskara: A Rite for a Dead Man* (1976, 1978) Ramanujan produced a version of U. R. Anantha Murthy's existentialist 1965 Kannada novel, which was made into an award-winning, controversial film in 1970. Moving away from high culture and touching on a new boundary of translation in the last years of his life, Ramanujan presented in *Folktales from India* (1991) his retellings and edited versions in English prose of nineteenth- and twentieth-century oral narratives from twenty-two Indian languages. With the exception of Adiga's *Song of the Earth*, which appeared from the small Writers Workshop press in Calcutta, all these books have been remarkably successful in the international literary marketplace, reaching sizable communities of students and scholars as well as general readers interested in Indian literature.

Ramanujan's output as a translator, however, was not restricted to the seven book-length works I have just described. Between the mid-1960s and the early 1990s he also published a substantial quantity of material in other forms, translated either independently or with collaborators, which consists primarily of various kinds of twentieth-century Indian texts. This body of publications includes, for example, modern Malayalam poems, rendered with K. M. George, in the Indian Council of Cultural Relations' three-volume *Indian Poetry Today* (1980); modern Telugu poems, translated with V. Narayana Rao, as well as modern Kannada and Tamil poems, translated independently.

At the time of his death from cardiac arrest during minor surgery, Ramanujan left behind several other translated works in various stages of completion. *When God Is a Customer*, a small book cotranslated and coauthored with V. Narayana Rao and David Shulman, forthcoming from the University of California Press, offers a selection of Telugu bhakti poems by several poets from the mystic-erotic temple tradition of the late middle period of southern Indian literary history. *The Oxford Anthology of Modern Indian Poetry* (1994), published by Oxford University Press, which he coedited with me between about 1984 and 1992, brings together poems by 125 twentieth-century poets writing in fifteen Indian languages and in English, most of them translated by over sixty contemporary translators, including Ramanujan's versions of more than thirty recent Kannada, Tamil, Telugu, and Malayalam poems. In addition, his files contain draft manuscripts from the 1970s of a selection of "prose poems" by the early-twentieth-century Tamil

poet Subramania Bharati, as well as a substantial selection of poems by more than twenty post-Independence Kannada poets, both of which he had hoped to publish as books. During the last few years of his life Ramanujan also tried to complete one of his longest-term projects, A Flowering Tree and Other Kannada Folktales, a large collection of orally narrated stories that he had recorded, transcribed, and translated over three decades of fieldwork in Karnataka.

### 2.3.2 Auvaiyar : “Purananuru 93” (Trans. by George L Hart)

In the forward march of battle, with the royal drum enwrapped in  
thongs roaring, how can there be any victory left to be won? They came  
but could not stand against your vanguard. They scattered and they ran!

Kings without majesty, they evaded what would have been done  
had their deaths come naturally, of sickness, and their bodies  
taken to be laid out on ever green grass of the finest kind by  
Brahmins schooled in the Four Vedas and the principles of  
Righteousness, who would have then **chanted, “Go to where the  
great warriors go!** those who wear their splendid war anklets,  
those who have died

**in a good battle and kept faith in their manhood!” and forgetting**

any love they may have had for them, they would have then wounded  
the bodies with the sword so as to free them of sin and buried them. But  
no! Because you, great and wonderful! slaying, scattering the battle  
around you as elephants fell on the killing field, the juices of their  
musth flowing into their mouths where dragonflies  
were humming, you sustained a noble wound while you were charging forward!

#### 2.3.2.1 George L. Hart

Translating ancient Tamil poems for earlier collections, George L. Hart and A. K. Ramanujan have spoken of them as poems of "love and war" for their volumes, equating "aham" with "love". Hart and Heifetz have gone for an elegant variation: Songs of War and Wisdom.

This does not mean a banishment of love from Purananuru, as the present translation of this classical Tamil anthology demonstrates several situations of loving togetherness in emotive contexts.

In fact there are three kinds of love in Tamil, says the note for verse 92: "Kaathal", romantic love; "anpu", the love one feels for those one is familiar with; and "arul," the disinterested love the ascetics feel towards everyone. Here, "arul" signifies the paternal love a father feels for a child.

This poem of Avvaiyar about Neduman Anji comes off with a crystalline movement in the translation, as indeed most of the poems in this fine production are. Apart from those who do not know Tamil language, even the Tamilian who is not able to go through his old Tamil text with ease, will find the book a wonderful reading experience. Not always pleasant, though.

For, the society-sanctioned violence against women makes one wonder how the Tamil culture could behave so crudely towards one half of the populace. There is the shameful chief, Nannan, who "had a young girl executed because she ate a mango fruit that fell from his royal guarded tree into the water near where she was swimming."

From many of the poems of male heroism we also gather instances of patriarchal chicanery, which made the widow's life on earth a living hell by cutting away her tresses and removing her bangles and inflicting every kind of indignity upon her body and soul.

Not surprisingly even queens preferred death to such continuous dishonour and Perunkoppendu chides those around her for not allowing her to commit "sati" (verse 246):

All you noble men with your perverse planning!

I am not a woman to endure eating a ball of boiled rice

Squeezed within a hand and left lying overnight on a leaf

Without a touch of fine fragrant ghee pale as the seeds

From a curving cucumber striped like a squirrel and split

Open with a sword, or to eat food of steamed velai leaves,

Nor am I one to sleep without a mat, upon a bed of stones!"

This is indeed dire wisdom to answer the war on women by the male of the species in ancient Tamil Nadu. The glory of battle heroism apart, there is a lot of administrative wisdom in the Purananuru. Poets are to be honoured, the common people guarded gently and taxation should be resorted to judiciously. With the foundation scholarship provided by the priceless editions of U. Ve. Swaminatha Iyer and Avvai Duraiswami Pillai, the translators have done well to probe the indeterminate texts in the anthology and have provided copious notes as well along with some new interpretations.

There is nothing in this translated version to indicate that we are dealing with songs that were probably sung to the accompaniment of a lute by the Panar. Perhaps the poems in the Purananuru are themselves not oral, says Hart as "the text is often far too complex to have been extemporized." Poetic conceits and resonant words are avoided. The summaries of the original poems are well done in a down-to-earth language, but the Tamil images are so original that the poetic *ilan* is unmistakably present as in the "handsome nuts curved like the massive horns of a buffalo" or in Peruncittirana's wish "that I die in the spiralling of this whirlpool of pain."

Perhaps there is a real danger to old Tamil texts, now that large tracts from them are getting translated into English. We who have studied English literature have given up our *Beowulf* and the Venerable Bede, now that they are available in modern English translation.

**In this work, George Hart's lucid introduction provides a solid scholarly grounding for the collection, both situating it historically and exploring it thematically.** Hank Heifetz, speaking as a poet, explains that the original Tamil "runs like a river—long words, rapid speech, accumulating syllables—and these translations (sometimes straining against the bounds of English syntax) attempt to communicate something of the feel of these rolling rhythms." The translations not only attempt this formidable task, but succeed in it beautifully."

The volume that Hart and Heifetz have produced has another distinctive excellence as well. Since it is a translation of the one surviving complete anthology among the eight anthologies of

**the Tamil Sangam corpus, it presents the literature as the culture's own redactors presented it—it**

"translates" not just the individual poems, but the anthology itself. Thus Hart and Heifetz

challenge the reader not only to savor the individual poems, but also to experience and consider them as parts of the larger work within which they were collected and preserved.

And what poems! They are complex, detailed, multivalent, evocative of both inner and outer experiences. More than 150 poets, with at least ten women among them, join to create a work in which, as Hart says, the poets can be found variously "advising kings, addressing moral issues, or lamenting the instability of the world." The result is an anthology that indeed "provides a mirror for the society that produced it and for subsequent life in South India." We are indebted to Hart and Heifetz for recreating this mirror so skilfully in our own place and time.

## **2.5 ILANGO ADIGAL : “VAZHAKURAI KAATHAI” (SILAPATHIKARAM TRANS.BY R. PARTHASARATHY)**

Cilappatikaram, or the story of Kovalan and Kannaki, is the most important literary work of the Tamils of South India. Furthermore, this ancient story, in many forms, is well known among many other Dravidian cultures of South India and some parts of Southeast Asia. Sometimes it is surprising to know that this small story could have been so influential in dominating the literary trends of the ancient Tamils.

It is unfortunate that the rich and ancient epic traditions of India have been recognized only through the Sanskrit epic traditions of the subcontinent. This could be due to the highly influential classical literary paradigm of Indian society, and to the ideologies it projected. However, in the present literary context the perpetuation of such paradigms can be attributed to backwardness and ignorance. This kind of rigid acceptance of the classical paradigm also misled scholars who completely ignored the cultural diversity of India and did not care to recognize or study the less-known epic traditions of this vast country. Therefore the Sanskrit epics such as the Ramayana and the Mahabharata naturally became the epitome of the mighty ancient epic traditions of India. The less-known epic traditions, including literary and semi-literary epics such as the Cilappatikaram of the Tamil regions, the famous "Khamba-Thoibi" of the Tibeto-Burman speaking Meiteis of Manipur in the remote northeastern parts of India, the "Guru Gugga" of Rajasthan and the surrounding areas, the "Dhola-Maru" of the Bundel country, and many others, were completely ignored. Oral epics suffered a similar neglect. This neglect has made the subject of Indian epic discourse - both oral and written - highly blurred, and this blurriness to some extent continues even now. Scholarly attention to these and other neglected genres is a recent development, and, in my opinion, forms a kind of paradigm shift in Indian literary studies.

Only recently have some scholars tried to fill the gap caused by this utter neglect. In that sense, then, R. Parthasarathy's very scholarly translation of the Cilappatikaram is timely and a befitting tribute to the non-Sanskritic epic tradition of India. Without this scholarly translation the Cilappatikaram would have remained unknown to the English-speaking world.

The story of the Cilappatrikaram, as the translator of this nice volume rightly points out, existed in oral tradition before it was shaped first, presumably, into a ballad and then into its present epic form. It is also true that this epic does not seem to share many characteristics of the famous classical epics of India. Instead it seems embedded in folk tradition and yet fulfills the general conditions that eventually make a long song an epic. I find this phenomenon highly interesting, and as such this aspect of the Cilappatrikaram needs more attention than it has been given by epic specialists. The simple story of this epic reads just like any folktale. Consider the following summary

Kovalan and Kannaki, who belong to two prominent business families of Pukar in Tamil country, are married. They live together happily for some years. Matavi, a courtesan, is honored by the king in recognition of her talents as a great dancer. He presents her with a garland and plenty of gold. She puts the garland up for sale and announces that the buyer will be her husband. Kovalan buys the garland, abandons Kannaki, and moves to live with Matavi. During the celebrations of the spring festival there is a misunderstanding between Matavi and Kovalan, who both suspect each other of infidelity. Kovalan leaves Matavi and returns to Kannaki. By now he has lost all his wealth and become a pauper. Meanwhile Kannaki has had a terrible dream in which she sees a misfortune striking Kovalan. Together they decide to leave Pukar and move to Maturai, where they believe they might recoup their lost fortune. A pair of anklets belonging to Kannaki is the only asset they possess now. They sell one to the royal goldsmith, who examines the anklet and tells Kovalan to wait near his shop. The cunning goldsmith, who had stolen the queen's anklet and was looking for a way to cover up, hurries to the palace and report to the king that he has caught the thief who stole the queen's anklet. The king, without thorough investigation, orders the execution of the thief and the recovery of the anklet. Kovalan is executed and the news reaches Kannaki. A highly grieved Kannaki rushes to the scene of the murder and finds her husband lying in a pool of blood. She denounces the unjust king. The people of Maturai also condemn the king for his injustice. Kannaki rushes to the palace and charges the king with the murder of her husband. The king tries to defend his action. In order to prove her charge Kannaki breaks open her other anklet, out of which fall gems, thus proving the innocence of her husband since the queen's anklet contained pearls, not gems. The king is shocked, and, acknowledging his mistake, he dies. The queen follows him in death. Kannaki walks out of the palace, curses the city of Maturai, then wrenches the left breast off her body and



hurls it over the city. The city goes up in flames. Kannaki travels west until she arrives at Netuvel Hill in Ceral country, whence she proceeds to heaven in Indra's chariot. Kannaki is deified and worshipped as a goddess.

Ilanko, the author of this great epic, seems to have renounced temporal authority in favor of the spiritual, and followed the Jain path, yet he composed this great secular poem. Parthasarathy has been very careful in his translation to avoid distortion or loss of the original meaning. One of the things that I like in the style of this translation is the use of simple language and idiom devoid of the jargon of the classical metaphor. He does not even alter the form of this epic: the three books

- the erotic, the mythic, and the heroic, which are very close to the categories of traditional Tamil discourse (aham, puram, and puranam), have been translated as honestly and accurately as possible.

The Cilappatikaram in the original Tamil consists of 5,730 lines. The poem is divided into three books (kantams), and each book is, in turn, divided into cantos (katais). It is widely believed by scholars that Ilanko "took the story of Kovalan and Kannaki from the oral tradition and put it into writing" (318). Parthasarathy acknowledges that not only has oral tradition generated this epic, but many folktales have also been directly used in various chapters of this work. He also attempts to discuss certain motifs of this popular epic from a folkloristic point of view, but does not succeed because of a lack of knowledge of the tools (type, motif, and index, for example) used by folklorists to identify the elements, diffusion, and geographical distribution of tales.

Parthasarathy, in his well-written introduction and postscript, sometimes seems to be getting repeatedly involved in the debate about what is and what is not non-Aryan (Dravidian), yet he fails to outline systematically the basic characteristics of this epic that could establish it as purely Dravidian. For instance, he finds the Mahabharata and the Ramayana full of violence and religion, then says that the Cilappatikaram is highly representative of nonviolence because the "Indo-Europeans were nomadic herds people, whereas the Dravidians were tillers and settled in their way of life" (8). In the first place there is no diachronic or synchronic evidence available upon which to prove that nomadic peoples' expressive systems are always full of violence and the works of settled tillers expressive of nonviolence. In fact, war, sacrifice, violence, etc., become attributes of ballads and folk epics in times of cultural or national crises everywhere.

Maybe the Cilappatrikaram did not achieve status in the overall worldview of Tamil nationalism because it could serve the purpose of defusing national or cultural crises.

There is another way of looking at this issue. If the Mahabharata, the Ramayana, or the Iliad are seen as full of war, bloodshed, sibling rivalry, the abduction of women, disputes over land and property, etc., and that such things establish these epics as epics of violence, then the Cilappatrikaram, too, is full of extramarital relations, prostitution, theft, disputes, murder, death, suicide, fire, destruction, etc. Thus by and large it seems to share the basic characteristics of the Indo-European epic repertoire. The point is not to compare the imagined characteristics of the Aryan, Greek, or Hebrew (see pages 282-83) epics, but to define violence in the context of an epic and also realize its relationship with the culture that created that epic. Murder/death in war and murder/death in the palace are by definition violent acts and equally share the semantics of violence.

The truth is that it is hard to decide these issues on the basis of stereotypes and diachronic interpretations. Peter Edwin HOOK (1979) found literary and cultural areas in Asia (including India, China, South Asia, the Middle East, and many other countries) in which the epics - particularly in the action patterns of their heroes and heroines - exhibited amazing structural similarities. Then, in a courageous effort, he attempted to correlate this behavior with the sentence structures of the languages of these culture areas. Thus one needs to be cautious about drawing hasty conclusions regarding the racial origin of epics, particularly oral epics, without examining both the diachronic and the synchronic aspects of these complex genres.

A cursory examination of the motifs of the Cilappatrikaram and their distribution and diffusion, as Hook perhaps undertook to formalize his hypothesis, would have been highly useful to partially answer the questions Parthasarathy has raised. For example, fire and the relationship between fire and women seem as central to this epic as they are in other Indian epics, both oral and written. I have noticed that the position of women and their relationship with fire are themes that remain significant even in the present context of male-dominant Indian society, with its attitudes towards women's participation in the country's political and social management. The selection of fire by the Indian woman (who, more than the man, works with fire her whole life in her roles as housekeeper, food-creator, and food-giver) as the instrument of survival, power, purification, and [self-]destruction (agni pariksha, sati, and dowry death [i.e., bride burning])

seems even in the present age to reestablish the strength of this epic and folk metaphor and its relevance in modern Indian society.

The problem is that more often than not we tend to follow the story of an epic or its linear order even for the purpose of analysis. Epics are, indeed, fine stories, and their enjoyment necessitates following their linear development. When one's purpose is to understand them on a deeper level, however, I believe that one has to go beyond the linearity into the realm of deconstruction and paradigm-reconstruction. It is then that we may perhaps discover the collective worldview that epics try to present, and also find clues as to why epics are constructed in the first place. Obviously this cannot be the purpose of a translation. But translations of epics can certainly facilitate this kind of analysis.

The translation of this very popular epic is a scholarly gift to epic lovers and epic specialists, and as such should be, and will be, welcomed by both the literary scholar and the folklorist.

#### REFERENCE:

- Welten Süd- und Zentralasiens / Worlds of South and Inner Asia / Mondes de l'Asie du Sud et de L'Asie centrale : India in Translation through Hindi Literature : A Plurality of Voices. Berne, CH: Peter Lang AG, Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften, 2011. ProQuest ebrary. Web. 17 February 2017.
- Chaudhuri, Amit. On Tagore : Reading the Poet Today. Oxford, GB: Peter Lang AG, Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften, 2012. ProQuest ebrary. Web. 17 February 2017.
- Handoo, Jawaharlal. "The Cilappatikaram of Ilanko Atikal: An Epic of South India." Asian Folklore Studies, vol. 56, no. 2, 1997, p. 430+. Academic OneFile, [elibraryusa.state.gov/primo?url=http://go.galegroup.com/ps/i.do?p=AONE&sw=w&u=wash8946](http://go.galegroup.com/ps/i.do?p=AONE&sw=w&u=wash8946)

**UNIT – III INDIAN LITERATURE IN TRANSLATION  
(SHS5010)**

## UNIT III : DRAMA

### HAYAVADANA SUMMARY

The play opens with a **puja** to Ganesha, as **the Bhagavata** asks that Ganesha bless the performance that he and the company are about to put on. Then he places the audience in the setting of the play, Dharmapura, and begins to introduce the central characters. The first is **Devadatta**, the son of a **Brahmin** who outshines the other pundits and poets of the kingdom. The second is **Kapila**, the son of the iron-smith who is skilled at physical feats of strength. The two are the closest of friends.

As the Bhagavata sets up the story, there is a scream of terror offstage. An **actor** runs onstage screaming that he has seen a creature with a horse's head, a man's body, and the voice of a human. The Bhagavata doesn't believe him, and even when the creature (**Hayavadana**) enters, the Bhagavata thinks it is a mask and attempts to pull off Hayavadana's head. Upon realizing it's his real head, the Bhagavata listens as Hayavadana explains his origin: he is the son of a princess and a celestial being in horse form, and he is desperate to become a full man. The Bhagavata suggests he go to the temple of **Kali**, as she grants anything anyone asks for. Hayavadana sets out for the temple, hopeful that Kali will be able to change his head to a human head.

Recovering from the interruption, the Bhagavata returns to the play. He begins to sing, explaining that the two heroes fell in love with a girl and forgot themselves. Meanwhile, a **female chorus** sings in the background about the nature of love. Devadatta and Kapila enter. Devadatta explains his love for **Padmini**, explaining that he would sacrifice his arms and his head if he could marry her. Kapila at first makes fun of Devadatta but then sees how much his friend is affected by Padmini. He agrees to find out her name and where she lives.

Kapila goes to the street where Padmini lives and begins to knock on the doors. When Padmini opens the door to her home, Kapila is immediately love-struck. Padmini asks him what he wants, outwitting him as he tries to come up with reasons why he is there. He eventually explains that he is there to woo her for Devadatta. Kapila says to himself that Padmini really needs a man of steel, and that Devadatta is too sensitive for someone as quick as Padmini.

The Bhagavata reveals that Devadatta and Padmini were quickly married, and that all three remained friends. The story then jumps forward six months, when Padmini is pregnant with

a **son**, and the three friends are meant to go on a trip to Ujjain together. Devadatta expresses jealousy that Padmini seems to have some affection for Kapila, which Padmini denies. She says that she will cancel the trip so that the two of them can spend more time together, but when Kapila arrives, ready to leave, Padmini changes her mind and decides to go, much to Devadatta's dismay.

As the three of them travel together, Padmini remarks how well Kapila drives the cart. She points out a tree with the **Fortunate Lady's flower**, and Kapila rushes off to grab flowers for her. Padmini remarks to herself how muscular Kapila is, and Devadatta sees Padmini watching him with desire. When they pass the temple of Rudra and Kali, Devadatta is reminded of his old promise and sneaks away to cut off his head. Kapila goes to look for him, and upon discovering Devadatta's headless body is struck with grief. He decides to cut off his head as well.

Padmini begins to get worried about the two men and goes after them. She sees their two headless bodies on the ground and attempts to commit suicide as well. The goddess Kali stops her and tells her she will revive the men if Padmini replaces their heads on their bodies. Padmini, in her excitement, accidentally switches the two heads when she replaces them. The two men are revived: one with Devadatta's head and Kapila's body, and the other with Kapila's head and Devadatta's body.

At first, the three of them are amused by the mix-up, but when they try to return home, they discover issues. Each man believes that Padmini is his wife. Devadatta's head claims that the head rules the body, and so she is his wife. Kapila's head argues that his hand accepted hers at the wedding ceremony, and that the child she is carrying came from his body. Padmini is aghast, but decides to go with Devadatta's head. Kapila does not return with them.

As the second act opens, Padmini and Devadatta are happier than they've ever been. She loves his newfound strength, and the two of them prepare for their child. They buy two **dolls** for their son. The dolls speak to the audience and reveal that over time, Devadatta's new, strong body begins to revert to its old form. He and Padmini fight over how to treat their son, as she believes that Devadatta coddles him. The dolls tell the audience that Padmini begins to dream of Kapila. When the dolls begin to show signs of wear, Padmini asks Devadatta to get new ones and goes to show her son the forest.

As Padmini travels through the woods, she discovers Kapila living there. He has regained his strength, just as Devadatta has lost his. He explains how he had to war against his body, and how he has come to accept that he is, in fact, Kapila. Padmini implies that she is attracted to him, and spends several nights with him.

Devadatta returns with the dolls and tries to find Padmini in the woods. He discovers her with Kapila, and the two decide to kill each other to put an end to the struggle between their heads and their bodies. After they have killed each other, Padmini decides to perform **sati**, throwing herself on their funeral pyre. The Bhagavata explains that Padmini was, in her own way, a devoted wife.

Just as the audience believes the play has ended, a **second actor** comes onstage saying that there was a horse walking down the street singing the national anthem. The first actor also enters, with a young boy in tow. The boy is very serious, and does not speak, laugh, or cry. It is revealed the child is Padmini's son.

At that point, Hayavadana returns. He explains that he had asked Kali to make him complete, but instead of making him a complete human, she has made him a complete horse. Padmini's son begins to laugh at Hayavadana, and the two sing together. Hayavadana still wishes to rid himself of his human voice, and the boy encourages him to laugh. As Hayavadana laughs more and more, his laughter turns into a horse's neigh, and he thus becomes a complete horse.

The Bhagavata concludes the story by marveling at the mercy of Ganesha, who has fulfilled the desires of Hayavadana and the young boy. He says that it is time to pray, and Padmini, Devadatta, and Kapila join in thanking the Lord for ensuring the completion and success of the play.

## **Summary**

### **Analysis**

At the beginning of the performance, a **mask** of Ganesha (a Hindu god with the head of an elephant and the body of a boy) is brought onstage and placed onto a chair in front of the audience, and a **puja** is done.

### **Analysis**

At the beginning of the performance, a **mask** of Ganesha (a Hindu god with the head of an elephant and the body of a boy) is brought onstage and placed onto a chair in front of the

audience, and a **puja** is done.

Right away, it is established that the play will be unique in several ways. Because Karnad wrote the play partly as a reaction against Western theatrical conventions, he begins by placing the audience directly within the Indian culture and religion that permeate the play. By beginning the play with an actual religious ritual (the puja), Karnad establishes that there will be different “layers” to the play, not just a single, fictional plot line.

The Bhagavata introduces a main theme within the play: hybridity. Ganesha is the first of many beings with a mismatched head and body to appear in the play. In the case of the play’s human characters, hybridity is associated with a state of incompleteness, but the Bhagavata argues here that divine beings do not have that same deficiency; their perfection is incomprehensible to mortals. **The Bhagavata** then sets up the action of the play. He first introduces the setting, the kingdom of Dharmapura. He then introduces the two heroes, **Devadatta** and **Kapila**. Devadatta, who is fair and handsome, is the son of a **Brahmin** and is a highly intellectual poet. The Bhagavata describes how he outdoes the best poets and pundits in the kingdom “in debates on logic and love.” Kapila, on the other hand, is the son of an iron smith and is darker and “plain to look at.” Kapila excels in “deeds which require drive and daring,” including dancing and feats of strength. The Bhagavata describes how the world is in awe of their friendship, and sings that they are two friends of “one mind, one heart.”

As the Bhagavata introduces the two primary characters of the story, his descriptions set up what will be their primary conflict. Devadatta’s descriptions center almost exclusively on his intellect, whereas Kapila’s descriptions center almost exclusively on his physical strength and attributes. Therefore, from the very outset, the characters become symbolic of “the head” (associated with the intellect and logic) and “the body” (associated with emotion and sexuality).

At that moment, an **actor** screams in terror, running onstage. **The Bhagavata** tries to calm him, saying that there’s nothing to be afraid of on the stage. Only the musicians and audience are there. The actor explains that he was hurrying on his way to perform when he had to go to the bathroom. With nowhere to go, he sat by the side of the road, when a voice told him not to do that. He looked around and didn’t see anybody. He attempted to go again, but the voice once again chastised him. He looked up to find a talking horse in front of him.

**MOHAN RAKESH ; HALF WAY HOUSE**



**Ravi Taneja's work on Mohan Rakesh's "Aadhe Adhure" proved to be intensely gripping.**

Ravi Taneja has been actively engaged in the amateur theatre movement in Delhi for the last three decades. As an artistic director of Collegiate Drama Society, he is carrying forward the legacy of the late Prof. C. D. Siddhu, who had authored about 40 full-length plays in Punjabi and popularised theatre in multi-languages – Punjabi, Hindi, Urdu and English – with his band of young enthusiastic university students. Apart from staging Prof. Siddhu's plays, Ravi is participating in seminars organised by the Punjabi departments of various universities on the vast body of dramatic works of Prof. Siddhu, who is considered a trend-setter in Punjabi dramatic literature and theatre. Following in the footsteps of Prof. Siddhu, Ravi directed Mohan Rakesh's "Adhe Adhure" as "Halfway House" in Bindu Batra's English translation for Collegiate Drama Society which was presented recently at Shri Ram Centre in New Delhi. A few months ago Ravi staged Anton Chekhov's Three Sisters at the auditorium of Russian Cultural Centre, Ferozeshah Road in English. The production was neat, the dialogue well spoken but it could not bring to the fore the deeply disturbing soul of the play. However, "Halfway House" was intensely gripping from start to end. The director has thoroughly rehearsed his production with the young cast truly living their parts.

Mohan Rakesh, the tallest playwright in Hindi, had mastered his art and craft. He also had the good fortune of being closely associated with leading theatre directors like Shyamanand Jalan of Anamika, Kolkata, Om Shivpuri of Dishantar, Delhi and Rajinder Nath of Abhiyan, Delhi. This close interaction with these practitioners enabled him to master the intricacies of stage craft and the necessity of creative collaboration between the director and the playwright to write a perfect script for the stage. He had evolved a new theatrical language and his dialogues are skilfully chiselled, economic and pregnant with deep meaning. Bindu Batra in her English translation has captured the vigour, the economy and freshness of the original. Ravi's cast has delivered them aptly.

Over the years, "Adhe Adhure" has been directed by eminent theatre directors like Shyamanand Jalan and Amal Allana. It continues to fascinate young directors. Every year we watch one or two productions of this play on Delhi stage with varying successes.

The play depicts a dysfunctional family. The sole breadwinner of the family is the mother, Savitri, and her husband Mahendranath is a parasite. The son, Ashok, is unemployed who has no intention to look out for a job. He is a kind of a rebel without a cause. The elder daughter, Binny, has eloped with Manoj, a one time lover of the mother. Her relations with her husband are cold and both are indifferent to each other and she loathes staying with her

husband and returns to her mother. The younger daughter, little Kinny, remains all the time in a defiant mood and frequently remains absent from home and constantly reprimanded by family members for her erratic behaviour. In fact, she is lonely and victim of neglect by the family. It is a house at war against itself. It is a kind of a hell from which there is no exit.

### **BOOK REVIEW- HALFWAY HOUSE (A TRANSLATION OF AADHE ADHURE) BY MOHAN RAKESH.**

Mohan Rakesh(1925-1972) was one of the significant authors who contributed to early post-independence Hindi literature. He started with writing short stories, then he turned to write novels and after that plays. Between 1944 and 1972 he wrote a total of 66 stories. In his own words, “Most of my stories are about people living through the torture of relationships in their loneliness, where I have tried to depict through the individual his environment. This loneliness is not the loneliness of the socially isolated individual but the loneliness that comes from living within the society and it leads not to any kind of cynicism but to the need to live through it.”

I came across the play ‘Halfway House’ during my English Literature studies. Like other plays of Mohan Rakesh, this play also talks about the man-woman relationship but it also depicts the disintegration of the family. There are 9 characters in the play. The man in a black suit is the first character we meet as an audience. He is more like what we called ‘Sutradhaar’. Other characters are The First man (Mahendranath), The Second man(Singhanian), The Third man(Jagmohan), The Fourth man(Juneja), The Woman(Savitri), The Boy(Ashok), The Older Girl(Binni) and The Younger Girl(Kinni). These characters do have personal names as we discover in the play but the author introduces the characters as the first man, second man, etc because the author wants to establish that this is not the story of a particular family but society in general.

Events in the story unfold over about 30 hours but it deals with innumerable episodes in their life. When the story starts we discover that traditional roles are reversed here where husband Mahendranath is at home and wife Savitri is the breadwinner for the family. Older son Ashok is jobless and still looking for a job. The older daughter Binni eloped and married Manoj. Younger daughter Kinni lacking love and care has become uncontrollable and disrespectful. In the opening scene, Savitri is returned from work and sees the disheveled state of the house, and when Mahendranath enters she loses her temper and argues that if he cannot go out and work he should at least take the responsibility of the house. The younger daughter also gets scolded by her. She invited her boss Singhanian to the house to see if anything happens for Ashok’s job. Both father and son are not very happy about Singhanian coming to their house. Older daughter Binni also arrived but through their conversations audience gets to know that this is not new. Binni has issues in marriage. Her husband blamed that she has adopted something from her house that is responsible for constant arguments in their marriage. We as audience wonder what that must be. After heated arguments, Mahendranath leaves the house. Singhanian arrives but Ashok refused to talk properly and after he leaves argument flares up between Savitri and Ashok as a result Savitri takes the decision not to bother about anyone in the house in the future. After the interval, Savitri made a plan with Jagmohan and left the house. Then arrives Juneja and there is a long conversation between him and Binni which underlines further the bitterness of the relation between Mahendra and Savitri. Meanwhile having received no favorable response from Jagmohan Savitri comes home and encounters Juneja at home. There is a long

conversation between the two where Savitri talks about how Mahendranath has ruined her life. How all men are the same. To which Juneja replies and try to expose Savitri's True nature. The play ends with Mahendranath returning to the home when arguments are at peak.

For the most part of the story, our sympathy is for Savitri. She is the only one who is doing a job for her family. Her husband and children are of no help. So when she takes the decision of leaving everything and start a new life of her own we don't question her decision. Even if she sounds impatient and irritable we as the audience find it fair because her family seems to not care about her efforts. She accuses Mahendra's Friends of ruining Mahendra and her life. While talking with Juneja she says, "The object of his(Mahendra) existence is...as if...he were there only to fill in the gaps in the lives of others." She accused that Mahendra wanted her to change the way she was. That he bangs her head against the floor. Still, she never conforms to him. This behavior can be seen in her daughter Binni also as she says, "Like defying him (Manoj) in a way that would...enrage him. He likes my hair long so I want to cut it. He doesn't like me to work, so I want a job. Anything to torment him!" Savitri tells Juneja that she wants a man and not a miserable hanger-on. But soon Juneja tries to expose her and our whole perspective changes. He reveals that the problem is not Mahendra but if any man had been part of her life instead of Mahendra she still would have felt that she married the wrong man. She tried escaping from her marriage every other year by looking at options. First, there was Juneja then Shivjeet then Jagmohan. She even tried to escape with Manoj but he eventually elopes with her daughter and got married. Juneja accused her of Mahendra's helplessness condition today.

The story unexpectedly takes this turn in the end where we now sympathize with Mahendra. In the case where if you are unhappy in your marriage and you want to get out of it and look for options I don't think it is wrong. But in the case of Savitri it's different, she wanted a perfect man which is impossible. Even if she leaves Mahendra and gets married to someone else after a while she will again get bored because no human is perfect, they have some flaws. Marriage institution in the modern day is changing. Women are now aware of their rights and they don't tolerate injustice in marriages. We should understand that story is not telling that it is wrong to look for options when you are married; it is telling how it is futile to look for options if you have impractical expectations from your partner. You are never going to be happy if you have unrealistic expectations. One cannot find everything he or she wants in one person. This play allows thinking about modern-day marriages where familiarity breeds indifference if not contempt. 'The longer two people live together the more estranged they become from each other.' Many couples complained they do not have the charm in the relationship they used to have which is the reason for their failed marriage. No one else but that couple should understand what their relationship is. There will not always be good days or the same romance or love after several years of marriage, it is in the hands of the couple to keep love alive in their relationship. Man and woman are both equally responsible for their relationships.

This play begins with tension and ends with tension. We could feel suffocation and frustration as no character can get out of the painful situation. Most prominent theatre groups in Hindi have performed this play successfully. Aadhe-Adhure (Halfway House) has been largely responsible for making Rakesh a pan-Indian

## INTRODUCTION

## KALIDASA—HIS LIFE AND WRITINGS

Kalidasa probably lived in the fifth century of the Christian era. This date, approximate as it is, must yet be given with considerable hesitation, and is by no means certain. No truly biographical data are preserved about the author, who nevertheless enjoyed a great popularity during his life, and whom the Hindus have ever regarded as the greatest of Sanskrit poets. We are thus confronted with one of the remarkable problems of literary history. For our ignorance is not due to neglect of Kalidasa's writings on the part of his countrymen, but to their strange blindness in regard to the interest and importance of historic fact. No European nation can compare with India in critical devotion to its own literature. During a period to be reckoned not by centuries but by millenniums, there has been in India an unbroken line of savants unselfishly dedicated to the perpetuation and exegesis of the native masterpieces. Editions, recensions, commentaries abound; poets have sought the exact phrase of appreciation for their predecessors: yet when we seek to reconstruct the life of their greatest poet, we have no materials except certain tantalising legends, and such data as we can gather from the writings of a man who hardly mentions himself.

One of these legends deserves to be recounted for its intrinsic interest, although it contains, so far as we can see, no grain of historic truth, and although it places Kalidasa in Benares, five hundred miles distant from the only city in which we certainly know that he spent a part of his life. According to this account, Kalidasa was a Brahman's child. At the age of six months he was left an orphan and was adopted by an ox-driver. He grew to manhood without formal education, yet with remarkable beauty and grace of manner. Now it happened that the Princess of Benares was a blue-stocking, who rejected one suitor after another, among them her father's counsellor, because they failed to reach her standard as scholars and poets. The rejected counsellor planned a cruel revenge. He took the handsome ox-driver from the street, gave him the garments of a savant and a retinue of learned doctors, then introduced him to the princess, after warning him that he was under no circumstances to open his lips. The princess was struck with his beauty and smitten to the depths of her pedantic soul by his obstinate silence, which seemed to her, as indeed it was, an evidence of profound wisdom. She desired to marry Kalidasa, and together they went to the temple. But no sooner was the ceremony performed than Kalidasa perceived an image of a bull. His early training was too much for him; the secret came out, and the bride was furious. But she relented in response to Kalidasa's entreaties, and advised him to pray for learning and poetry to the goddess Kali. The prayer was granted; education and poetical power descended miraculously to dwell with the young ox-driver, who in gratitude assumed the name Kalidasa, servant of Kali. Feeling that he owed this happy change in his very nature to his princess, he swore that he would ever treat her as his teacher, with profound respect but without familiarity. This was more than the lady had bargained for; her anger burst forth anew, and she cursed Kalidasa to meet his death at the hands of a woman. At a later date, the story continues, this curse was fulfilled. A certain king had written a half-stanza of verse, and had offered a large reward to any poet who could worthily complete it. Kalidasa completed the stanza without difficulty; but a woman whom he loved discovered his lines, and greedy of the reward herself, killed him.

Another legend represents Kalidasa as engaging in a pilgrimage to a shrine of Vishnu in Southern India, in company with two other famous writers, Bhavabhuti and Dandin. Yet another pictures Bhavabhuti as a contemporary of Kalidasa, and jealous of the less austere poet's reputation. These stories must be untrue, for it is certain that the three authors were not contemporary, yet they show a true instinct in the belief that genius seeks genius, and is rarely isolated.

This instinctive belief has been at work with the stories which connect Kalidasa with King Vikramaditya and the literary figures of his court. It has doubtless enlarged, perhaps partly falsified the facts; yet we cannot doubt that there is truth in this tradition, late though it be, and impossible though it may ever be to separate the actual from the fanciful. Here then we

are on firmer ground.

King Vikramaditya ruled in the city of Ujjain, in West-central India. He was mighty both in war and in peace, winning especial glory by a decisive victory over the barbarians who pressed into India through the northern passes. Though it has not proved possible to identify this monarch with any of the known rulers, there can be no doubt that he existed and had the character attributed to him. The name Vikramaditya—Sun of Valour—is probably not a proper name, but a title like Pharaoh or Tsar. No doubt Kalidasa intended to pay a tribute to his patron, the Sun of Valour, in the very title of his play, *Urvashi won by Valour*.

King Vikramaditya was a great patron of learning and of poetry. Ujjain during his reign was the most brilliant capital in the world, nor has it to this day lost all the lustre shed upon it by that splendid court. Among the eminent men gathered there, nine were particularly distinguished, and these nine are known as the "nine gems." Some of the nine gems were poets, others represented science—astronomy, medicine, lexicography. It is quite true that the details of this late tradition concerning the nine gems are open to suspicion, yet the central fact is not doubtful: that there was at this time and place a great quickening of the human mind, an artistic impulse creating works that cannot perish. Ujjain in the days of Vikramaditya stands worthily beside Athens, Rome, Florence, and London in their great centuries. Here is the substantial fact behind Max Müller's often ridiculed theory of the renaissance of Sanskrit literature. It is quite false to suppose, as some appear to do, that this theory has been invalidated by the discovery of certain literary products which antedate Kalidasa. It might even be said that those rare and happy centuries that see a man as great as Homer or Vergil or Kalidasa or Shakespeare partake in that one man of a renaissance.

It is interesting to observe that the centuries of intellectual darkness in Europe have sometimes coincided with centuries of light in India. The Vedas were composed for the most part before Homer; Kalidasa and his contemporaries lived while Rome was tottering under barbarian assault.

To the scanty and uncertain data of late traditions may be added some information about Kalidasa's life gathered from his own writings. He mentions his own name only in the prologues to his three plays, and here with a modesty that is charming indeed, yet tantalising. One wishes for a portion of the communicativeness that characterises some of the Indian poets. He speaks in the first person only once, in the verses introductory to his epic poem *The Dynasty of Raghu*.<sup>[1]</sup> Here also we feel his modesty, and here once more we are balked of details as to his life.

We know from Kalidasa's writings that he spent at least a part of his life in the city of Ujjain. He refers to Ujjain more than once, and in a manner hardly possible to one who did not know and love the city. Especially in his poem *The Cloud-Messenger* does he dwell upon the city's charms, and even bids the cloud make a détour in his long journey lest he should miss making its acquaintance.<sup>[2]</sup>

We learn further that Kalidasa travelled widely in India. The fourth canto of *The Dynasty of Raghu* describes a tour about the whole of India and even into regions which are beyond the borders of a narrowly measured India. It is hard to believe that Kalidasa had not himself made such a "grand tour"; so much of truth there may be in the tradition which sends him on a pilgrimage to Southern India. The thirteenth canto of the same epic and *The Cloud-Messenger* also describe long journeys over India, for the most part through regions far from Ujjain. It is the mountains which impress him most deeply. His works are full of the Himalayas. Apart from his earliest drama and the slight poem called *The Seasons*, there is not one of them which is not fairly redolent of mountains. One, *The Birth of the War-god*, might be said to be all mountains. Nor was it only Himalayan grandeur and sublimity which attracted him; for, as a Hindu critic has acutely observed, he is the only Sanskrit poet who has described a certain flower that grows in Kashmir. The sea interested him less. To him, as to most Hindus, the ocean was a beautiful, terrible barrier, not a highway to adventure. The

"sea-belted earth" of which Kalidasa speaks means to him the mainland of India.

Another conclusion that may be certainly drawn from Kalidasa's writing is this, that he was a man of sound and rather extensive education. He was not indeed a prodigy of learning, like Bhavabhuti in his own country or Milton in England, yet no man could write as he did without hard and intelligent study. To begin with, he had a minutely accurate knowledge of the Sanskrit language, at a time when Sanskrit was to some extent an artificial tongue. Somewhat too much stress is often laid upon this point, as if the writers of the classical period in India were composing in a foreign language. Every writer, especially every poet, composing in any language, writes in what may be called a strange idiom; that is, he does not write as he talks. Yet it is true that the gap between written language and vernacular was wider in Kalidasa's day than it has often been. The Hindus themselves regard twelve years' study as requisite for the mastery of the "chief of all sciences, the science of grammar." That Kalidasa had mastered this science his works bear abundant witness.

He likewise mastered the works on rhetoric and dramatic theory—subjects which Hindu savants have treated with great, if sometimes hair-splitting, ingenuity. The profound and subtle systems of philosophy were also possessed by Kalidasa, and he had some knowledge of astronomy and law.

But it was not only in written books that Kalidasa was deeply read. Rarely has a man walked our earth who observed the phenomena of living nature as accurately as he, though his accuracy was of course that of the poet, not that of the scientist. Much is lost to us who grow up among other animals and plants; yet we can appreciate his "bee-black hair," his ashoka-tree that "sheds his blossoms in a rain of tears," his river wearing a sombre veil of mist:

Although her reeds seem hands that clutch the dress  
To hide her charms;  
his picture of the day-blooming water-lily at sunset:

The water-lily closes, but  
With wonderful reluctance;  
As if it troubled her to shut  
Her door of welcome to the bee.

The religion of any great poet is always a matter of interest, especially the religion of a Hindu poet; for the Hindus have ever been a deeply and creatively religious people. So far as we can judge, Kalidasa moved among the jarring sects with sympathy for all, fanaticism for none. The dedicatory prayers that introduce his dramas are addressed to Shiva. This is hardly more than a convention, for Shiva is the patron of literature. If one of his epics, *The Birth of the War-god*, is distinctively Shivaistic, the other, *The Dynasty of Raghu*, is no less Vishnuite in tendency. If the hymn to Vishnu in *The Dynasty of Raghu* is an expression of Vedantic monism, the hymn to Brahma in *The Birth of the War-god* gives equally clear expression to the rival dualism of the Sankhya system. Nor are the Yoga doctrine and Buddhism left without sympathetic mention. We are therefore justified in concluding that Kalidasa was, in matters of religion, what William James would call "healthy-minded," emphatically not a "sick soul."

There are certain other impressions of Kalidasa's life and personality which gradually become convictions in the mind of one who reads and re-reads his poetry, though they are less easily susceptible of exact proof. One feels certain that he was physically handsome, and the handsome Hindu is a wonderfully fine type of manhood. One knows that he possessed a fascination for women, as they in turn fascinated him. One knows that children loved him. One becomes convinced that he never suffered any morbid, soul-shaking experience such as besetting religious doubt brings with it, or the pangs of despised love; that on the contrary he moved among men and women with a serene and godlike tread, neither self-indulgent nor ascetic, with mind and senses ever alert to every form of beauty. We know that his poetry was popular while he lived, and we cannot doubt that his personality was equally attractive, though it is probable that no contemporary knew the full measure of his greatness. For his



nature was one of singular balance, equally at home in a splendid court and on a lonely mountain, with men of high and of low degree. Such men are never fully appreciated during life. They continue to grow after they are dead.

## II

Kalidasa left seven works which have come down to us: three dramas, two epics, one elegiac poem, and one descriptive poem. Many other works, including even an astronomical treatise, have been attributed to him; they are certainly not his. Perhaps there was more than one author who bore the name Kalidasa; perhaps certain later writers were more concerned for their work than for personal fame. On the other hand, there is no reason to doubt that the seven recognised works are in truth from Kalidasa's hand. The only one concerning which there is reasonable room for suspicion is the short poem descriptive of the seasons, and this is fortunately the least important of the seven. Nor is there evidence to show that any considerable poem has been lost, unless it be true that the concluding cantos of one of the epics have perished. We are thus in a fortunate position in reading Kalidasa: we have substantially all that he wrote, and run no risk of ascribing to him any considerable work from another hand.

Of these seven works, four are poetry throughout; the three dramas, like all Sanskrit dramas, are written in prose, with a generous mingling of lyric and descriptive stanzas. The poetry, even in the epics, is stanzaic; no part of it can fairly be compared to English blank verse. Classical Sanskrit verse, so far as structure is concerned, has much in common with familiar Greek and Latin forms: it makes no systematic use of rhyme; it depends for its rhythm not upon accent, but upon quantity. The natural medium of translation into English seems to me to be the rhymed stanza;<sup>[3]</sup> in the present work the rhymed stanza has been used, with a consistency perhaps too rigid, wherever the original is in verse.

Kalidasa's three dramas bear the names: *Malavika and Agnimitra*, *Urvashi*, and *Shakuntala*. The two epics are *The Dynasty of Raghu* and *The Birth of the War-god*. The elegiac poem is called *The Cloud-Messenger*, and the descriptive poem is entitled *The Seasons*. It may be well to state briefly the more salient features of the Sanskrit *genres* to which these works belong.

The drama proved in India, as in other countries, a congenial form to many of the most eminent poets. The Indian drama has a marked individuality, but stands nearer to the modern European theatre than to that of ancient Greece; for the plays, with a very few exceptions, have no religious significance, and deal with love between man and woman. Although tragic elements may be present, a tragic ending is forbidden. Indeed, nothing regarded as disagreeable, such as fighting or even kissing, is permitted on the stage; here Europe may perhaps learn a lesson in taste. Stage properties were few and simple, while particular care was lavished on the music. The female parts were played by women. The plays very rarely have long monologues, even the inevitable prologue being divided between two speakers, but a Hindu audience was tolerant of lyrical digression.

It may be said, though the statement needs qualification in both directions, that the Indian dramas have less action and less individuality in the characters, but more poetical charm than the dramas of modern Europe.

On the whole, Kalidasa was remarkably faithful to the ingenious but somewhat over-elaborate conventions of Indian dramaturgy. His first play, the *Malavika and Agnimitra*, is entirely conventional in plot. The *Shakuntala* is transfigured by the character of the heroine. The *Urvashi*, in spite of detail beauty, marks a distinct decline.

*The Dynasty of Raghu* and *The Birth of the War-god* belong to a species of composition which it is not easy to name accurately. The Hindu name *kavya* has been rendered by artificial

epic, *épopée savante*, *Kunstgedicht*. It is best perhaps to use the term epic, and to qualify the term by explanation.

The *kavyas* differ widely from the *Mahabharata* and the *Ramayana*, epics which resemble the *Iliad* and *Odyssey* less in outward form than in their character as truly national poems. The *kavya* is a narrative poem written in a sophisticated age by a learned poet, who possesses all the resources of an elaborate rhetoric and metric. The subject is drawn from time-honoured mythology. The poem is divided into cantos, written not in blank verse but in stanzas. Several stanza-forms are commonly employed in the same poem, though not in the same canto, except that the concluding verses of a canto are not infrequently written in a metre of more compass than the remainder.

I have called *The Cloud-Messenger* an elegiac poem, though it would not perhaps meet the test of a rigid definition. The Hindus class it with *The Dynasty of Raghu* and *The Birth of the War-god* as a *kavya*, but this classification simply evidences their embarrassment. In fact, Kalidasa created in *The Cloud-Messenger* a new *genre*. No further explanation is needed here, as the entire poem is translated below.

The short descriptive poem called *The Seasons* has abundant analogues in other literatures, and requires no comment.

It is not possible to fix the chronology of Kalidasa's writings, yet we are not wholly in the dark. *Malavika and Agnimitra* was certainly his first drama, almost certainly his first work. It is a reasonable conjecture, though nothing more, that *Urvashi* was written late, when the poet's powers were waning. The introductory stanzas of *The Dynasty of Raghu* suggest that this epic was written before *The Birth of the War-god*, though the inference is far from certain. Again, it is reasonable to assume that the great works on which Kalidasa's fame chiefly rests—*Shakuntala*, *The Cloud-Messenger*, *The Dynasty of Raghu*, the first eight cantos of *The Birth of the War-god*—were composed when he was in the prime of manhood. But as to the succession of these four works we can do little but guess.

Kalidasa's glory depends primarily upon the quality of his work, yet would be much diminished if he had failed in bulk and variety. In India, more than would be the case in Europe, the extent of his writing is an indication of originality and power; for the poets of the classical period underwent an education that encouraged an exaggerated fastidiousness, and they wrote for a public meticulously critical. Thus the great Bhavabhuti spent his life in constructing three dramas; mighty spirit though he was, he yet suffers from the very scrupulosity of his labour. In this matter, as in others, Kalidasa preserves his intellectual balance and his spiritual initiative: what greatness of soul is required for this, every one knows who has ever had the misfortune to differ in opinion from an intellectual clique.

### III

Le nom de Kâlidâsa domine la poésie indienne et la résume brillamment. Le drame, l'épopée savante, l'élégie attestent aujourd'hui encore la puissance et la souplesse de ce magnifique génie; seul entre les disciples de Sarasvatî [the goddess of eloquence], il a eu le bonheur de produire un chef-d'œuvre vraiment classique, où l'Inde s'admire et où l'humanité se reconnaît. Les applaudissements qui saluèrent la naissance de Çakuntalâ à Ujjayinî ont après de longs siècles éclaté d'un bout du monde à l'autre, quand William Jones l'eut révélée à l'Occident. Kâlidâsa a marqué sa place dans cette pléiade étincelante où chaque nom résume une période de l'esprit humain. La série de ces noms forme l'histoire, ou plutôt elle est l'histoire même.<sup>[4]</sup>

It is hardly possible to say anything true about Kalidasa's achievement which is not already contained in this appreciation. Yet one loves to expand the praise, even though realising that the critic is by his very nature a fool. Here there shall at any rate be none of that cold-blooded criticism which imagines itself set above a world-author to appraise and judge, but



a generous tribute of affectionate admiration.

The best proof of a poet's greatness is the inability of men to live without him; in other words, his power to win and hold through centuries the love and admiration of his own people, especially when that people has shown itself capable of high intellectual and spiritual achievement.

For something like fifteen hundred years, Kalidasa has been more widely read in India than any other author who wrote in Sanskrit. There have also been many attempts to express in words the secret of his abiding power: such attempts can never be wholly successful, yet they are not without considerable interest. Thus Bana, a celebrated novelist of the seventh century, has the following lines in some stanzas of poetical criticism which he prefixes to a historical romance:

Where find a soul that does not thrill  
In Kalidasa's verse to meet  
The smooth, inevitable  
lines  
Like blossom-clusters, honey-sweet?

A later writer, speaking of Kalidasa and another poet, is more laconic in this alliterative line: *Bhaso hasah, Kalidaso vilasah*—Bhasa is mirth, Kalidasa is grace.

These two critics see Kalidasa's grace, his sweetness, his delicate taste, without doing justice to the massive quality without which his poetry could not have survived.

Though Kalidasa has not been as widely appreciated in Europe as he deserves, he is the only Sanskrit poet who can properly be said to have been appreciated at all. Here he must struggle with the truly Himalayan barrier of language. Since there will never be many Europeans, even among the cultivated, who will find it possible to study the intricate Sanskrit language, there remains only one means of presentation. None knows the cruel inadequacy of poetical translation like the translator. He understands better than others can, the significance of the position which Kalidasa has won in Europe. When Sir William Jones first translated the *Shakuntala* in 1789, his work was enthusiastically received in Europe, and most warmly, as was fitting, by the greatest living poet of Europe. Since that day, as is testified by new translations and by reprints of the old, there have been many thousands who have read at least one of Kalidasa's works; other thousands have seen it on the stage in Europe and America.

How explain a reputation that maintains itself indefinitely and that conquers a new continent after a lapse of thirteen hundred years? None can explain it, yet certain contributory causes can be named.

No other poet in any land has sung of happy love between man and woman as Kalidasa sang. Every one of his works is a love-poem, however much more it may be. Yet the theme is so infinitely varied that the reader never wearies. If one were to doubt from a study of European literature, comparing the ancient classics with modern works, whether romantic love be the expression of a natural instinct, be not rather a morbid survival of decaying chivalry, he has only to turn to India's independently growing literature to find the question settled. Kalidasa's love-poetry rings as true in our ears as it did in his countrymen's ears fifteen hundred years ago.

It is of love eventually happy, though often struggling for a time against external obstacles, that Kalidasa writes. There is nowhere in his works a trace of that not quite healthy feeling that sometimes assumes the name "modern love." If it were not so, his poetry could hardly have survived; for happy love, blessed with children, is surely the more fundamental thing. In his drama *Urvashi* he is ready to change and greatly injure a tragic story, given him by long tradition, in order that a loving pair may not be permanently separated. One apparent exception there is—the story of Rama and Sita in *The Dynasty of Raghu*. In this case it must be remembered that Rama is an incarnation of Vishnu, and the story of a mighty god incarnate is not to be lightly tampered with.

It is perhaps an inevitable consequence of Kalidasa's subject that his women appeal more strongly to a modern reader than his men. The man is the more variable phenomenon, and though manly virtues are the same in all countries and centuries, the emphasis has been variously laid. But the true woman seems timeless, universal. I know of no poet, unless it be Shakespeare, who has given the world a group of heroines so individual yet so universal; heroines as true, as tender, as brave as are Indumati, Sita, Parvati, the Yaksha's bride, and Shakuntala.

Kalidasa could not understand women without understanding children. It would be difficult to find anywhere lovelier pictures of childhood than those in which our poet presents the little Bharata, Ayus, Raghu, Kumara. It is a fact worth noticing that Kalidasa's children are all boys. Beautiful as his women are, he never does more than glance at a little girl.

Another pervading note of Kalidasa's writing is his love of external nature. No doubt it is easier for a Hindu, with his almost instinctive belief in reincarnation, to feel that all life, from plant to god, is truly one; yet none, even among the Hindus, has expressed this feeling with such convincing beauty as has Kalidasa. It is hardly true to say that he personifies rivers and mountains and trees; to him they have a conscious individuality as truly and as certainly as animals or men or gods. Fully to appreciate Kalidasa's poetry one must have spent some weeks at least among wild mountains and forests untouched by man; there the conviction grows that trees and flowers are indeed individuals, fully conscious of a personal life and happy in that life. The return to urban surroundings makes the vision fade; yet the memory remains, like a great love or a glimpse of mystic insight, as an intuitive conviction of a higher truth.

Kalidasa's knowledge of nature is not only sympathetic, it is also minutely accurate. Not only are the snows and windy music of the Himalayas, the mighty current of the sacred Ganges, his possession; his too are smaller streams and trees and every littlest flower. It is delightful to imagine a meeting between Kalidasa and Darwin. They would have understood each other perfectly; for in each the same kind of imagination worked with the same wealth of observed fact.

I have already hinted at the wonderful balance in Kalidasa's character, by virtue of which he found himself equally at home in a palace and in a wilderness. I know not with whom to compare him in this; even Shakespeare, for all his magical insight into natural beauty, is primarily a poet of the human heart. That can hardly be said of Kalidasa, nor can it be said that he is primarily a poet of natural beauty. The two characters unite in him, it might almost be said, chemically. The matter which I am clumsily endeavouring to make plain is beautifully epitomised in *The Cloud-Messenger*. The former half is a description of external nature, yet interwoven with human feeling; the latter half is a picture of a human heart, yet the picture is framed in natural beauty. So exquisitely is the thing done that none can say which half is superior. Of those who read this perfect poem in the original text, some are more moved by the one, some by the other. Kalidasa understood in the fifth century what Europe did not learn until the nineteenth, and even now comprehends only imperfectly: that the world was not made for man, that man reaches his full stature only as he realises the dignity and worth of life that is not human.

That Kalidasa seized this truth is a magnificent tribute to his intellectual power, a quality quite as necessary to great poetry as perfection of form. Poetical fluency is not rare; intellectual grasp is not very uncommon: but the combination has not been found perhaps more than a dozen times since the world began. Because he possessed this harmonious combination, Kalidasa ranks not with Anacreon and Horace and Shelley, but with Sophocles, Vergil, Milton.

He would doubtless have been somewhat bewildered by Wordsworth's gospel of nature. "The world is too much with us," we can fancy him repeating. "How can the world, the beautiful human world, be too much with us? How can sympathy with one form of life do other than

vivify our sympathy with other forms of life?"

It remains to say what can be said in a foreign language of Kalidasa's style. We have seen that he had a formal and systematic education; in this respect he is rather to be compared with Milton and Tennyson than with Shakespeare or Burns. He was completely master of his learning. In an age and a country which reprobated carelessness but were tolerant of pedantry, he held the scales with a wonderfully even hand, never heedless and never indulging in the elaborate trifling with Sanskrit diction which repels the reader from much of Indian literature. It is true that some western critics have spoken of his disfiguring conceits and puerile plays on words. One can only wonder whether these critics have ever read Elizabethan literature; for Kalidasa's style is far less obnoxious to such condemnation than Shakespeare's. That he had a rich and glowing imagination, "excelling in metaphor," as the Hindus themselves affirm, is indeed true; that he may, both in youth and age, have written lines which would not have passed his scrutiny in the vigour of manhood, it is not worth while to deny: yet the total effect left by his poetry is one of extraordinary sureness and delicacy of taste. This is scarcely a matter for argument; a reader can do no more than state his own subjective impression, though he is glad to find that impression confirmed by the unanimous authority of fifty generations of Hindus, surely the most competent judges on such a point.

Analysis of Kalidasa's writings might easily be continued, but analysis can never explain life. The only real criticism is subjective. We know that Kalidasa is a very great poet, because the world has not been able to leave him alone.

#### **ARTHUR W. RYDER.**

#### **KALIDASA**

An ancient heathen poet, loving more God's creatures, and His women, and His flowers  
Than we who boast of consecrated powers; Still lavishing his unexhausted store  
Of love's deep, simple wisdom, healing o'er The world's old sorrows, India's griefs and  
ours; That healing love he found in palace towers, On mountain, plain, and dark, sea-belted  
shore,  
In songs of holy Raghu's kingly line Or sweet Shakuntala in pious grove, In hearts that met  
where starry jasmines twine  
Or hearts that from long, lovelorn absence strove Together. Still his words of wisdom  
shine: All's well with man, when man and woman love.  
Willst du die Blüte des frühen, die  
Früchte des späteren Jahres,  
Willst du, was reizt und entzückt,  
Willst du, was sättigt und nährt,  
Willst du den Hummel, die erde mit  
Einem Namen begreifen,  
Nenn' ich, Sakuntala, dich, und  
dann ist alles gesagt.

#### **REFERENCE :**

1. *Shakuntala*, by Sir William Jones (1789)
2. A.A. Macdonell's *History of Sanskrit Literature* (1900);
3. "Kalidasa" in the eleventh edition of the *Encyclopædia Britannica* (1910); and Sylvain Lévi's *Le Théâtre Indien* (1890)
4. *The Cloud-Messenger*, by H.H. Wilson (1813).

**UNIT – IV INDIAN LITERATURE IN TRANSLATION  
(SHS5010)**

#### 4.1 Ponniyin Selvan: Part 1: The First Floods

The original was first serialised in Tamizh 1950-54 in the magazine Kalki.

Kalki is the pseudonym of R. Krishnamurthy (1899-1954) who was the famous editor of the Tamil weekly, "Kalki", devoted to Indian nationalism, art and literature. He was a great personal friend of Rajaji. Among his historic novels are "Parthiban Kanavu", "Sivagamiyin Sabatham," and "Ponniyin Selvan"; his nationalistic novel "Alai Osai" got him the Sahitya Academy Award.

"Ponniyin Selvan" is a majestic historical romance - a masterfully woven epic of fact and conjecture set against the backdrop of Tenth Century peninsular India under the Chola Kings", says K. Narayanan. [sup][18]

Pazhuvettarayar is a great warrior, who took part in many of the Chozha campaigns to enlarge the empire under his master, Emperor Paranthaka Sundara Chozhar. He was greatly respected when he skilfully changed the rout of the Chozha army at Thakkolam into a great victory. He had taken part in 32 battles and received 96 wounds. He was considerably aged when he got infatuated with the beauty, youth, charm, and attainments of Nandini, when he sees her in the Pandiya territory and brings her to his Pazhuvoor palace in a covered palanquin, which becomes the sarcastic talk of the town. Her meeting with various handsome young men like, Vandiyathevan, Kandan Maran, and Parthibendran triggers flames of jealousy in the old man, but he controls his suspicions to a marked extent. He is magnanimous enough not to allude to his feelings, but on one occasion when Kandan Maran is accompanied by Vandiyathevan, Pazhuvettarayar arranges a hireling to stab the former in the back. Vandiyathevan carries him to his friend's mother who is a skilled healer. Kandan Maran suspects that that he was stabbed by Vandiyathevan and their relationship is strained forever.

Nandini is the wife of the defeated Veera Pandiyan (he is in hiding). When he is chased by the victorious Karikalar, Nandini with folded hands pleads for his life. The infuriated and excited Karikalar brutally beheads the King and carries the head.

The most revealing conversation and intimate feelings between Nandini and Adithya Karikalar are brought to the fore just before the assassination of Adithar. Nandini is told that she is the step-sister of Aditha Karikalar, born to the deaf-mute mother through Sundara Chozha. She tells him the secret of her marriage to Pazhuvettarayar, which is only a ruse to enter the Chozha palace and enjoy its luxuries and carry out her intentions to wipe out the Chozha dynasty. Her

various meetings with Pandiya conspirators in the palace rouses the suspicions of the old warrior, Pazhuvettarayar. Aditha Karikalar, unaware of their relationship had entertained tender feelings toward Nandini in their youth, which were discouraged by the Chozha family. Aditha recalled these happenings and suggested that they run away to a far off island. Nandini did not take to this suggestion kindly and suggests instead, that they could get rid of Pazhuvettarayar, imprison the king and ascend the throne. The infuriated Aditha Karikalar shouts at her and tells her that she wants to live with Vandiyathevan.

The intimate conversation between the two is overheard by both Vandiyathevan and Pazhuvettarayar. The latter rushes to kill Nandini with a sword. The insolvable mystery is enacted now and Aditha Karikalar is found dead in the bedroom of Nandini. It is not known who actually killed Aditha Karikalar, although Pazhuvettarayar takes the responsibility on himself in the open court, presided over by the Chozha Emperor, and stabs himself.

The sexual jealousy felt by the old warrior toward his young beloved could be analyzed. It is clear that Pazhuvettarayar, like the other warrior Othello is not suffering from delusional psychotic jealousy. It could be considered as reactive jealousy in the words of Mullen.

[sup][8]

### **Over-sensitivity and lone self esteem**

The old man is advanced in years and he knows it compares unfavorably with his youthful spouse. He cannot be an attractive person with 96 wounds received in 32 campaigns (just like Julius Caesar). The reference to his age when Aditha Karikalar insultingly addresses him as 'Thatha' in the company of other youths infuriates him, but he suppresses his feelings .

It is worth recalling here that one of the causes of sexual jealousy mentioned in an old Buddhist text in Pali language is the old age of the husband, De Silva and De Silva. [sup][9]

### **Provoking situations and subsequent developments**

There are any number of provoking situations that add to the configurations of jealousy; the presentation of the ring by Nandini to Vandiyathevan to be used as an insignia in his perambulations in the Chozha courts. Pazhuvettarayar is too great a man of honor to question Nandini directly about this happening. The confession of Nandini to Aditha Karikalar about her motive in entering the household of the old Chancellor is to wreck vengeance for the murder of her former husband Veerapandian, with no sexual motives. Throughout her stay with Pazhuvettarayar she did not allow any intimacies. Naturally this abstinence would have increased the old man's suspicions of whether she got gratification from elsewhere. The frequent visits of the Pandiyan conspirators in the guise of magicians and astrologers would have strengthened Pazhuvettarayar's suspicions further.

The last straw to break Pazhuvettarayar's patience is the plan unfolded by Aditha Karikalar to elope with Nandini to a far off peaceful haven. The idea is rejected by Nandini who wants to stay back with Aditha Karikalar in Tanjavur and ascend the Chozha throne. The husband who is so far peaceful with Nandini has reached the brink of desperation and morbid jealousy leads to murderous violence [sup][19] , which has been in abeyance all these years. This leads to the murderous assault when he throws a sword at her from his hiding. Nandini is not killed in the attempt.

The last act is when Pazhuvettarayar confesses in the Chozha court about his killing of Aditha Karikalar. This great Chozha loyalist who has sworn allegiance to the Chozha family stabs himself in the presence

of the royal court and subsequently dies. The domestic violence of murder and suicide so common in morbid jealousy, is thus enacted in the life of the Pazhuvettarayar.

It is not surprising that alcohol use and comorbid personality disorder are conspicuously absent in the story of the tragic warrior.

The First Floods is the first part of Ponniyin Selvan series.

Main Characters: VallvarayanVandiyathevan, Parthibendran, Adhitha Karikalar, ArulmozhiVarman(Ponniyin Selvan), ParanthakaSundaraChozhar, KundavaiDevi(IlayaPirati), MadhuranthakaDevar, Kandaradithar, Nandini(PazhuvoorRani), ChinnaPazhuvetaraiyar, PeriyaPazhuvetaraiyar, KudanthaiJosiyar, Malayaman, SendhanAmuthan, KandanMaran, Manimekhalai, AzhvarkadiyanNambi(Thirumalai), EasanaBhattar and Sambuvaraiyar

VallavarayanVandiyathevan of the Vana clan who serves AdithaKarikalan, the crown prince goes to deliver two important scrolls from Adithan. One is addressed to ParanthakaSundaraChozhar who is the ruling emperor and the other is to KundavaiDevi, daughter of the emperor and also called as the IlayaPirati. On his way to SundaraChozhar's palace at Thanjavur, he settles the disputes between AzhvarkadiyanNambi and EasanaBhattar on whether Vishnu or Shiva is supreme. Then Vandhiyathevan gets trapped in PeriyaPazhuvetaraiyar's, the prince of Pazhuvoor, hands. He somehow gives the scroll to SundaraChozhar. The scroll invites SundaraChozhar, Adithan's father, who lives under the influence of the Pazhuvetrariyars' to come and live in the golden palace built by Adithan for his father. Then Vandiyathevan escapes from Thanjavur and goes to meet IlayaPirati in Pazhayarai. He delivers the message safely to KundavaiDevi. KundavaiDevi gives him another message to be taken to prince ArulmozhiVarman in Eezham(Lanka). This is the end of first part.

Parthibendran is a friend of AdithaKarikalan. MadhuranthakaThevar is the son of Kandaradithar. Kandaradithar and SundaraChozhar are brothers. Nandini is PeriyaPazhuvetaraiyar's wife and doesn't like KundavaiDevi, the IlayaPirati because she is SundaraChozhar's daughter and adored more. KudanthaiJosiyar predicts that ArulmozhiVarman will rule all the three worlds as per his horoscope. SendhanAmuthan helps VandiyaThevan during his journey to Pazhayarai. KandanMaran is a friend of VandiyaThevan. Manimekhalai is KandanMaran's sister. Sambuvaraiyar is father of KandanMaran and Manimekhalai.



#### **4.2 Thakazhi Sivasankara Pillai : Chemmeen (Trans. by Anita Nair)**

T. S Pillai's masterpiece "Chemmeen" is a mesmerising seaside story. "Chemmeen" is a realistic fictional tragedy which focuses on the lifestyle of early fishermen folk in Kerala, the southern part of India. Thakazhi Sivasankara Pillai's "Chemmeen" is the first Malayalam novel to win Sahitya Akademi award. The English version has been translated by Anita Nair and the translation is simple yet beautiful to read.

This book had been made into a Malayalam movie by the same name. The cover page of the book is still from the "Chemmeen" movie. The Malayalam actress Sheela who portrays the character 'Karuthamma' is seen holding earthen pots on a sea shore. She is in her fisherwoman dress and she seems to gaze at someone or something.

The story revolves around Karuthamma, a fisherman's daughter destined to marry a fisherman of her same caste and religion. When Pareekutty, a Muslim fisherman helps her family, Karuthamma couldn't help herself from falling into the forbidden love. Little did Karuthamma know that fate had other plans for her. "Chemmeen" is a story about hope and hopeless love.

The vivid description of seashore is striking and the story takes us through the life of the fisher folk. It also elicits how the caste division affects the people. The characters often question the ethics and norms set by the society. The novel has been translated into many languages over the world and is one of the best translated works of Malayalam. Thakazhi Sivasankara Pillai brings out the simple story in its brief detailing, but manages to enthrall readers from all over the world. I would definitely recommend this book as a one time read. Even though this belongs to the tragedy genre and the ending seemed to pull a sudden brake, the plot unfolds beautifully which is guaranteed to entertain all readers.

"Chemmeen" is the narrative of the fisherman's society. Ordinary forces are severely genuine adversary or acquaintances. It is far-off from a municipality vision of living. The fundamentals can obliterate a human being and his relatives; they can also construct it probable to survive for an additional year, that is, accordingly in the insignificant fishing societies it is the uncompromising spirit Katalamma, who instructs the conviction of the persons. She lives at the conviction of the persons. She lives at the underneath of the sea and the technique to her dwelling is completed appalling by vortex and untrustworthy contemporary. Mercilessly she castigates the depraved, negligent them downwards to her dreadful kingdom and sending sea monstrous and serpents to the seashore as a caution of the anger. The men at sea must be courageous and honourable. The women on seashore must be uncontaminated and uncorrupted to assurance the protection of their men on Katalamma's dangerous waters.

Thakazhi Sivasankara Pillai is among the brand of writers who ushered Malayalam literature

into a new age. His place in Malayalam literature is that of a god-father. Chemmeen is Pillai's best novel which expresses the aspirations, struggle and grief in the lives of the fisherman of Kerala. The tragedy of the poor fisherman has been depicted on the epical scale. The aim of this critical study is to study this great novel from different angles. Chemmeen has so much to offer to the readers. This critical study will help students of advanced degree courses of various universities as well as general readers to understand various aspects related to this novel.

Chemmeen is an acclaimed novel by Thakazhi Sivasankar Pillai, in which the conflict of traditionalism versus change/modernism dominates throughout. It is our view that through his novel the author favours traditionalism over modernism. Moreover, the novel serves as an important instrument for moralizing and advocating traditionalism. We base our argument on the following grounds. One of the chief characters: Chembankunju who happens to disregard not only the traditional practices of his village but at times also the moral conduct expected of any human being, is portrayed as a greedy villain, throughout. He sets about the mission of buying a boat despite the fact that as per the customs; he is ineligible to own one. Even though he bribes his way through the customs and becomes an owner of the boat, the end result is devastating, he ends up being a failure and losing his sanity. In the novel, at several instances, the author, by giving a description of traditional beliefs and customs and portraying the characters who transgress them; draws a contrast between what should be done and what should not be done. Karuthamma, who is another significant character in the novel, like Chembankunju is also portrayed as the transgressor of traditions and customs. She trespasses against laws of her society by falling in love with a Muslim man, Pareekutty. Eventually, she is racked with loss of love and scorn of the villagers including her father. The same is true for Pareekutty. The novel mentions of the traditions of the fishing village. It emphasizes the fact that peace and a certain harmony status quo is maintained as long as the traditions and customs are adhered to. There's chaos and disharmony when these traditional laws and customs are breached and overstepped. The novel validates this by portraying the tragedy of characters who have transgressed. Karuthamma, who eventually succumbs to temptation and love, loses her husband Palani who is at sea, at the same moment as she conjoins with her lover. The fact that the author has NOT portrayed the major characters that stand for change and rationality traditionalism as victors but as losers and victims of a tragedy validates our argument that the author is advocating traditionalism by giving an account of consequences suffered by those who refused to conform.

Chemmeen tells the story of the relationship between Karuthamma, the daughter of a Hindu fisherman, and Pareekutty, the son of a Muslim fish wholesaler. The theme of the novel is a myth among the fishermen communities along the coastal Kerala State in the Southern India. The myth is about chastity. If the married fisher woman was infidel when her husband was in the sea, the Sea Goddess (Kadamma literally means Mother Sea) the Goddess would consume him. It is to perpetuate this myth that Thakazhi wrote this beautiful novel. It was adapted into a film of same name, which won critical acclaim and commercial success.

Thakazhi made a departure from his vowed commitment to realism as it appeared in his works till then he brought in a fresh breeze of lyricism and romanticism. The novel acquires the

quality of a fable in which life in the fishermen's community is depicted with great emotional detail. The customs, taboos, beliefs, rituals and the day-to-day business of living through the pain of stark existence come alive magically through Thakazhi's pen.

Chembankunju's only aim in life is to own a boat and a net. He finally succeeds in buying both with the help of Pareekutty, a young Muslim trader, on condition that the fish hauled by the boat will be sold to him. Chembankunju's pretty daughter Karuthamma and Pareekutty love each other. Karuthamma's

mother, Chakki, knows about it and reminds her daughter about the life they lead within the boundaries of strict social tradition. Karuthamma sacrifices her love for Pareekutty and marries Palani, an orphan discovered by Chembankunju in the course of one of his fishing expeditions. Following the marriage, Karuthamma accompanies her husband to his village, despite her mother's sudden illness and her father's requests to stay. In his fury, Chembankunju disowns her. On acquiring a boat and a net and subsequently adding one more, Chembankunju becomes more greedy and heartless. With his dishonesty, he drives Pareekutty to bankruptcy. After the death of his wife, Chembankunju marries Pappikunju, the widow of the man from whom he had bought his first boat. Panchami, Chembankunju's younger daughter, leaves home to join Karuthamma, on arrival of her step mother. Meanwhile, Karuthamma has endeavoured to be a good wife and mother. But scandal about her old love for Pareekutty spreads in the village. Palani's friends ostracize him and refuse to take him fishing with them. By a stroke of fate, Karuthamma and Pareekutty meet one night and their old love is awakened. Palani, at sea alone and baiting a shark, is caught in a huge whirlpool and is swallowed by the sea. Next morning, Karuthamma and Pareekutty, are also found dead hand in hand, washed ashore. At a distance, there lies a baited dead shark.

Chemmeen is Pillai's best novel which expresses the aspirations, struggle and grief in the lives of the fisherman of Kerala. Chemmeen has so much to offer to the readers. This critical study will help students of advanced degree courses of various universities as well as general readers to understand various aspects related to this novel. The tragedy of the poor fisherman has been depicted on the epical scale. Thakazhi Sivasankara Pillai's (Malayalam) novel Chemmeen, accepted as part of the unesco Collection of Representative Works - Indian Series, was translated by V.K. Narayana Menon, and published by Victor Gollancz, London in 1962. It was the first significant Malayalam novel to be translated into English after Independence or, rather, during the early post-colonial era.

### Conclusion

Accordingly the novel Chemmeen is a misfortune of poor fishermen, who are sufferers of an financially viable system. Rich currency lenders like Ouseph demoralized them to the top of their twisted and fishermen have no anticipate for a brilliant opportunity. When a fisherman like Chemban Kunju tries to supplementary his predictions he is pulled behind by the jealousy of the persons and communal circumstances. They are fatalists in as much as they have a unsighted conviction in the supremacy of the goddess Katalamma. Social group contemplations are conscientious for the disastrous end of the depressing relation of the leading role. All the characters consider in providence and they move violently alongside probability. Traditions and taboos are too prominent for them. When a fisherman like Chemban Kunju struggles to supplementary his prediction he is pulled downwards by the jealousy of the persons and communal circumstances. The affliction of Chemban, Chakki, Karuthamma and Pareekutty appear to be a division of the everyday life of these villagers on the ocean shoreline. Very few characters are conscious of the worthlessness and purposelessness of obsolete behaviour and philosophy. "Thus the novel is a creative sympathetic of the disintegration of traditions, communal and spiritual philosophy in a congested society."

## T. S. Pillai's *Chemmeen*: Love, Marxism, and a Hindu Dialectic

*Chemmeen* is set in a small fishing village in Kerala, India. As stated in the "Introduction," poverty of the degree one finds here will be difficult for most in the Western world to imagine. In such regions, the prayer "May my children not know starvation" is literally meant and earnestly uttered. The story is of Karu-thamma and Pareekutti, she the daughter of a poor fisherman, and he the son of a fairly successful trader. With adolescence, their friendship turns to love, and Chemban Kunju (Karu-thamma's father), preferring not to look too closely into Pareekutti's motivation, asks for and receives substantial help from him. The young man goes bankrupt while Chemban, purchasing his first boat and nets, is on the way to comparative wealth. Karu-thamma is given in marriage to a visiting fisherman, Palani, and goes to live in his village. Chemban had bought his first boat from Kandankoran, a man of higher "caste" whom Chemban admired for his wealth, bearing and somewhat extravagant life-style. Chemban's wife dies and so does Kandankoran: thereupon, the aspiring fisherman marries the widow. But the marriage is not a success; Chemban's health and drive falter, and his enterprise declines. His only other child, a daughter, estranged over her father's second marriage, moves out of the house. Chemban, his life now in ruins, without aims and orientation, belatedly repays a small portion of the money he had borrowed from Pareekutti. But the money now has no use to Pareekutti either: he is given to haunting the beach alone, singing, his sanity suspect. Pareekutti walks to Karu-thamma's village, presumably to give her the money forced upon him by her father. When he arrives, it is late in the night and Palani is out at sea. Love compounded with great pity overcomes Karu-thamma's moral conditioning. "She entered his extended arms and her body became one with his . . . 'My Karu-thamma! . . . What am I to you?' She took his face in both her hands and looking at him with half-closed eyes, she said, 'Everything . . .'" Out at sea, Palani struggles with a huge shark he has baited and looks in vain for Arundhati (guiding star of fisherman and symbol of chastity) as a giant whirlpool forms and waves become mountainous. He cries out to his wife (the fisherman's traditional guardian angel) to pray for him: "The lives of the men at sea are in the hands of the women on shore." The primordial fisherman, on a piece of wood, had escaped because ashore "a chaste and pure woman" had prayed steadfastly for the safety of her husband at sea (pp. 7-8). But Karu-thamma is in the arms of Pareekutti, and Palani is dragged down to the abode of Katalamma, the sea goddess. The lovers by the sea are swept out and drowned by an outraged ocean.

One familiar with the history of India, and with the racial and religious tensions between Hindus and Muslims, will grasp the significance of Pareekutti being Muslim and Karu-thamma a Hindu. Like Romeo and Juliet, the lovers are young: Karu-thamma was about thirteen, if not less, at the time of her marriage. Custom demanded that a girl marry at ten (p. 29) in order to exclude the

danger of her being attracted to an "unacceptable" man. Added to the racial and religious divisions, Pareekutti represents a trading, exploitative class, separate from the fishermen who lead a hard and dangerous life. The force of their love, comparable to the elements by which they live, gives Pareekutti and Karuthamma a stature which transcends their youth and humble social position. Between the innocent and joyful beginning of their love and its "sinful" end are worked out patterns of violations. Karuthamma loves Pareekutti and acknowledges that she will always remember him. But loyal to her traditions and obedient to her parents, she did not declare and assert her love for Pareekutti—a man outside her race and religion. Tragically, not even marriage and "the fulfilment of desire" (p. 121) can drive away her deep love for

Pareekutti. In conforming, in attempting to avoid trouble and shame, Karuthamma violates the love Pareekutti and she have for each other—and creates greater scandal and fatal chaos.

Young and obedient, Karuthamma was unable until the end to escape from the "fort" and the "high walls" erected by her parents and her community. But her father, though enjoining and enforcing traditional, conservative behavior on his two daughters, is himself individualistic, iconoclastic, and does not abide by those customs and beliefs which stand in the way of his attempts to improve his economic lot. The community believed that a fisherman should not practice thrift because he "makes his money by cheating and catching innocent beings moving freely in the sea . . . you cannot save money made at the cost of innocent lives" (p. 132). But Chemban rejects beliefs which result in stagnation, poverty, and vulnerability: he saves, refusing to be consigned to permanent penury. Only those of the Valakkaran "caste" are permitted to buy fishing boats (the lower castes can only seek employment in them), but Chemban does so, though he belongs to the so-called lower, Mukkuran caste. When the sea turns red and other fishermen stay ashore believing that the sea goddess (Katalamma) is menstruating, Chemban launches his boat. His lead is cautiously followed by some, and thus the fishing community begins to alter its patterns of behavior, if not of belief. Chemban is a catalyst releasing dynamic forces of change.

But his actions pass beyond legitimate self-improvement and become an expression of unscrupulous greed. In order to accumulate wealth, Chemban would even "empty the sea" (p. 71). When his daughter attempts to collect "cast-off small fish which children usually gather for themselves," Chemban violently pushes her away. "The haul he had in his boat had grown in the sea. No one had sown any seeds for it or nurtured it. A portion of it was the due of the poor . . . That was the law of the sea" (p. 53). Having borrowed heavily from Pareekutti, Chemban neither repays nor offers the young trader a part of the day's catch. As Karuthamma observes, purity does not mean sexual chastity only: "Won't the sea goddess be angry if you cheat?" Chemban violates friendship by denying his loyal friend Achan-kunju a place in the boat. He violates parental duty by placing the purchase of a boat higher than seeing to it that his daughter gets married. The novel opens with Pareekutti and Karuthamma laughing helplessly and without apparent cause: it is the excitement of adolescence and incipient sexual attraction. Karuthamma wears only a thin loincloth and her breasts are bare (p. 5). Chemban, by neglecting his parental duty, allows this friendship to transform itself into love.

T. S. Pillai, who was associated with the socialist movement in Kerala, portrays through Chemban the powerful attractions of money and the ruthless, competitive nature that the free enterprise system sometimes breeds. Here Pillai can be compared with African writers such as Sembene Ousmane and Ngugi—if not with Conrad and the corrupting attractions of wealth on *Nostromo*. Despite the pleas of his neighbors (whose predicament had once been his) Chemban sells all his catch to the traders. Consequently, the women have to buy the fish from the traders at high prices and then attempt to sell them, barely making a margin of profit for themselves. Chemban thus rejects his past and his people, and instead collaborates with the exploiters. Like the traders and moneylenders, at times of economic distress, Chemban buys ornaments and household goods from his desperate neighbors at outrageously low prices. Chemmeen examines the nature of communal beliefs and the degree to which man could—and perhaps should—stand outside society as an individual. Chemban, breaking free in the pursuit of what at first appears to be legitimate goals, becomes selfish and pitiless. His rebellion against custom

has a material motivation; a private rather than a public goal. He does not break free in order to improve the community's quality of life. Indifferent to his people's plight, he pursues personal aggrandisement and ends a lonely, bitter, and deranged man. The moral is clear: the answers to superstition, stagnation and poverty must be collectively sought and achieved.

To turn to another dimension of the novel and to its title, as the shrimps (*chemmeen*) are tossed on the waves of the ocean, so man is tossed on the waves of the Ocean of Transmigration (*Samsara Sagard*). The tragic end places man in the Shakespearean perspective of flies to wanton gods but counterpoised to this awareness is the realization that god in one of his ten avatars (incarnations) took the form of a fish. Thus man is defined paradoxically both as negligible and as of profound significance. Like the waves, man repeatedly dies and arises in unceasing combinations of new forms. The *Bhagavad Gita* identifies greed as one of the gates leading to hell—the path *Chemban* chooses. On the other hand, The *Gita* also warns that man attains salvation not through renunciation alone, nor by leaving works undone. *Palani* carries out the work "pre-scribed" (ordained) for him with courage and skill but, unlike his father-in-law, liberated from and untainted by greed. The *Gita* also posits two time-pathways, the one identified with the gods and leading to solar formless spheres from where there is no return to the lower worlds of name and form (*Nama-rupa*); the other, identified with the ancestors and leading by waning moon to the sublunar spheres of the unrest of forms, returning to fresh lives of ever new becoming. Thus *Palani's* body is not washed ashore while those of *Pareekutti* and *Karuthamma* are—locked in embrace since they symbolize, even in death, the principle and process of continual creation and birth. Their love also symbolizes the desire to realize the primordial, cosmic union of *Shiva* and *Shakti*. *Shiva Purana* not only praises *Shiva* as "manifested light" but also says that *Shiva* and *Devi* (or *Shakti*) are identical and inseparable as moonlight from the moon. So it is that *Pareekutti* and *Karuthamma* consummate their long-denied love by moonlight (p. 215).

*Chemmeen* is not only a story of tragic, young love, but raises issues of individual morality and action; economic conduct; social cohesion and theological belief.



### 4.3 Premchand : The Gift of the Cow (Trans. by Gordon C. Roadarmel)

Premchand is known for realistic novels and has been regarded by many critics as the Emperor of Hindi novels. He was writing within a "historical context that was dominated by feudal system and its value, :-colonialism, slavery and exploitation and also with the growing capitalistic system ... Premchand's creativity is contextualised by the National Freedom Struggle, which focussed itself against British Colonialism, Capitalism and Feudalism. This context has a very important effect on his writings and we find that those are essentially anti-feudal, anti-capitalist and anti-colonial"<sup>31</sup> Gandhian and socialistic philosophy, as we have already seen, influenced his political vision and "essentially he was a humanist ...

his humanism was firmly rooted in material life and was basically practical. .. governed by moral values, by the concepts of the good and evil, the right and the wrong.'<sup>n</sup> This "essential humanism" is all pervasive in ~is writings, especially novels. He is not a realist in technically strict European sense but he is a realist with a vision, with a mission and with "author's own intensive experience of social process"<sup>33</sup> who portray human life with all its charm, excitement, love, affection, faith, morals, tension, pain, trauma, misery, pessimism and optimism. Most of his novels have been written with peasants as the lead characters and with villages as the centre stage. This is a very peculiar feature of his novels and makes his task much difficult to portray a realistic view. "But this is the evidence of Premchand' s creative excellence and his thorough understanding of the peasantry and their life that led him to write on the peasants with artistic portrayal of their lives, its realities and expectations. This effort also laid the foundation for realistic tradition of the Indian novel. " <sup>34</sup> This effort also "widened the frontiers of realism so as to include 126 m its orbit the peasant and the rural masses, most effectively. The village for Premchand was not an idyllic paradise but a world full of tension, conflict and struggle. The centre of the stage which was till then reserved only for the middle class visionary was for the first time thrown open to the village yoke, who was represent:ng the contemporary situation much more effectively than any other segment of Indian society. And, he could do it with the help of real characters from the countryside, drawing richly for his own experience, which gives validity and authenticity to his art ... he was the first novelist to reach the rural society. He was, again, the first artist to view and present our rural society not as an idyll but as an arena of life built of conflicting power groups. His village is, in fact, the picture of mini-India with all its contradiction, pulls and pressures, aspirations and failures, power and potentials. It is this complex but live reality which lends colour, beauty, power and sublimity to his art. ,<sup>35</sup> \ There is a holistic representation in the portrayal of life, with its totality, of his characters, with artistic unity highlighting on the rural and urban settings, dialectical and contradictory association of individuals with the socio-eco-cultural systems and a vision to achieve harmony. He wrote

novels on a variety of subjects dealing with Freedom Struggle, capitalism, feudalism and colonialism, 'Untouchability' widow remarriage and prostitution. There is no direct novel on 'Untouchability' (except Karambhoomi) but there are several reflections in almost every novel on this issue. This may be said here that the 'Untouchability' was the social reality of his times and as a realistic, he couldn't afford to ignore it while depicting a realistic picture of the Indian society. The way this problem has been depicted, it can be analysed with two perspectives: one, politically, it is guided by the Gandhian approach and two, 127 artistically, it has presented a very realistic depiction of the community, their trauma and pain and in doing so Premchand also expressed his understanding of the issue, which, sometimes but in a limited ways, goes beyond the Gandhian approach. This transcendence of thought is

characteristically important to analyse the works of Premchand because "as a writer with a social role and responsibility" 36 Premchand was having a political vision, close to Gandhi, but as literary aesthetician, he transcends his political worldview that becomes 'essentially humanist'. With this understanding of his political and literary vision, we would now analyse his most celebrated work Godan. Godan was published in 1936, some months before Premchand's death, and got world over acclaim, established a new tradition of Indian novel writings and above all presented a very authentic and realistic view of the contemporary Indian peasants and middle class lives. Many critics consider it "as a saga of Indian rural life whose protagonist Hori is the archetypal Indian peasant in his meekness and humanity."37 The plot is, apparently, very simple that narrates the life and the struggle for life of its protagonist, Hori along with his family (Dhania, his wife, Gobar, his son, Sona and Rupa, his daughters and his brothers) who lives in a village called Belari, somewhere in the Awadh province, in acute poverty and struggles everyday either in the field or elsewhere to earn a square meal a day, which becomes the toughest task throughout their lives. The family (especially Hori) is trapped in the worst network of vicious circle of poverty, debt and ritual conservatism that was characteristic of the Indian peasants' life during the first half of the last century. 128 The novel depicts, in the best tradition of literary expression, hopes and despairs, optimism and pessimism and rebellion analysing the very mindsets of the farmers, zamindars, moneylenders, priests and others in the villages of India and

exploitation of the poor at all levels comes out as the central concern of the novel. The novel also narrates the dynamics of the village life, particularly the inter-community dynamics, and its politics. This has been done in a holistic manner (not emphasising on any one particular community or system) keeping, objectively, the life of the peasants and their exploitation in the centre of the novel, highlighting problems of debt, 'Untouchability', 'Varna system', zamindari system, 'Begar' and over-all political system of the preIndependence Indian society. The objective holistic construction of the novel would be evident from a very quick look on the major characters, which represents almost the whole gamut of the contemporary Indian society. For instance, Hori has been described as the representative of the Indian Peasant who "is the victim of social determinism"<sup>38</sup> but humane and honest, with land as his cherished value and cow a life-long dream. Dhania, "a sharp-tongued yet tender, compassionate and querulous by turns, in open rebellion against her oppressors yet traditional in certain basic way"<sup>39</sup> represents best model of traditional and illiterate rural womenfolk. Gobar is a growing youth representing anger and fear; ambition and cowardice. Datadin epitomises priestly Brahman class in the village and Silia represents the Dalit community. "Rai Saheb (Zamindar) is another character who oscillates between two modes. He depends almost entirely on his estate for survival and is not above squeezing his poor tenants when he need money, yet the author is eager to show that he is really not a crook <sup>129</sup> at all-perhaps merely a victim of circumstance."<sup>40</sup> Mehta represents intelligentsia while Malti does for the western educated urban Indian woman; Khanna embodies values of the industrial capitalism. It is precisely due to this holistic construction of the novel that Go dan has been regarded 'the prose epic' by many critics. The plot is interwoven with the urban life also representing the urban middle class (Mehta, Malti, Khanna, Onkar Nath and other in their circle) and its contradictions (particularly in terms of tradition-modernity dichotomy) that raises several questions faced by the contemporary middle class breeding disappointment, isolation and rootlessness. At the story level, these strands: urban and rural "are interlinked through contrasts and parallels, but in the 'discourse' the gap between them presents an aesthetic problem."<sup>41</sup> Some other critics like Meenakshi Mukherjee finds more than two strands at

the story level<sup>42</sup> which are important in the analysis of the novel, viz., A. Hori's story, and around him the story of his family and his village; B. Gobar's story, moving from the village to the city; C. Rai Saheb's story, straddling the village and the city; D. Mehta and Malti's story, and that of their coterie in the city. Here it is noticeable that how each of the above four strands are well connected as has been emphasised by Meenakshi Mukherjee that "A and B begin together although B branches off later; C and D are closely connected because although Rai Saheb's land is in the village he has social as well as financial dealings with the urban professional class. Premchand takes care to interlink the different strands in as many ways as possible. A and B touch because there is a feudal relationship between Rai Saheb and Hori; B and D are connected because Gobar is first employed by Mirza Khurshed in the city, later by Dr. Malti Kaul. A and D get linked when Mehta and Malti come to the village to help the people of Belari. Only B and C<sup>43</sup> can never meet or converge. Thus, *Godan* becomes a classic novel on the Indian peasantry and is objectively well knit and carefully interwoven. But if we take into account the whole range of works by Premchand, we find that *Godan* also represents his disillusionment with the system and from the prescriptive narrative, as unlike his other works including short stories, he does not suggest any solution. "*Godan* has no utopia to look forward to or to fall back on. Since there is no system to be saved, the novel begins with a disequilibrium and ends at a disequilibrium. It excites a sense of profound wrong done to humanity. It makes no attempt at papering the cracks or providing a happy ending. In fact, such a piece of literary art goes beyond the text and establishes a living relationship with life. It is literature of this type, that, according to Sartre, succeeds through failure ... "<sup>44</sup> Coming to the political consciousness among the Dalits as represented in the *Godan*, we find that there is only representational depiction of the issue but this representational narrative is, unlike any other work of Premchand, powerful one. As we have mentioned earlier that there are overlapping usages of different castes in Premchand's literature, in this novel also, the caste of the protagonist, Hori is not mentioned though there are some indicators to infer his caste identity, for example, there is a reference to his caste status when Datadeen trapped him for sharing his crop and deceptively said, "I'm not your foe. You annoy me. My good man, what was there<sup>131</sup> to feel so delicate about? We are all in it together, aren't we? How does it matter if you are a low caste ( 'Shudra' in Hindi version) and I am Brahmin? We are all members of one family. Oh, we all have our ups and downs. If something happens to me tomorrow, whose help will I seek if not yours?"<sup>45</sup> This reference, along with some other ones, indicates that Hori belongs to the lower caste and represents them, who are poor, debt-trapped and exploited. If we explore his political mind, we find that he was also representing the contemporary political understanding prevalent in his community that was exploited in the name of religion, tradition or prestige. It is to be noted that the protagonist is also illiterate, inarticulate, fatalistic and poor. At the same time, his son, Gobar is representing the young generation, though rebellion (in its embryonic form) but also not articulated politically, who refuses to be 'a

victim of circumstances' but in the end fall prey to these circumstances, despite his efforts to change the life of his family and himself. It should be kept in mind here that the whole novel is contextualised in the northern Indian village, where there was no political leader like Ambedkar and the voice of the Dalit community was not expressed politically. But there is another reference in *Godan* that addresses Dalit discourse in significant ways. This is the Matadeen and Selia episode. Matadeen is the son of the village priest, Datadeen and Selia is a Dalit ('Chamar' in Hindi version) woman. She loves Matadeen and has also got physical association with him but Datadeen maintains, despite physical intimacy and her devotion, a distance with her due to her caste status and

treats her with disrespect and indignity as Premchand mentions that Matadeen "cunningly exploited her love for him: now she was no more than a 132 machine which worked at his bidding."<sup>46</sup> Matadeen also humiliated her when she was giving handful of grain as return of her debt to Dulari from his stock, which was practically the result of her labour. Further, when she asked from Matadeen, "Have I no right over your things?" Matadeen, shamelessly replied, "no, you have no claim over me. You work, you are paid for it. If you want to give away my things, you can't do it. If this work does not suit you, find another. There is no shortage of workers here."<sup>47</sup> (This is English translation and does not convey proper meaning of the Hindi version, which is very harsh and blunt. Last line of Matadeen's speech is also not translated that says, "this is not Be gar; we are giving food and clothes. for this."). Selia felt deeply hurt and humiliated. This indicates towards oppressive and humiliating treatment by the upper castes for Dalits. They exploited Dalits in all possible ways: socially, economically and physically. Here Premchand has portrayed Selia's pain in a serious and delicate manner when he writes, "Selia looked helplessly at Matadeen like a bird which has been turned out of the cage with wings clipped. " <sup>48</sup> "It was difficult to say whether she was feeling pain much or condemning ... she said nothing. She resumed work with broken heart and inactive hands experiencing a lump of salt in her throat. "<sup>49</sup>

This episode, till this point of time in the novel, points out the helplessness of the Dalit women, who were not finding political ways to articulate their anger and were made unable to protest. But immediately after this incident, another incident took place, which is very political in its expression and represents another discourse of the Dalit movement during those times. 133 A group of Dalit community led by Selia's father, mother, two brothers, surrounded Matadeen and subsequently snapped his sacred thread ('janayu ') and forced him to eat a piece of bone as a mark of protest and 'revenge' for his deeds. Her father, Harkhu said, "we shall degrade Matadeen to a cobbler's ( 'Chamar' in Hindi version) position, even if we have to shed our blood to do so. Selia is a girl; she has to live with one man or the other. We have no quarrel on this point. But whoever keeps her must keep her with dignity. If you can't make us Brahmins, we can make you cobblers." 50 "If you can make us Brahmins, make us, our whole community is ready and if you don't have that guts, then you also be 'Chamars '. Live with us and eat with us." 51 Afterwards, "two cobblers dashed forward and seized Matadeen's hands. The third pulled and ~mapped his sacred thread. Before Datadeen and Jhenguri Singh could recover from their surprise, two cobblers had thiUst a big piece of bone into Matadeen's mouth. Matadeen clenched his teeth but even then the loathsome object got between his lips. His gorge rose and as his lips opened the bone slipped into his mouth. Attracted by the noise, people came running. Strangely enough no one came forward to grapple with the defilers of dharma, Matadeen had alienated on and all by his objectionable behaviour with the young girls of the village. Outwardly the villagers put up a show of fight; at heart they were pleased to see Matadeen getting a taste of his own medicine. "52 Premchand narrates this incident in a delicate way and comments on hypocrisy of Brahminism when he writes, "Matadeen stretched himself on the ground. He felt listless. His Brahmin's vanity had vanished into thin air. That piece of bone had not only polluted his mouth but his soul also. However much penance he might do, however much holy water he drank, however much money he gave in 134 charity, however many pilgrimages he undertook, his lost dharma would not return. From today he would be considered an untouchable in his own house." 53 Towards the end of this incident, we find that Selia was given shelter by Dhanias, who justified her father and community's action. Dhanias supported their action saying, "All rnen are alike. When Matadeeu humiliated Selia, no one raised a litter finger in protest, but when Matadeen comes in for trouble, he

gets all the sympathy in the world. Has Selia no dharma of her own? That man Harkhu did well in beating up these holy da ,54 goon s ... Now Selia is living in Hori's house and has one son, Ramu who is very naughty. Matadeen was 'purified' through 'shuddhi yagna' by the Pundits of Benaras. But this 'purification' has changed him a lot as Premchand writes, "well, the penance did really purify him: from that day he developed a revulsion for dharma, discarded the sacred thread, and dumped his priesthood in the Ganga. For he realised that although his patron still asked him to work out auspicious dates and consulted him in matters of marriages and births, they refused water from his hands and did not allow him to touch their utensils: this in spite of the fact that the Pundits of Benaras had accepted him as a Brahmin. In disgust, he turned a tiller of the soil. "55 He has realised that his religion is hypocrite and has double standards. Now he, somehow, tries to be with Selia, especially her son. One day, her son Ramu dies due to pneumonia and this becomes a critical juncture in the life of Matadeen, who now comes openly in grief and "carried the dead body (of Ramu) to the cremation ground by the side of the river, a mile away. For eight days 'his hands remained stiff. He is not ashamed today, has no hesitation." 56 After one month of Ramu's death, he came to Selia and dedicated himself to her, fully repented and changed. Here also, the whole narrative used by 135 Premchand is noteworthy. For instance, when he comes to Selia saying, "I am not afraid of anyone" 57 and then moves towards Selia's house and declared to be there, "this is our house, this is my temple. " 58 And when Selia asked, "how will you remain a Brahmin?" he replied boldly, "I want to be a cobbler (Chamar in Hindi version). All those who fulfil their dharma are Brahmins, all those who violate their dharma are cobblers. " 59 And in this way, he becomes fully devoted to Selia demolishing false Brahmanism, which he realised was a sham. There have been numerous interpretations of the Matadeen-Selia episode by the critics. Some found it progressive keeping in mind the time and space of the novel. Sadanand Shahi regards that this incident "exposed not only the very hypocrisy of the 'Varna system' but also advocates Dalits' protest to this. This prepares a background for the future Dalit movement that has dignity and equality as its primary goals. " 60 Some other critics argued that Ambedkar rather than Gandhi vis-a-vis this incident influences Premchand and he would have been affected by the Temple Entry and other radical movements led by Dr. Ambedkar in the western part of the country. Several Dalit critics like Kanwal Bharati and Shyoraj Singh 'Bechain' have also interpreted this episode in different ways. They regard that though Premchand depicted problems of the Dalit community but in the final analysis who got liberated: J\Matadeen or Selia? In the end, Matadeen transformed himself and became 'Chamar' but the Brahmin~; and other upper castes did not accept Selia. This, in their opinion, is another contradiction in Premchand's writing, where there may be some instance (in fact, this episode is the one of the very few instances) of individual transformation but the upper castes, in general, have not accepted the lower castes. In fact, this reflects 136 the contemporary Dalit discourse

that was prevalent in northern India where, different kinds of activities like 'Shuddhi' and others were taking place to consolidate their position as highlighted by Swami Achhutanand, as discussed earlier. But these paradoxes are to be analysed contextually along with other paradoxes (for example, characterisation of Rai Saheb, Mehta and Malti) and these are "coexistence of contradictory traits"<sup>61</sup> and "the paradoxes inherent in Godan, though not always creative or fruitful, have to be seen in terms of the peculiar tensions of Premchand's time, both in his life and in Indian literary history. " <sup>62</sup> It is evident by now that Premchand's literature deals with variety of issues including oppression of the Dalit community, which remains an unavoidable social reality of his times. Before moving to analyse another work of Hindi literature on the life of the Dalits, Dharti Dhan Na

Apana (1972) by Jagdish Chandra, it would be pertinent to have a quick understanding of the politics during the intervening period. The focus of the Dalit movement during 1910 to 1950 was on the struggle for recognition of human existence and socio-political right. It was during these years that some parts of the United Province got inspired by the Ambedkarite approach to Dalit liberation and started addressing this issue politically. We have seen, earlier in this work, that Swami Achhutanand and Baba Ram Charan, who got inspired by Dr. Ambedkar, were leading the Dalit community in their struggle. Differences between Ambedkar and Gandhi were having impact shaping Dalit identity in this part, though with a slow and gradual development of the Dalit consciousness. It has already been discussed that the Gandhian framework largely influenced northern India but by mid- 1940s a section of Dalits (disillusioned from the Arya Samaj and Reformist movements) rejected his framework and moved towards adopting the ideas of Dr. Ambedkar. We find that Jatavas in Agra formed the Jatava Youth League, which by 1941, had branches in Rajasthan, Punjab and Madhya Bharat. In 1944 another important development, the formation of United Province Scheduled Castes Federation took place, which was formed under the influence of Dr. Ambedkar's All India Scheduled Castes Federation. All these developments were preparing ground for consolidated political mobilisation, which



subsequently led to formation of the Republican Party of India (RPI) in 1956. Conversion to Buddhism, led by Dr. Ambedkar in 1956, had a great ripple effect that "freed the Scheduled Castes from mental and psychological enslavement"<sup>63</sup> heralding a new era in the course of the Dalit/ movement making the issues of identity, mobilisation and empowerment the very focus of the struggle. During 1960s, two other important factors affected the identity formation among the Dalits, viz., the temporary decline of the Indian National Congress after the 1967 elections and entry of the middle and backwards classes (OBCs) into politics that reflected changing caste composition in the region. Though RPI had a brief political existence (due to its internal factions, lack of dynamic leadership and appropriation by the Congress), it had great impact on the process of identity formation among Dalits. During early 1970s, "the most interesting socio-political development among Ambedkar's followers is the rise of the Dalit Panthers, a militant group of young educated Buddhists ... (who) offered a challenge to unite to the politicians in Ambedkar's movement and attempted to counter violence against Untouchables in the village."<sup>64</sup> The Dalit Panthers also brought to the fore 138 emerging Dalit literature (especially in Marathi) and immensely contributed for a "tough, realistic, unorthodox literature, (and) a new socio-political movement. " <sup>65</sup> All these developments had a gradual but great impact on formation of the Dalit identity and their political consciousness, though there were significant variations in its expression at an all-India level as has been noticed by Sudha Pai, "the pace of change was however, different in different regions leading to uneven development of the Dalit movement across the subcontinent in the post-Independence period. While parts of colonial Southern and Western India experienced strong movements demanding reservations and improved social status under leaders such as B. R. Ambedkar and M. C. Rajah, these were conspicuous by their absence in most parts of north India. In U P, the lack of an anti-caste ideology or social reform movements and the mobilisational impact of the Indian National Congress led to the development of the passive identity of harijan and the notion of uplift without questioning the caste hierarchy. Poverty and backwardness were significant contributory factors. While the influence of Ambedkar is seen in the late colonial period, it came too late, was limited to a small section of the population and failed to have the transformative effect it did in Maharashtra. "<sup>66</sup> Hence, the literary expression of this kind of political situation itself becomes a complex and difficult task as it

has to narrate and represent several contradictions and complexities which were faced by the society in general and the Dalit community in particular.

The Gift of a Cow is set in Oudh (now Uttar Pradesh), in the area around Lucknow. The novel follows the stories of many characters, but the central one is Hori Ram, who lives with his family in the small village of Belari.

Hori is a poor farmer, a decent soul but, like practically all the other villagers, deeply indebted (and trapped in a vicious circle of inescapable, ever-increasing debt). Hori believes in the order of the day, which also means putting the welfare of the local zamindar (landowner) Rai Sahib Amarpal Singh ahead of that of his family. Hori's wife, Dhaniya, is more practical, preventing some of Hori's worst excesses -- but not all of them.

The title of the novel -- Godaan in the original -- refers to, as the glossary explains, "the gift of a cow made by a pious Hindu to a brahman at the time of death", but while Hori's longing for a cow to call his own plays a role in parts of the book this -- and the hope he will have one to give at his death -- isn't an overwhelming part of the plot. Instead, Premchand offers a far broader tapestry. Aside from Hori's family, several other characters' lives and fates are closely followed, and the book also shifts back and forth from country life (Hori's village) to that in the city.

Getting a cow is something Hori does dream of:

It was his life's ambition, his greatest dream, since any ideas of living off bank interest, of buying land or of building a mansion were too grandiose for his cramped mind to comprehend.

In fact, however, the book begins with his dream being fulfilled -- but the perfidy of a ne'er-do-well brother means that this happiness lasts only a short while.

Among the consequences of his having accepted the cow, from a herdsman from a neighbouring village, Bhola, is that Hori's son Gobar falls head over heels in love with Bhola's widowed daughter, Jhuniya, and begins an affair with her. When she gets pregnant Gobar brings her to his family's home -- or almost does: he sends her ahead, then high-tails it to town (where he will make some good money, but completely ignores his family for a year). The proper thing for Hori and his wife to do is not to allow Jhuniya over their threshold, but they are decent folk (which, in this society, means they are weak), and they do the right thing and take the poor pregnant girl in. This casts all in dishonour (including Jhuniya's dad), and the whole village is outraged.

Caste is one of the central features of this society. The villagers are largely of the same caste,

and it is the main thing that binds them together, making them a sort of extended family. But caste brings obligations with it, and violating the rules can mean excommunication. Bringing someone like Jhuniya -- who has dishonoured her family by her actions -- into their home is a major no-no. Hori is only fined -- though that too is a devastating blow -- but there is at least one dramatic excommunication in the book, in which chamars (an untouchable caste) defile a brahman and make him an outcaste. (Lots of cash then

bring him back in the fold, but even so no one will eat food he has cooked or truly treat him as one of their own again.)

The village is a place of odd contrasts: on the one hand everyone (except Hori) is trying to screw everyone over, trying to turn things to their own advantage and gain an edge -- or a bit of money -- wherever possible (and there are many opportunities). On the other hand, there is an often surprising generosity of spirit and a willingness to help those who are down on their luck.

The major problem in the village is that everyone is deep in debt -- and that the debts keep growing. Borrow thirty rupees and, before you know it, what with fees and compound interest you owe two hundred. Premchand devotes considerable space to money-lending practices -- understandable, since money-lending is so central to all these lives. (The unavailability of ready credit at reasonable terms is convincingly presented as one of the main reasons why the life of the villagers is as miserable as it is, a social problem requiring a solution.)

Cash problems don't only plague the poor and rural folk: much of the novel also centres around a rich, urban class: the zamindar and his circle of acquaintances, which includes lawyers, professors, industrialists, doctors, newspaper editors, and businessmen. Several of them also have money-trouble -- though things work out much more easily for them (Premchand not treating their difficulties as seriously, and solving them far too easily). But even they recognise that the system has gone wrong, Raj Sahib lamenting:

Our parasitic existence has crippled us. (...) Sometimes I think the government would do us a big favour by confiscating our lands and making us work for a living. (...) We've fallen prey to the system, a system that's completely destroying us. Until we're freed from the chains of wealth, the curse will keep hanging over our heads and we'll never reach those heights of manhood which are life's ultimate goal.

Yes, *The Gift of a Cow* is a political novel, and Premchand occasionally preaches -- but generally he concentrates more on recounting the lives of these many characters and showing by example. (An interesting aspect of Premchand's approach is the almost complete absence of any British colonial presence, despite being set in pre-independence times.)

The contrast between village and city life is quite well handled, and there is considerable cross-over between the two, involving several of the characters. Gobar is the main one bridging the two worlds: first he does well in town, but then returns to do the right thing in his village. Taking Jhuniya back to the city with him everything then goes wrong there.

Premchand suggests the ways in which each locale goes wrong, approving of the political awareness in town, but concerned by the lack of personal connexions, the fraying of the social fabric holding much of society together (despite his strong opposition to aspects of those connexions, especially the often unreasonable demands of caste).

Premchand describes individual incidents well, and when he focusses on unfolding events the book is often very impressive. Juggling many stories he does, however, lose track of -- or ignore -- some,

bringing them back when convenient without adequately accounting for the transitions that have occurred. Gobar's absences are only the most obvious; many of the rich folks' stories are also only partially told.

Premchand is very ambitious, and he does tell a good story, offering a good, teeming picture of Indian society of this time. Still, it's more than he can handle, and too much is ultimately reduced to a too simplistic level. But the book is still impressive and, if anything, one wishes that he had been more patient and taken more time to fully realise the many fascinating stories he offers brief glimpses of.

It's not a happy world -- "If there weren't injustice in the world, why would people call it hell ?" -- but the novel offers a rich picture of humanity, and fairly well-presented social criticism . And it's a good, engaging read.

#### **References:**

1. Baker , M . *In Other Words -- A Casebook on Translation*, New York- London: Routledge1997.
2. Gentzer, Edwin, *Contemporary Translation Theories*, London, Routledge1993.
3. Malone, Joseph.L, *The Science of Linguistics in the Art of Translation* NY Press1988

**UNIT – V INDIAN LITERATURE IN TRANSLATION  
(SHS5010)**

## Unit – V Short Stories

### 5.1 Bama : Harum-Scarum Saar and Other Stories. (Trans. Ravi Shanker)

Bama Faustina is a Dalit feminist woman writer who draws all her experiences and depictions from the Dalit movement in Tamil Nadu. Her writing is a source of strength to the growing Dalit consciousness. One of her most famous work is “Karukku” (1992) in which a Dalit woman has been shown to be speaking in her own voice about the experience of being Dalit. The text explores the connections between caste, religion and Tamil identity, and is largely autobiographical. It has also been translated into French. Her other novel, “Sangati Events” (1994), which was translated into French much before the English translation came about is a cultural biography of a community and a powerful feminist narrative which brings together the experiences of Dalit women. Through her work, Bama takes pride in her Dalit identity. Her works also portray the strategies of resistance used by Dalit women and her collection of short stories, “Kisumbukkaran” (1991), translated as “Harum-scarum saar and other Stories” (2006), focus on vignettes of the lives of Dalit men and women. In the literary world, Bama has a double identity- that of a woman writer and a Dalit writer. In general, through her works, she gives a very genuine description of the condition of Dalit women in Tamil Nadu, who are poor and illiterate and are exploited not just by upper castes outside their homes, but also by men within their own community. Her works deal with women’s problems, particularly gender inequality and violence, rape and sexual assaults within a society that is still socially oppressed. Bama’s contribution to Dalit literature is significant in terms of the use of Dalit vocabulary. Her use of Dalit spoken idiom as her narratorial voice gives distinct resonance to her writing. The author-narrator and the characters use the same non-standardized spoken Dalit vocabulary. Her syntax reflects the 35 speech patterns of Dalit women. The Dalit men and women exhibit their triumph over the upper castes through rebuttal, witty remarks and usage of abusive language. Thus, for them language becomes a device for belittling and showing non-compliance towards upper caste authority. Almost all the characters are bold and represent staunch courage to revolt against upper caste domination. She uses the confessional, conversational mode of narration in both “Karrukku” and “Sangati Events”. Bama’s writing celebrates Dalit women’s lives, their wit, humour, resilience and their creativity. They are shown as hardworking, courageous women, who work ceaselessly at home and outside and manage the household singlehandedly, especially when their men folk are rounded up by the police over trumped up charges. The community bonding and the solidarity among neighbours in a ‘cheri’ (Dalit colony) are valorized. Despite dual pressures of work at home and in their workplace, which is usually the fields, Dalit women are forced to put up with economic violence at male hands. She urges upon Dalits to educate

themselves, read the Bible on their own and recognize Jesus as a defender of the oppressed. Dalit writers in Tamil place an enormous emphasis on the possibilities of empowerment of Dalits through education. In their view, it is education that empowers Dalits to rise above the casteist codification of social relations. Writers like Bama and Sivakami hold that feminism has to reinvent itself in order to integrate the woman question with the Dalit woman question. “

The lives of the underprivileged and the altered perceptions of the educated youngsters among them are constant refrains in Bama's works.

Harum Scarum Saar and Other Stories; Bama, Translated by N. Ravi Shankar, Published by Women Unlimited (an associate of Kali for Women), Rs. 150. THE identity, that of 'Dalit literature', helps bring writings on atrocities committed against a particular section of society, to the attention of litterateurs and readers worldwide. Bama, a noted Dalit writer, is certainly a vibrant recorder of the perpetrators and victims of this unique curse of Indian society, the caste system. Her works, published over the years, have won acclaim among the reading public of Tamil Nadu and through a couple of translations, from readers elsewhere.

Bama's "Harum-scarum saar and other stories" is a collection of short stories which was translated from the original, "Kisumbukkaran" in the year 2006 by Women UNLIMITED, an associate of Kali for Women. Of the ten powerful stories that form a part of this collection, only five of them delineate issues related to gender identity. Bama has depicted powerful women who exhibit grit, courage and determination to fight against the oddities of life. Most of the women characters fight against the moneyed upper caste people through the use of subversive humour and abusive language. They exhibit 38 varying modes of resistance and rebellion to defy upper caste authority. She has projected women who are not mowed down by exploitation, but who emerge victorious in the battle of caste and class. One comes across images of empowerment through varying forms of retaliation and resistance exhibited by the women. Being a Dalit writer herself, Bama sympathizes with the sufferings and exploitations endured by the lower caste women at the hands of their wealthy landlords. In her collection of short stories, Bama has represented diverse shades of women characters, describing their experiences and hardships. While on one hand, she has painted characters such as Arulayi, Chellakkilli, Kaliyamma and Ramayi who bear the brunt of injustice and exploitation, she has also drawn powerful characters such as Arayi, Ponnuthayi and Pachayamma who retaliate against the dehumanized treatment and injustice meted out to them by their upper caste employers, on the other. For instance, Arayi



retaliates against the dehumanized treatment meted out to her by her employers by leaving their job without informing them. Through her courage and fortitude, Pachayamma emerges out of a critical situation and escapes imprisonment. Ponnuthayi boldly defies all the societal norms and severs all ties with her children and drunkard husband. She asserts her individuality and independence by selling her 'tali' and setting up a shop from its sale proceeds. Through these stories, we encounter empowered women characters such as Ponnuthayi and Pachayamma who exhibit traits like confidence, courage, grit, independence, determination, retaliation and assertiveness. All of these come into the forefront when the women are shown trying to turn the adversities of their life situations to their advantage. 39 Celebration of childhood and innocence in the stories is replaced by its loss, vulnerability to exploitation and abuse and a burden of responsibilities, as is seen in the characters of Chellakilli and Ramayi. One actually evinces child-adult continuity through the depiction of childhood as a life phase. Women's voices and their agency through their negotiating abilities also get vividly reflected through these stories.

### **Serious voice**

Her translation of *Karukku* won the Crossword Prize in 2001. Two other novels in Tamil, *Sangati* and *Vanamam*, have also helped to establish her voice as one to be taken serious note of. This collection of ten short stories, *Harum-Scarum Saar and Other Stories*, translated into English by N. Ravi Shanker, is the latest in the growing number of English translations of Tamil fiction. Bama's stories vividly bring to

mind nostalgic experiences of rural Tamil Nadu, even while they speak of harsh realities. The lives of underprivileged people, the indignities they suffer, and the altered perceptions of the educated younger generations among these victimised groups &#151; these are the refrains that echo through Bama's works. In "Pongal", for instance, the father, a hardened worker rooted in 'tradition', is upset when his son refuses to accompany the family to greet the "master" on Pongal day. He returns with nothing but Pongal after the visit and realises what a person with some self-respect ought to do in such a situation. He throws the Pongal given to him by the master's wife into the feeding trough of the cattle. Bama's wry comment: "the cattle, finding something strange in it (the Pongal), ignored the stuff and drank only water", illustrates clearly the indifference of the landlord and the disillusionment of the farmhand. We have Annachi, in the story of the same name, and Puthiamuthu of "Harum-Scarum Saar", who are bold enough to challenge the

conventional deference of the 'upper' castes. Ammasi is needled into addressing his father's mudalali as Annachi (elder brother) and is tried by the village court for the offence. "You ask me why I called a Naicker, annachi, ... all men are just men," he says. Puthiyamuthu of "Harum-Scarum Saar" is another character who, when pushed to the limits of his endurance, astounds his master with a sharp retort. After Puthiyamuthu, gritting his teeth silently, finishes an endless series of chores, the landlord asks him, "What shall we do now?" Puthiyamuthu "... spat out, ...bring your wife here, we will take turns bedding her. Ramasami looked absolutely stricken, as if he had just seen a ghost." Though this passage extracts a chuckle from the reader, it does not fail to register the protagonist's unexploded anger. Bama indicates with sensitivity that small acts of defiance, whether using the same chair as the master at the barber's shop or sitting on the bench with the upper castes, might just be the harbingers of social changes yet to come. The stories of Masanam Thatha's effort to seek justice by bringing to book an upper-caste sex-offender, or Arayi Patti and Subramani's decision to put an end to their misery by freeing themselves from the shackles of oppressive masters and mistresses, spell hope for society.

### **Woman power**

The stories, "Chilli Powder" and "Ponnuthayi", proclaim what real woman power is and what it can achieve. Ponnuthayi is a new-age woman who can shake off the tyranny of a husband and sell her thali to buy goods for the new shop she plans to set up. The stories, even when they speak of sorrow and misery, are full of what the blurb aptly calls a 'rustic humour' that softens the harshness of the real word/ world. To translate native humour and bawdy words into a language that might be so very alien to the cultural context of the original text is, indeed, very difficult. More so, when the author's language is a specific dialect. N. Ravi Shanker, the translator, has done a good job. Very often, though, his translations of idioms and metaphors are rigidly literal, and this might make them baffling to a non-Tamil reader.

Not much happens in the tales in Bama's Harum-Scarum Saar and Other Stories. Most of them act as small character studies, focusing on notable individuals. There's Kisambukkaran, the "harum-scarum saar" of the title, who fearlessly kills snakes, who allows sparrows to eat his father's crops and who delights in tricking an old man who is unnecessarily suspicious of his wife's fidelity. Ponnathayi, who

leaves her husband to start her own business; Malandithatha, whose smiling exterior conceals a great deal of rage and Ammasi, whose great crime is to casually refer to a member of another caste as "annachi", or "brother".

The rebellions in Bama's stories are all small ones. A small boy urinates on the plant whose leaves his employer uses to do her cooking. A family choose to symbolically throw away the pongal received from their landlord in a most unequal exchange. A boy refuses to give up a hard-won seat in a bus simply because the man asking claims higher caste status. It becomes clear that the reason there isn't much narrative progress within these stories is that the larger plot is caste (and more, the whole system of social inequalities of which caste may be only part). Bama doesn't envision revolution; there's nothing in this collection to suggest that a single social upheaval could fix everything. But these tiny rebellions are a continuous process, a constant chip-chipping away at inequality.

The rebellions in question are celebrated. The characters in these stories display a gleeful contempt of those oppressing them; the narration is colloquial and casual and frequently wonderfully eloquent (N. Ravi Shanker's translation does a fine job of conveying the feel of the spoken language). Bama often chooses to end a story abruptly just as its hero has delivered a brilliant bit of repartee and so our last sight of them has them clearly in charge, with their opponents utterly taken aback. The reader (unless she is very naïve) knows that this isn't really enough for victory, that the system has means at its disposal for recovering from these attacks and restoring the status quo. But knowing that doesn't detract from the delight of seeing the underdog win, however temporarily, and for seeing Dalit characters as active, often playful, agents rather than simple victims.

Yet we're not allowed to forget the magnitude of the odds these characters must face. Often it is dropped into the story casually (Malandithatha has already paid over a thousand rupees' interest on a two-hundred rupee loan), but occasionally it forms the focus of the story. For most of its duration *Rich Girl* is not about a rich girl at all, but about a family struggling to balance the parents' jobs, the daughter's education, supervision for the baby and earning enough to live on. The daughter is the "rich girl" of the title — on the last page of the story she explains excitedly that the landlord has given them a hundred rupees to compensate for the death of her father as he was trying to save the landlord's cow. And we're not allowed to forget that violence is gendered, as when Ponnuthayi's insistence on leaving an abusive spouse earns her the censure of most of her community.

If the stories in this collection deny us the possibility of a revolution, there is also a quiet

background narrative of gradual change. In Pongal it's implied that it's his education that spurs Esakkimuthu to question his family's treatment by the landlord. In Chilli Powder, Gangamma may have the law and the police on her side, but she can't stand up to the other women when they work as a group. Those Days is another story about a positive change that seems to be taking place — once again by coming together as a group, Masanamthatha and his allies are able to demand a dignity that should already be theirs by right. "That's how it was, those days. Now we won't spare anyone, not even if he comes armed with two tusks. Ama!"

For instance, The story 'Pongal' taken from a short story collection "Harum Scarum Saar and Other stories" by Bama expresses hopelessness and downtrodden condition of the dalits. They are even deprived of food. Having lost all his hopes the protagonist resolves to sell his belongings but, we find that since he belongs to lower caste, there is no one to purchase them. Thus, his dalit identity turns out to be a curse for him. Ultimately he decides to approach the village landlord for getting some work but there also he is severely exploited. After spending a couple of months on that place, he is forced to handover all the cultivated crop production and left only to a plantain leaf full of rice to celebrate the festival Pongal. The rice is inedible even for animals. Even in spite of all these hardships and adversities this man does not lose his hope and manages to send his children to school. Despite achieving higher education his elder son remains unemployed because so called dalit identity is always there with him. The plight of this hungry family even on the occasion of festival Pongal not only arouses our emotions but also depicts the inhuman and stony hearted attitude of the upper class people towards the human beings of lower class.

## 5.2 Gulzar : Raavi Paar and Other Stories

Sampooran Singh Kalra (1934), known as popularly by his pen name Gulzar, is an Indian poet, lyricist and film director. Born in Jhelum district in British India, his family moved to India after partition. Before becoming a writer, Sampooran worked in Mumbai as a car mechanic in a garage. His father rebuked him for being writer initially. He took pen name Gulzar Deenvi and later simply as Gulzar. He was awarded Padma Bhushan, the third-highest civilian award in India, the Sahitya Akademi Award and the Dadasaheb Phalke Award, the highest award in Indian cinema. He has won several Indian National Film awards, Filmfare awards, one Academy and one Grammy Award for the song “Jai ho” in *Slumdog Millionaire*. Gulzar primarily writes in Urdu and Punjabi; besides several dialects of Hindi such as Braj Bhasa, Khariboli, Haryanvi and Marwari. His poetry is in Triveni type of stanza. His poems are published in three compilations: *Chand Pukhrraaj Ka*, *Raat Pashminey Ki* and *Pandrah Paanch Pachattar*. For the peace campaign (Aman ki Asha) jointly started by India’s and Pakistan’s leading media houses, Gulzar wrote the anthem “Nazar Main Rehte Ho”. Gulzar has written lyrics and dialogues for several Doordarshan TV series including *Jungle Book*, *Alice in Wonderland*, *Hello Zindgi*, *Guchche* and *Potli Baba Ki* with Vishal Bhardwaj. He has more recently written and narrated for the children’s audiobook series *Karadi Tales*. Gulzar has covered an amazing range of poignancy. *Dhuan* (2001), Urdu story by Gulzar, *My Favourite Stories: Boskys Panchatantra* (2013), is an eclectic collection of classic tales retold in an inventive story-poem format. *Half a Rupee Stories* (2013), is a collection of 25 short stories in Urdu and translated in English by Sunjoy Shekhar. *Meelo Se Din* (2013), is a collection of Hindi poems. *Kharashein* (2003), is capturing communal riots and relationships around partition. *Pukhraj* (2005), is a collection of poems. *Raavi Paar* (1999), is a collection of short stories based on the partition. *Raat Pashmine Ki* (2002), is a compilation of Gulzar’s poetry.

**Analyzing Partition through the Short Stories:** Most of Gulzar’s short stories deal with the partition of India and Pakistan. Gulzar’s family migrated to India at the partition time. Gulzar was at the age of thirteen when partition took place. So he is the living legend who suffered in the partition. In the Foreword to *Raavi Paar and Other Stories*, Gulzar pours his heart out: “I had witnessed the partition of India from very close quarters in 1947. It left me bruised and scarred. I cannot help but write about this excruciating period. I wrote the short stories with the background of the partition to try and get the painful experience out of my system.” The collection contains some haunting stories like the title story, *Raavi Paar*, *Khauf*, *Batwara*, and *Jamun ka Per*. Despite the fact that all the stories are the direct result of partition, they tell different stories of loss, fear, separation, hurt and painful memories. Though the readers are not

directly hit by partition, Gulzar's powerful narratives manage to leave an everlasting impact on the readers' mind. One of the best stories is Raavi Paar which is a heart touching story on the partition. The story of a Sikh woman who has just delivered twins and is fleeing from Pakistan on the roof of a train. One of her children survives, but the mother clasps the dead one on her breast. In a purgatorial gesture, her husband throws the child into the river, exclaiming, "Wahe Guru." It is only when he hears a scream that he realizes he has sacrificed not the dead but the living child to the river that was supposed to separate past from present. It is a chilling metaphor for Gulzar's own childhood trauma and he says, "It is I who have been left behind and drowned, it is I who have come this side." Themes in short stories of Gulzar: Some of the short stories in the latest collection, *Half a Rupee*,

translated by Sunjoy Shekhar were previously translated but to give uniformity of style Sunjoy Shekhar translates all the 25 stories in the anthology anew. In his introduction to the book, Sunjoy Shekhar states a "belief that a community, a society, a nation is as strong and healthy as the stories they tell themselves" (*Half a Rupee*, 2).

The collection consists of different themes like extraordinary men in Gulzaar's life, ordinary men, army stories, a day in the life of terrorists, travails of elderly people etc. and each story leaves a haunting trail like the songs of Gulzaar. Some of the narratives are about simple events in the full life of mature and experienced men which are made extraordinary by the rendition of Gulzaar with intense prose and poetic perception. Gulzaar's interpretation of mundane life has the power to bring out the beauty out of seemingly inane things in life. In the short story *Ghugu*, *Ghugu*, a bird falls madly in love with a kite, Jamuni thinking it to be a bashful bird. With the same aplomb he narrates the happenings of the last day of a young girl who is a suicide bomber.

The story is a precise narration of the impassionate feelings of a young girl and her adherence to her role – a do-or-get-killed situation. Other stories like Batwara, Loc, Over, The Rams, The Stone Age and The Search are on the partition. The suffering and problems of the migrated people are clearly seen in his stories. As an Introduction to the partition stories, Gulzar pens these words, “Dreams need no borders, the eyes need no visas. With eyes shut I walk across the line in time. All the time...” In these above lines, Gulzar represents the intense grief of people on either side who have been affected by partition. Gulzar’s short stories cover a range of themes from personal friends to partition sufferings, from common man trials to tribulations of personified objects, from lost childhood to miseries of old age, from terrorist to common people affected by terrorism etc. His stories are also about people who refuse to give into rage and struggle to discover ways of living which could restore us to sanity and redeem us. The heart touching story LOC is on friendship. The story is set at the border of India and Pakistan. The problems at the border describes in this story. Because of such visit of politician open fire from both the sides. By 1965, life at the border had its own regime, developed its own rhythm. Political harangues, caustic diatribes and cross-border firing had become routine. At that time it was normal for soldiers to open fire across Line of Control whenever a minister was visiting a border outpost.

The story describes friendship between two friends Major Kulwant Singh, a major in Indian army and Mustaq, a major in Pakistan army. Once upon a time they had both studied together and both trained together at the Doone Military Academy. And then country partitioned and both were divided along with their families. The story prevails how the relationship between friends and families broken because of partition. Kulwant Singh and Mustaq generally talk with each other by wireless contact and when they talk their eyes were filled with tears remembering old days. Mustaq’s mother wants to come India to go at Ajmer Sharif so Kulwant arranges all things for her and finally everything is ready. Mustaq’s mother is going to come at Wagah border and that was the day the defence minister landed up at the outpost and guns began to sound on both sides of the border. Mustaq and Kulwant cannot contact over the wireless in this situation. After some days the news arrived that eleven Indian soldiers had attained martyrdom at the LoC amongst them was one Major Kulwant Singh. The story presents agony of friends and the cause of suffering is partition. The consequences of unwanted partition of the country left many people on both sides embittered and scarred for life.

In *Over*, the poet in Gulzar personifies the desert as well. He says, “When the desert begins to heat up it really seems as if it is getting angry at you . . . as if it is trying to say “why are you trying to step on my bed” . . . pick your feet up, go away” (*Half a Rupee*, 84). Gulzar’s long-lasting wishes can be seen in below lines, “About two furlongs from this outpost was a cement milestone. ‘Bharat’ was written on one side of the stone and ‘Pakistan’ on the other. Such milestones are hammered into the sandy earth along the border at an interval of two furlongs. Between the two milestones the land lies barren-just a patchy growth of puny scrub which sheep and camels keep scratching at. These animals roam about with full freedom on either side of the border, unburdened by religion, unfettered by boundaries of nation-states. You cannot make out the religion or the nationality of their owners either.” (*Over*, *Half a Rupee*, 81) In *The Rams*, Gulzar tells the readers how people get drunk by uttering or listening to the names of their native places to which they no longer have access due to the partition. Captain Shaheen finds a young boy in Suchitgarh and thinks that he has been inadvertently left by his people who might have migrated to this side of the border. So he asks an old Sikh on the other side of the border if he would take the little boy and hand him over to his people. The Sikh laughingly suggests to be exchanged with the little boy so that he can visit his village on their side, Chajra. The old Sikh laughed, “Let the boy off. Imprison me instead. Take me with you. My village is over on that side. A little further down from Sialkot. Chajra.” He sounded ecstatic – drunk just on the name of his village. (*The Rams*, *Half a Rupee*, \endash

The main themes in the anthology are the agony of separation from native land and known people, and the travails of a common man interspersed with remarkable anecdotes of Gulzar’s friends, the hassles of old age, the need for companionship at that age and some stories deal with feelings of people and also surprisingly a bird. Gulzar’s stories deal with loss - loss of land, loss of trust, loss of values, and lost individuals. The short stories represent many stages in a person’s life and many incidents that we can identify with so as to reflect a complete circle of situations men can experience in life. Gulzar belongs to that section of creative writers who revolt against traditional storytelling, who experiment with the themes of their stories and assert that the technique of narration is also as important as the theme of the story. Through his stories the readers can catch glimpses of the wider canvas of life and its implications. Sunjoy Shekhar has done a great job in translating and reaching out to readers who cannot read Urdu. The collection satiates the eager readers of Gulzar’s short stories and reiterates the poetic truth quoted by Hemingway in his *Old man and the Sea*, that “a man can be destroyed but not defeated.” The readers can identify with the issues discussed in the short stories and yet can experience a feeling that is akin to *The Global Journal of Literary Studies I Volume II, Issue II I* May 2016 ISSN : 2395 4817 faith in spite of the faith in spite of the struggle to live. Gulzar’s



narratives have the strength to build faith in humanity and steer towards developing a better world.

Gulzar, the well-known poet and lyricist, is also an excellent story teller. Those who have seen his movies like Ijaazat or the more recent Maachis would agree that he is a master at story telling. Raavi Paar is a collection of short stories that touch your soul like a breeze and leave an impression on your heart like footprints on sand. ‘Gulzar’ was the only reason I picked up this book.

Simple style and easy-to-comprehend language are the highlights of Gulzar’s stories. There is a strong local flavour in his writing and the themes are strongly rooted in Indian culture and history. However,

the spirit and emotions that are conveyed are universal. Fear, love, friendship, loneliness etc that are inseparable parts of human consciousness are portrayed through his characters. The characters are easily identifiable and real. There is no sense of the fantastic or un-real but the situations are so life-like and the human reactions so humane that the un-real element creeps in uninhibitedly.

Gulzar, the poet, makes his presence felt all the time. There is an easy flow and rhythm to the stories and they are inter-linked not by a character or theme but with the very fact that the crux of all the stories is the human mind. Instead of directly unveiling the political or social truths behind the dramas of life, Gulzar takes the readers en route human sub-conscious mind and the truth then revealed is not limited to one single person. It becomes universal and all encompassing.

For those who enjoy the earthy touch, the lyrical mysticism and the elusive surreal element of Gulzar movies will definitely like the short stories in *Raavi Paar*, especially the title story, which narrates an interesting episode of the author's life. Except for this story none of the others are autobiographical. Enriching and enticing, this book would make good two hour reading.

*Raavi Paar* is a collection of short stories by Gulzar that do not adhere to a particular theme but address different human emotions. The first story of the book, which is also its title, is a narration from the author's own life, against the backdrop of Indian Partition. *Raavi Paar* is a poignant, telling story of a couple who's on their way to India on a train that is brimming with people. The couple also has two little baby boys and loses them both due to chaos and confusion in the train. This is an account just one family during partition while so many others shared the same fate.

#### REFERENCE :

4. Newmark, Peter, *A textbook of Translation* London New York Prenticehall 1988.
5. K.R.S. Iyengar, *Indian Writing in English*, Bombay, 1962
6. A.P. Pandey, *Flames and Fire In Kabir's Poetry*, Bhasker Publishers, Kanpur, 20



































